CONTENTS

Preface Mark WILLIAMS .................................................. vi

List of Contributors .................................................... viii

Submission of Manuscripts ......................................... xi

Papers:

The Politics of Health in the Films of Apichatpong
Weerasethakul
Noah VIERNES .......................................................... 1

Haiku as a Tool of Japanese Language Education:
Practical Examples and Further Possibilities
AIBA Ibuki ................................................................. 29

Teaching to the Fourth Wall: Pedagogical Practices
for the Digital Age
Patrick DOUGHERTY and Josephine BUTLER .......... 46

Societal Differentiation Theory from a
Phenomenological Point of View: Value Dilemmas as
Core Characteristic of Modern Societies
Christian ETZRODT .................................................... 74

Opportunity to Learn in Latin America:
A Focus on Indigenous Linguistic Populations
Paul Chamness MILLER, ENDO Hidehiro and
Erin MIKULEC .......................................................... 93

Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools:
A case study from Niger
TERANO Mayumi ..................................................... 117
PREFACE

I am delighted to present the latest edition of Global Review, a peer-reviewed journal published by Akita International University (AIU). Readers of the journal will be aware that the majority of articles published represent the research findings of current AIU faculty. But, as will be evident from the ‘Table of Contents’ of this latest edition, there is certainly no ‘closed shop’ mentality at work here – and we welcome manuscript proposals from all who share the overall vision of this University to nurture creative individuals capable of making a positive contribution on the global stage.

Aficionados of the journal will also hopefully note the expanded size of this latest edition. Over the past year, considerable effort has been expended, by our editorial team, Tetsuya Toyoda, Clay Williams and Takeshi Akiba, to boost both the quality and quantity of articles submitted. Such regeneration obviously starts with individual contributors, but this also reflects the increased emphasis that has been placed on the peer review process. Every article received for consideration has been sent out to at least two independent and anonymous reviewers; thereafter, on receipt of readers’ reports, the editorial team has worked assiduously with individual authors to ensure that due consideration is made of comments received – and, in some cases where those were ultimately not followed, footnotes have been added to explain the rationale behind such decisions.

It is my hope and belief that the changes to the journal reflect a change in the research culture here at AIU. Established only ten years ago very much as a ‘teaching university’, AIU has now reached a crucial point in its evolution. With the arrival of President Norihiko Suzuki following the untimely demise of its first President, Dr. Mineo Nakajima, the University is determined to build on its burgeoning reputation as a beacon of global education in Japan – and realizes that this depends, in part at least, on its ability to attract scholars at the cutting edge of their disciplines to join our faculty. Needless to say, a crucial part of this process is to convince potential faculty members that they will receive the encouragement and support they need to pursue their research and scholarly interests. And this goes far beyond ensuring adequate research funds for individual faculty members, important though this may be. What is required is a ‘research culture’, one whereby all faculty are encouraged to explore new ideas – and a
concerted effort to ensure that, rather than dividing their weeks into ‘teaching’ and ‘research’ time (not to mention that great albatross, ‘time for academic management’!), faculty are encouraged to view the two as indivisible and to explore the potential for genuine research-led teaching.

In an attempt to secure faculty who buy into this ethos, all new faculty positions are advertised worldwide – and we are proud of the new faculty members we have persuaded to join our small but ambitious team in recent years. Indeed, some of their work is contained within this volume. We hope very much that all our readers will find something of interest in this multidisciplinary journal – and would appreciate any comments as to further potential improvements.

Mark Williams
Editor-in-Chief
List of Contributors
(Alphabetical Order by Surname)

AIBA Ibuki
Ibuki Aiba is an adjunct lecturer of Japanese Language Program at Akita International University. After 12 years teaching English at high schools in Akita, she converted to the field of Japanese language education, and earned a master’s degree in Japanese language teaching from AIU. She is currently interested in course design for Japanese language learners, teaching Japanese pragmatics using audiovisual materials, and articulation between Japanese language education and Japan studies. Her motto is “teaching is learning.”

Josephine BUTLER
Josephine Butler is a faculty member of Liberal Studies at Abu Dhabi Women’s College in the United Arab Emirates where she delivers Research Methodology courses to undergraduate female students. She also tutors postgraduate students taking their Masters in Education. Josephine is originally from County Cork in Ireland. She has been living and working in the Middle East for almost two decades. She is currently pursuing her doctorate in Education from Deakin University, Australia. Her interest is in using technology to provide innovative solutions for program delivery.

Patrick DOUGHERTY
Dr. Patrick Dougherty is a professor of International Liberal Arts and Director of the English for Academic Purpose program at Akita International University in Japan. Prior to this he was Chair of Graduate Programs in Education for the Higher Colleges of Technology in the United Arab Emirates. His research interests are in teacher development, the use of creative writing and student heritage in the EFL/ESL classroom, and the impact of distance learning methodologies on pedagogy.
ENDO Hidehiro

Hidehiro Endo, Ph.D., is an assistant professor in the Teacher’s License Program at Akita International University. Dr. Endo completed his doctorate in 2011 from Purdue University in Curriculum & Instruction with an emphasis on Curriculum Studies. His research interests primarily focus on issues of diversity, social justice and multicultural education pertaining to immigrants, the LGBT population, and English language learners.

Christian ETZRODT

Dr. Christian Etzrodt (Ph.D. in economics, University of Cologne, 2000; Ph.D. in sociology, Ritsumeikan University, 2006) is an associate professor of sociology and economics at Akita International University, Japan. He has published two books and eighteen articles and book chapters. His books are: Menschliches Verhalten: Eine Synthese aus mikroökonomischen und mikrosoziologischen Theorien (Human Behaviour: A Synthesis of Microeconomic and Microsociological Theories, University Press Konstanz, 2001) and Sozialwissenschaftliche Handlungstheorien: Eine Einführung (Action Theories in the Social Sciences: An Introduction, UTB, 2003). His published articles have been on sociological theory, methodology, sociology of religion, and sociology of globalization, and he has published in prestigious journals which are listed in the Social Science Citation Index including: Kölner Zeitschrift für Soziologie und Sozialpsychologie, Zeitschrift für Soziologie, and Human Studies.

Erin MIKULEC

Erin Mikulec, Ph.D. is an assistant professor in the School of Teaching and Learning at Illinois State University. Dr. Mikulec received her doctorate from Purdue University in Curriculum & Instruction. Her research interests include pre-service teacher education, clinical field experiences in secondary education, and teaching for global engagement. Dr. Mikulec will spend a semester at the University of Helsinki on a Fulbright Scholarship studying secondary teacher education in Finland.
Paul Chamness MILLER

Paul Chamness Miller, Ph.D., is an associate professor in the English for Academic Purposes Program at Akita International University. Dr. Miller received his doctorate from Purdue University in Curriculum & Instruction with an emphasis on Foreign Language Education. His research interests primarily focus on issues of diversity, social justice and multicultural education pertaining to English language learners and LGBT teachers and youth, as well as in instructed second language acquisition.

TERANO Mayumi

Dr. Mayumi Terano is an assistant professor on the Global Studies Program, Akita International University. She holds a Ph.D. in comparative and international development studies in education from the University of Pittsburgh, USA. She previously worked for the Institute of Education, University of London, and has been involved in a number of consultancies with national and international agencies, dealing with policy development from basic to higher education.

Noah VIERNES

Noah Viernes is an assistant professor in the Global Studies Program at Akita International University and holds a Ph.D. in Political Science from the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa. Through his work in visual culture and street politics he is actively involved with scholarship in political theory, global politics, and cultural studies. He has published with *South East Asia Research* (21(2): 237-255, 2013), the *International Journal for the Semiotics of the Law* (April 2013), *NIDA Journal of Language and Communication* (14(15): 73-83, 2009), and *Manusya* (15: 13-31, 2008). He regularly participates in the annual conference of the International Studies Association, various Asian studies-related conferences, and is a member of the Thai Translators Network. This article is part of a larger book project that uses the films of Apichatpong Weerasethakul to chart new directions in political theory.
Submission of Manuscripts

Manuscripts for Volume 6 (2014) of the AIU Global Review must be sent to AIU Press (aiupress@aiu.ac.jp) as an attachment to an email by September 10, 2014. Manuscripts undergo blind peer review by at least two qualified scholars.

Manuscripts MUST conform to the following guidelines:

1. All articles must be the result of original academic research bringing new elements to scholarship and of up to 10,000 words (or up to 1,000 words for a book review), including footnotes and bibliography. Please note that the journal also welcomes articles on pedagogy, empirical or theoretical in nature, with a clear potential for contributing to the relevant academic field either by their innovative approaches or by their theoretical elaboration going beyond a narration of personal experiences.

2. Manuscripts are to be submitted in Microsoft Word format, single spaced, Times New Roman font, size 11 for texts and size 10 for footnotes. Margins 25.4 mm from each of four sides, with custom page size 159.8 mm wide and 236 mm high.

3. Include a concise abstract at the beginning of the manuscript, with three to five key words.

4. Capitalize each major word in the manuscript’s title, section heading and illustration titles.

5. Embolden section headings.

6. *Italicize* all foreign words (including Japanese words) and titles of books.

7. No paragraph indentation but a single space between paragraphs. No automatic spacing before and after paragraphs.
8. Sources must be cited following the Chicago Manual of Style (http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org), either in the notes and bibliography system and/or the author-date system, or one of other internationally approved formats.

9. All charts, maps or other illustrations must be provided in black and white.

10. Send us a one-paragraph biography, with your manuscript.

11. Before submitting your manuscript by September 10, send us a notice by August 10, with its title and brief description.

12. Questions should be sent to aiupress@aiu.ac.jp.
The Politics of Health in the Films of Apichatpong Weerasethakul

Noah VIERNES

Abstract

In the work of Thai film director Apichatpong Weerasethakul, the problematic nature of contemporary citizenship is anchored in images of health and political authority. His first feature-length film, *Mysterious Object at Noon* (2000), frames culture and political community around a doctor’s prescription of a hearing aid. This same physician and doctor’s office provides the backdrop for a transnational migrant seeking a work permit in the director’s second film, *Blissfully Yours* (2002). In the controversial *Syndromes And A Century* (2007), initially banned in Thailand, these provincial scenes give way to hierarchical images of control in a Bangkok hospital where its residents are rigidly organized amid symbols of national authority. The director’s most recent film, *Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives* (2010), moves from the hospital of previous films to hospitality by positioning a Laotian migrant worker as primary caretaker of the film’s lead character, a former soldier. From these examples, political theory is better positioned to connect health with an enlarged concept of “care” for the Other, precisely because their medical settings reimagine the assemblage of guests, strangers and hosts as an encounter between doctors and patients. These images place the viewer into an ethical engagement with caregiving and caretaking in the Thai political present, a tenuous moral regime of well-being where an unsettled nation-state struggles to retain its oversight.

---

I owe an unredeemable debt to Kissada Kam Yong and Sompot Chidgasornpongse for great conversations on the films discussed here. The research for this article was partially funded by the Empowering Network for International Thai Studies (ENITS), Institute of Thai Studies, Chulalongkorn University, with support from the Thailand Research Fund (TRF).
Introduction

Global cinema is quickly emerging as a transdisciplinary means to connect the social sciences with the humanities, especially as it challenges visual culture to explore the political in everyday stories. In the ubiquitous language of contemporary media images, film expands the geographic range of political experience and promotes a response. Under these conditions, Apichatpong Weerasethakul, Thailand’s most globally-renown filmmaker, has crafted the fault lines of the nation’s unsettled political present in the language of everyday images. From the opening scenes of *Mysterious Object at Noon* (2000) to the climactic scenes of *Mekong Hotel* (2012), the viewer is forced to interrogate their own expectations about how a story should be told. His unconventional approach to filmmaking connects the aesthetics of the image to the extraordinary elements of everyday power in Thailand. This article focuses on the two films *Syndromes and a Century* (2007) and *Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives* (2009) to show how the cinematic tropes of care, i.e., character actions connecting hospitals with hospitality, project micropolitical episodes of life in Thailand. These films leave us better equipped to rethink the politics of health as a critical space, a space where the encounter between citizens, immigrants, doctors, and patients are designed as a scenario about how people relate. These films thus link citizenship in Thailand to a moral discourse of well-being where the everyday constructs of “care” materialize.

To be able to tell a story is to be empowered to speak. Zoomed out to the macro levels of academia, we often find ourselves telling different kinds of stories about the places we study. Protagonists are identified as political actors, narrative settings are understood as countries to be compared on the world stage, and nation-states operate as a sequence of scenes, or political events which resolve disagreements by settling the larger narrative of citizenship. The beginnings and ends of politics, in this way, become enclosed plots which perpetuate one or another unifying theory. Most famously, Francis Fukuyama stated that

---

“Beethoven piped into Japanese department stores…rock music enjoyed alike in Prague, Rangoon, and Tehran,” to signal an end to all alternatives to Western liberalism. Democracy meant the ability to choose and consume, but the model relied on a network of benefits rooted in Western culture. Meanwhile, he said nothing about stories from these countries, the exiles, the imprisoned writers, the censored musicians, i.e., the lived politics of democracy. Fukuyama’s story is, fortunately, now lost in what Manuel Castells has called the “the space of flows” of media technology, a space leading not only to the consumption of Western products but to the possibility of new information from distant places. Zoomed in, films demonstrate the ways everyday life “constitute” the flows and rhythms of political change at a visceral level, in a sense bringing the extraordinary into a material engagement with the felt. Zoomed out, these stories are suggestive of the procedures we use to judge, criticize, deliberate, reflect, and act upon political viewpoints. Apichatpong’s films connect the extraordinary with the ordinary as a “relational” process, highlighting the procedures of speaking and listening, reflecting and deliberating, to politicize the everyday affairs of the nation-state and the ways it is imagined. His motivation: “Film is an excuse, or a medium that lets people communicate with the outside (people and places).”

From a conceptual perspective, Apichatpong’s films open a sphere that the French philosopher Gilles Deleuze calls *micropolitics*. For Deleuze, the cinema should not be considered distinct from political theory, or the social sciences broadly construed, but aimed to show that “everything is immediately and necessarily contiguous with

---

3 Francis Fukuyama, "The End of History?,” *The National Interest* 16 (Summer 1989), 3.
4 “This is the space of flows: not just the electronic/telecommunications circuits, but the network of places that are connected around one common, simultaneous social practice via these electronic circuits and their ancillary systems.” See Manuel Castells & Martin Ince, Conversations with Manuel Castells. (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2003), 56.
everything else”. This transdisciplinary avenue into how power works is complemented in Michael J. Shapiro’s observation of the strange ways cinema perpetually reconstructs time and space, especially with regard to geopolitical enmities (No Man’s Land, Danis Tanović 2001), global cities (Eye in the Sky, Yau Nai-Hoi 2007), or racial temporalities (Hoop Dreams, Steve James 1994). Shapiro writes that micropolitics is not so much a theory as it is an approach to “generate ways to think the political”. In Thailand, the relationship between cinema and politics is historically informed by the political scenarios that individual films restage. Articulating one discourse of modernization, for example, Benedict Anderson analyzed Chatrichalerm Yukol’s The Gunman (1983) to illustrate that political murder is directly related to the rising “market value” of provincial parliamentary seats during Thailand’s bubble period of the 1980s. In fact, Apichatpong’s early reveries on Thai cinema recall these controversial assassin films, such as Khun Toranong Srichua’s Bangkok Emergency (1988), to highlight their fearless critique of Thai modernity as “a slap in the face of progress” (111). Even in a far different political context, Apichatpong’s films are likewise defiant and adversarial to the national norm. But through his micropolitical lens, the defiant yet ordinary conversations of everyday life seem real enough to frighten the watchful eye of national censors. In a dentist office, a monk expresses his wish to be a radio DJ. In one censored scene staged in a hospital basement, doctors—symbols of national authority—share a bottle of whiskey.

---

6 In other words, a micropolitics considers filmmaking as a form of enunciation, a way of articulating a collective category of subjects lacking in the existing milieu of nation-states, where “everything is political” and thus “questions all situations” (42). Gilles Deleuze, Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 0000), xxiv.


8 Here is the relevant thesis: “What all these killings suggest is that in the 1980s the institution of MP has achieved solid market value. In other words, not only does being an MP offer substantial opportunities for gaining wealth and power, but it promises comfortably to do so for the duration. It may thus be worth one’s while to murder one’s parliamentary competition—something inconceivable in the 1950s and 1960s, when parliament’s power and longevity were very cheaply regarded.” See, Benedict Anderson, "Murder and Progress in Modern Siam," New Left Review 181 (May-June 1990), 46.
With the Thai nation-state undergoing sporadic protests and a groundswell of institutional transition since the military coup d’état of 2006, these images of everyday life in Thailand become especially political. Following a long tradition of political theory that runs from Plato, Al-Farabi and Thomas Hobbes, to Immanuel Kant and Michel Foucault, Apichatpong’s films are deeply imbued with a medical approach to space that follows political philosophy’s preoccupation with health and well-being. Those tropes usually include the virtuous physician, the harmonious body, cosmopolitan hospitality, and medical surveillance, among others. In Apichatpong’s cinematic oeuvre, the political dimensions of hospitality and well-being are structured according to the diagnosis of illness and the art of healing whereby medical treatment reflects a critical national allegory: i.e., the supervision of patients provides the conditions of possibility for the production of knowledge. On one hand, this hierarchy of power alludes to the surveillance of well-being in the Thai nation-state. On the other hand, these films show characters who exist beyond supervision, where resistance to authority is visualized as everyday forms of ethical connection, i.e., hospitality. Between hospitalization and hospitality, the projection of care not only broadens the understanding of how power in Thailand is structured, but wages a critique of the top-down relationship between well-being and political community.

**Apichatpong’s Politics**

Apichatpong’s films surfaced in the global cinema community in several definitive moments of intensity. In 2002 he won the *Un Certain Regard* prize at the Cannes Film Festival for the migrant-themed *Blissfully Yours* (2002), the *Jury* prize for the metaphysical soul searching *Tropical Malady* (2004), challenged national censorship conventions with *Syndromes and A Censorship* (2007), and gained the pinnacle of acclaim by capturing the Palm d’Or at the Cannes Film Festival for the film *Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives* (2009). As early as 2003, his work could be purchased through a variety of global distributors. However, his appeal to a generation of new cinema aficionados in Thailand can be traced back to a review of his early feature length documentary, *Mysterious Object at Noon* (2000). After the contemporary Thai fiction writer Uthis Hemamool viewed its early screening in Bangkok, he reviewed the
film as a new landmark for the nation. He wrote that *Mysterious Object* was not Thailand “ready-made,” by which he meant there is no single representation of one nation called ‘Thailand’. Instead, the lens of Apichatpong’s camera organized ‘Thailand’ as a project, a mobile series of aesthetic manifestations as they were recorded in regions of the nation. The film pulled away from any preconception of a homogenous entity by asking people to create new stories. Uthid’s observation underscores the new ways in which Thailand was, at the turn of the millennium, being rearticulated in an age of global uncertainty after the Asian financial crisis. As a global economic event pulled the nation apart from the top-down, this film weaved it back together from the bottom-up.

In the late 1990s, future Prime Minister Thaksin Shinawatra and the emerging Thai Rak Thai party were redefining Thailand from above by assembling new national management to cure the ‘contagion’ of the Asian Financial Crisis. Working with the voices from below, *Mysterious Object at Noon* begins at street-level where images of political candidates line the streets amid conversations of bodies sold to pay off debt. When the story is revealed to be that of a common fruit vendor, an “off-screen” interviewer asks, “Do you have any other stories to tell us? It can be real or fiction. From a book or something.” The movie is about her continuing the story as an episode of fiction, which is then told through the eyes of different characters in different regions of the country who hear the original story played back by Apichatpong’s travelling film crew. In a key episode of the story, the protagonist is a young woman escorting her elderly father to a provincial doctor’s office. The doctor is asked to diagnose the old man’s ability to hear. But in the doctor’s office, the diagnosis is overshadowed by a series of generational disagreements between the

---


10 The financial crisis, which sent the miracle economies of East and Southeast Asia into turmoil, was perceived in the medical idiom of sickness accompanied by terms like “Asian flu,” “Tom Yum Gung disease,” and “sick Asian economies.” David A. Smith (2005) observes that the Western institutions, such as the International Monetary Fund, assumed a diagnostic role in the attempt to “urge countries to get healthy” (294). See Richard P. Appelbaum and William I. Robinson (eds.), *Critical Globalization Studies* (New York: Routledge, 2005), 293-301.
father and the daughter, arguments which reflect the global landscape of rapid change in Thailand. If democratic processes are about agreement and consensus, the film seems to ask, why is so much of intimate life weaved together in everyday forms of disagreement?

Arjun Appadurai coined the concept *ideoscape* to illustrate how political ideas circulate within the visual imagination of globalization. Ideoscapes exist as “concatenations of images...a loosely structured synopticon of politics, in which different nation-states, as part of their evolution, have organized their political cultures around different keywords.”  

If medical institutions transmit nation-state ideology, then ‘health’ is one possible ideoscapes of Thailand’s national image. In the opening scene of Apichatpong’s second film *Blissfully Yours*, the doctor’s office from *Mysterious Object*, reappears with the same father-daughter duo. In the film, the doctor occupies a position of power over the national regulation of borders, which is now the doctor’s office *(Figure 1).*

**Figure 1: Min is mute:** Unable to speak proper Thai, the Karen immigrant Min acts mute and has his Thai caretakers, Roong and Orn, speak on his behalf in the doctor’s office. Immigrant work permits require the doctor’s certification of good health. (Used with Permission from Apichatpong Weerasethakul)

---

The protagonist Min, an immigrant from Burma, is broadly based on two Burmese women the director witnessed being arrested at a Bangkok zoo. Like the real life economic and political exiles who flow across the Burma-Thai border, Min’s limitations in the story derive from his lack of citizenship. As an non-naturalized subject, he looks to his Thai girlfriend Roong and their mutual friend Orn to provide support as he struggles to find work in the border town. The opening scene of Blissfully Yours situates Min in a medical clinic where he undergoes a routine check-up required for a work permit in Thailand. The doctor checks his heartbeat, examines an unexplained skin disease, and extracts blood, while Roong and Orn take turns speaking for the silent immigrant because, they tell the doctor, he is mute. By remaining silent, Min conceals his foreign identity. But the act also reveals the ways in which the relationship between host and guest, i.e., citizen and Other, engage hospitality within medical practice. Min is a stranger in a strange land, a displaced subject who can only be heard through the voice of care. At the end of the crucial scene, we learn that he will not obtain the work permit because he cannot produce a National ID card.

Apichatpong’s third feature-length film, Tropical Malady, unfolds as a melodic ballad of existential angst where a playful intimacy between two Thai men abruptly blends into a soldier’s attempt to track down a mysterious beast that haunts local villagers. The mysterious beast is, in fact, the soldier’s lost love. Tragic and emblematic of the distance that separates those who abruptly part ways, the film beckons the embodied viewer to take notice and appreciate each of their transcendent and living surroundings. In one of the scenes, Keng and Tong, the two gay male protagonists, find the family dog lying docile in the middle of a nearby country road. In this fictional film world, the dog is taken to a hospital that nurses the dog back to normality with all the care of a priority patient. To emphasize a heightened demonstration of care, a team of doctors explain the dog’s x-rays while Keng and Tong listen intently to the visual diagnosis. As in previous films, doctors play a key role in speaking, but also in performing the formal procedures of care.

Apichatpong’s next feature-length film, Syndromes And A Century (2007), is a highly anticipated follow-up to Tropical Malady, submitted for domestic release 7 months after Thai military coup
d’état of September 19th 2006. Reflecting the nationalist tide of the coup, the Thai Censorship Board, comprised of military, police, religious, and medical officials, deemed the film improper for domestic audiences. The Board slated several scenes for removal, most of which unfold in a hospital. The second half of the movie is set in a Bangkok-based army hospital, because the national situation can only be properly represented in the militarization of everyday life. One doctor’s anxiety, crystallized in her on-the-job drinking habit, is associated partly with the stress of her off-the-job task of generating moral publicity for the hospital (on “public television”), but also with the subterranean anxieties that cannot be expressed in public view. The film ban on Syndromes provided led to an anti-censorship movement called “Free Thai Film.” But the hospital setting itself seemed to contest the militarization of Thai politics in post-Coup institutions, a “caretaker” regime that included the military-appointed National Legislative Assembly, the writing of the new constitution, the enhanced Ministry of Culture and its morally-coded “Film Act,” and an empowered Bangkok middle class that broadly supported these changes. Apichatpong thus remarked: “Instead of questioning the authority and the people who use it, instead of promoting constructive debate for the sake of development, we are so ready to let the state silence us”.12

As street protests surged across Bangkok between 2006 and 2010, Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives (2010), Apichatpong’s most recent feature-length film, delineated the fault lines of national politics underlying the production of all stories during this abrasive period. Derived from the multi-platform project Primitives, the film explores the Communist past that today haunts the northeastern town of Nabua, which the Thai military occupied between the 1960s and the 1980s. Its lead character, Boonmee, periodically reflects on the link between his own role in the murder of Communist conspirators and its effect on karma as he slowly slips toward death. The film is about Boonmee’s caretakers, including immediate relatives and a Laotian migrant laborer, and the interplay between confessions of the past and prophecies of the future. Boonmee’s life is preoccupied with time and death, but also the cycles

of Thailand’s contentious political memory. The film won the Palm D’Or at Cannes in May 2010, two days after the Thai military fired upon protestors, medics, and journalists leaving over 90 dead in Bangkok. At the Cannes awards ceremony, Apichatpong remarked, "Thailand is a violent country. It is controlled by a group of mafia. Our governments, present and past, have been such a mess."

Apichatpong’s Cannes declaration reveals the presence of the political and demonstrates the propensity for linking fictional film worlds with the public exhibitions of violence that give rise to these stories. His films engage the political in the sense outlined by Jacques Rancière: i.e., as the imposition of disagreement that challenges the “distribution of space and time, of the visible and the invisible, that create specific forms of ‘common sense’.” 13 Apichatpong’s films challenge the ‘common sense’ of Thailand as a democratic space by equating medical and military authority as a regulatory oversight that dominates the field of what can be thought, said, heard, and expressed in any key sequence. At the same time, the emphasis on everyday practices of care and connection provide a bottom-up means of redressing the nation’s contemporary organization. This disagreement is key to understanding the types of authority in Apichatpong’s films as it shifts between caretakers, doctors, military personnel, monastic officials, factory bosses, low-angled shots of statues amid the urban landscape, and the people who personalize the political.

Of Hospitals and Hospitality

When asked to explain the “motif of illness” that circulates throughout his films, Apichatpong aptly replied:

I am also very interested in hospitals—Thai hospitals—and how class and power are reflected in them, the authority of the doctors and submissiveness of the patients. I am very concerned about class, codes we often don’t recognize: doctors and patients, maids and masters.14

The hospital is not simply an institution of medical authority, but one with diagnostic weight in the social engineering of the nation-state. These social dimensions are foregrounded in the opening scene of *Syndromes and a Century* when a doctor closes her interview with a new inductee by asking, “What does DDT stand for?” His response, “Destroy dirty things,” identifies the episodic replacement of the scientific by the moral mission to eradicate the unclean within the sterile environment of the hospital. Apichatpong’s work struggles to project the fragments, maladies and bipolar currents of a strange world where chaotic jungles of uncertainty clash with the hierarchies of “hospital and consulting-room scenes”. The state’s banning of *Syndromes* referred to earlier was, Benedict Anderson so notes, the attempt to “sustain the prestige of Thai hospitals and the public’s trust in Thai doctors by cultivating a public image of authority, austerity, wisdom and seriousness”.

The medical tropes in these films easily recall Michel Foucault’s work on the relationship between national modernity and the production of knowledge about the body. In *The Birth of the Clinic*, Foucault observes the shift from brute power to ‘enlightened’ discipline, i.e., from direct coercion to an indirect care of the self. The medical practitioner internalizes state discourse through their prognosis of the individual body. Because the doctor can read what is not visible (i.e., symptoms contained within the physical body of the subject), their authority equates with superior power in the hierarchy of privileged knowledge. Historically, it was in the immediate aftermath of the French Revolution and the birth of a new political order that this kind of medical knowledge validated the enlightened power of the state. For Foucault, the ‘disappearance of the sick man’ operated as a discourse designed to produce a normalized and sanitized modern citizen-subject. Linking this development of citizenship with modern social institutions, David Armstrong so notes “this production of bodies was common to a range of techniques deployed through

---


schools, prisons, workshops, barracks and hospitals. Hospitals and associations of doctors became preeminent institutions of the new order, not only extending the political into cultural spaces of well-being, but functioning as an instrument of the modern state.

The medical analogue of health in political theory has a long history. In *The Republic*, Plato employs medical tropes in his justification of political authority. His primary character, Socrates, remarks that just as not everyone is qualified to be a doctor, so too must political authority be limited to the few. The good of the whole relies on the rule of these few Philosopher-Kings, who rule over the political body. Plato’s style of writing, the dialogue, matches his political ideal in that the goal of each conversation is agreement. So too must the parts of the body be in agreement in order to be considered in good health. Plato considers this health, which is a depiction of parts choreographed to function harmoniously, as an ideal justice. In other words, the doctor’s moral obligation to heal is “just” in the same way a “just” leader must ensure harmony. In *The Republic*, the political body is comprised of parts in need of harmonization and “united action,” such as a city, an army, or family. These corporal elements provide the essence of the political in the assertion, “the body of inhabitants is termed a State.”

At the symbolic level, Plato’s classical model can be likened to the modern body of the Thai state in the sense that its well-being depends on the tripartite harmony of nation, state, and monarchy. Films follow a modern history of visual mediums that, as Thongchai Winichakul has noted in *Siam Mapped*, underlie a collective “We-self”: i.e., the collective discharge of “certain viewpoints, sentiments, and values as well as constraints, taboos, alibis, and plausibility.” In the national context framed here, this discharge must accord with a coherent body of what is often called Thai-ness. In Thai-ness, religion and monarchy

---

19 Ibid., 53.
diagnose nationality. Susan Darlington, for example, shows how religion has played a key role in placing environmental concerns on the State agenda by framing the protection of life as fundamental to national moral obligations. Arguing that one of Buddhism’s key tenets is the elimination of suffering, Darlington explores how religion connects the life of the individual to the life of the nation, for example interpreting words like “Chaat.” “Chaat can mean life, birth (as in rebirth), or nation.” To protect life is thus to protect the nation.

The most significant level of national oversight in Thailand exists within its revered royal institution. As a body comprised of separate parts, this “network monarchy,” as Duncan McCargo aptly describes the institution, is comprised of different spheres of influence which include King Bhumibol and various members of the royal family, but also the Privy council and a nexus of competing bureaucratic interests. David Streckfuss notes that the Thai monarchy has successfully built up its connection to the people within a discursive sovereign field that resembles a modern day leviathan. Images of the monarchy abound in key intersections, businesses, schools, and households. Streckfuss concludes, however, that the head of the leviathan is slowly weakening giving rise to discord in the body, e.g., in the “red shirt” protests of 2009 and 2010. Streckfuss states, “There is no doubt that the King personally is enormously popular. But his personal popularity does not necessarily translate into legitimacy conferred to the institution.” The fundamental difference between the preeminent institutions of religion and monarchy, and the

---

23 Organized to counter the conservative forces behind the 2006 coup, the “red shirt” United Front for Democracy Against Dictatorship (UDD) gathered en masse in Bangkok during the spring of 2009 and 2010. Thailand’s has to recover from, or fully investigate, the brutal military crackdowns of this period that left over 90 dead.
modernized legislative body of the nation, is that the former are unelected and convey that power comes from above.

The tripartite regime of nation, religion and monarchy drive the organization of all bodies into a calculated sovereign equilibrium. The moral imperatives of this equilibrium hint toward the conception of ‘the good’ in classical political theory, and ensure that sovereignty quickly becomes diagnostic as a confluence of medical and political allegory. 25 One can interpret the presupposed equilibrium of a political community as the fulfillment of an predesigned distribution of roles, where citizens participate in the health of the community to the extent that they cohere with the sovereign guardianship of their rulers who have, by design, no other intention but the harmonious health of the body. The argument was refurbished by Thomas Hobbes in the 17th century in order to reaffirm the necessity of sovereign kings against the rising tide of modern liberalism.

Apichatpong’s films move beyond the mere projection of a relationship between hierarchical political authority in the hospital and the everyday national discourse of well-being. They highlight how everyday measures of caregiving, or hospitality, coexist with the top-down hierarchy of hospitalization. The concept of hospitality can be traced as far as Aristotle’s discussion of whether to incorporate foreign “strangers” into a political community in *The Politics*, and more recently with Immanuel Kant’s *Perpetual Peace*, which articulates hospitality as the “Third Definitive Article of Perpetual Peace.”26 Kant’s approach to hospitality is, at best, the assertion of

25 For example, the 10th century Islamic scholar Al Farabi refurbished this relationship in his own Plato-derived excursus on the political body: “Just as the health of the body is an equilibrium of its temperament and its sickness is a deviation from equilibrium, so, too, are the health of the city and its uprightness an equilibrium of the moral habits of its inhabitants and its sickness a disparity found in their moral habits. When the body deviates from equilibrium in its temperament, the one who brings it back to equilibrium and preserves it there is the physician.” Al Farabi (Translated by Charles E. Butterworth), *The Political Writings: Selected Aphorisms and Other Texts* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell UP, 2001), 12.

26 The first two sections relate, respectively, to “preliminary” and “definitive” relations between state actors. See Immanuel Kant, *Toward Perpetual Peace* and Other Writings on Politics, Peace, and History. Edited by Pauline Kleingeld (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 82
cosmopolitan rights for non-citizens in a foreign land. We are all cosmopolitans by virtue of our common co-habitation of the world, which extends a neighborly welcome “as long as the stranger behaves peacefully.” At worst, the approach was penned during a time when Kant’s observation that “the right of hospitality” is “the right of foreign arrivals,” spoke to the “terrifying proportions” of colonization in the new world. Realizing this contradiction, Kant emphasizes an emerging community that, in the interest of perpetual peace, must privilege neither host nor guest but “public human right” as the “unwritten” basis of the contemporary global encounter. Citizenship is always global to the extent that its uniformity relies on the elimination of foreign elements. Furthermore, Thailand’s anti-Communist Thai past, organized around the militarization of North and Northeastern border towns between the 1960s and 1980s, shows that even citizens can easily be interpolated as strangers. Hospitality, as such, accommodates the foreign as an ethical act.

The *ideosescaposes* of hospitality revolve around the discourse of the stranger, the dangling outlier of a community that is never completely defined except by the existence of an alienated life. In Feminist thought, Simone de Beauvoir notes that sovereign life has always been constituted by the fact that “all persons not belonging to the village are ‘strangers’ and suspect” (255). She continues that the stranger is always foreign, different, lower class, or even mysteriously native, especially from the perspective of those who are in control—which range from suspicious colonizers to more contemporary forms of domination. While de Beauvoir articulates the discourse of the stranger in order to dispute the terms of modern male sovereignty, we can extend this analogy to a link between hospitality and territory. The nation, village, hospital, government, and citizen all become brokers of territory, an interchangeable sovereignty reinforced by the perpetual existence of guests. To lack the formal conventions of citizenship is to be estranged from national visibility. This power inequality continues because the state derives its authority from the continual need to dominate Others. The doctor, or any privileged

---

27 Ibid.
28 Ibid, 85.
29 Quoting Homer to caution against the extension of hospitality to non-citizens, Aristotle (1996) thus observed, “like some dishonoured stranger, he who is excluded from the honours of the state is no better than an alien.”
and trusted caretaker within the nation-state, can tip the balance between hospitalized authority and ethical hospitality.

Apichatpong’s staging of doctor-patient encounters in hospitals helps to treat the continuing relevance of well-being to the existence of the modern state. On one hand, the inspiration for importing medical themes into these films may indeed derive from his own memories, or due to a personal interest in the medical field. For example, both of his parents were doctors and much of his formative life was therefore spent in these places of employment. And perhaps it is the exclusion from a heteronormative society that informs the filmmaker’s concentrated reflection on care. But it is the coincidence of these images with the political subtext of these stories that critique top-down authority in the modern nation-state while raising questions about the moralistic reductions of conventional political theory.

The Hospital in *Syndromes and a Century* (2007)

*Syndromes And A Century*, set in a provincial clinic and a Bangkok hospital, is the first feature film to challenge the all-pervasive cultural discharge of the September 19, 2006 military coup in Thailand. In the wake of the censorship debate that followed its delayed domestic release, Benedict Anderson offered the following observation.

One cannot be sure, but it is possible that the board might have acted differently prior to the September coup…but since the coup, censorship of the media has become much more intense, elaborate, and arbitrary. Furthermore, the coup


30 In Thailand, recent incidents highlight the ways government censors attempt to police the visual presentation of political disagreement. Two recent examples include Ing K’s *Shakespeare Must Die* (2012) and Nontawat Numbenchapol’s *Boundary* (2013), both accused of the attempt to cause national divisiveness and “disrupt public order.” The continued climate of film censorship has steadily escalated since the September 19 2006 coup in which the democratically-elected Prime Minister Thaksin Shinawatra was ousted by a nationalist-royalist military coup d’état. See "Censors Ban Political Documentary in Thailand." Committee to Protect Journalists. April 25, 2013. Accessed June 08, 2013. http://cpj.org/2013/04/censors-ban-political-documentary-in-thailand.php.
leaders, facing their enemy, Thaksin’s populist nationalism, have felt it necessary to enforce (and reinforce) the traditional official nationalism, with its three icons, Monarchy, Buddhism, and Nation—recipe for pharisaim, euphemism, and conformity.\textsuperscript{31}

Political life quickly converged with aesthetics as films, video, and television fell within carefully monitored forms of control. As tanks rolled into the city, television stations were commandeered. The Council for Democratic Reform under Constitutional Monarchy [CDRM], the temporary military “caretaker” government, imposed martial law and limited the visibility of urban residents under archaic curfew laws. Security guards and urban police regiments governed the streets with camcorders.\textsuperscript{32} Around the clock, the carefully-scripted coup announcements were played alongside a repetitive rotation of documentaries about the monarchy. The key elements of the coup were top-down authority, surveillance and oversight, and a regime of control enveloped over the everyday forms of visibility and appearance.

Several months later, around the beginning of April 2007, anyone with an email account and a trivial interest in Thai film received a forwarded petition protesting the Thai Censorship Board’s decision to ban \textit{Syndromes And A Century} pending four required cuts (totaling around 7 minutes). The narrative of the film, loosely based on his parents early career courtship, unfolds in two halves whereby the first sequence is set in the rural northeastern province of Khon Kaen and then repeated, through the filter of the coup, in Bangkok. The first half is playful, spontaneous, and taps into a free association of senses as lush greenery and discussions of orchids and overgrown tree roots blend into the intimacy of new friendships. The sequence closes in an alluring soundscape of classical guitar at a night market behind the provincial medical clinic. Hospital life by day, which provides the


subtext for how two doctors meet and subsequently fall in love, easily blends into the social encounters of community by night. Halfway through the film, a hard cut moves the story back to the beginning, but this time the courtship unfolds between the elevated floors of doctors’ offices and the basement levels of rehabilitating patients. The overpowering presence of white in the interior mise en scene accompanies the geometric uniformity of the hospital. Like the coup of 2006, the city is framed as a militantly reorganized state.

Of the censored scenes, a doctor’s informal gathering in the hospital’s basement level, and its subsequent censorship, projects new constraints on visibility in the aftermath of the coup, but in subtle ways. In the scene, Dr. Nong, the male protagonist who has just begun working at the army hospital, meets Dr. Wan and Dr. Nan, who are two of the more senior female doctors. The sequence begins with both Dr. Wan and Dr. Nong, who hail from the same rural town, discussing life back home in the province. Dr. Nan soon enters the basement room and joins in the casual conversation in-progress. From a pile of prosthetic limbs in the corner of the basement room, Dr. Wan pulls a bottle of whiskey. As Dr. Nan nonchalantly turns to lock the door, Dr. Wan remarks, “She knows what to do.” The remark highlights the new conventions of secrecy, even as the military contemporaneously emerged under the so-called Council for Democratic Reform. If the hospital is a sanctified national institution, as the Censorship Board proposed, it is because this is where citizenship is both policed and contested. The ensuing conversation among these three army doctors projects the anxiety of their moral guardianship.

Dr. Wan: Don’t call me an alcoholic. I have to go on T.V. this evening.
Dr. Nan: She’s a guest speaker on public T.V. every week.
Dr. Wan: It’s always like this. I’ve gone on air a lot, but I just can’t get used to the cameras. I don’t drink much, just enough to get me buzzed.
Dr. Nan: As always.

---

33 Everyday power dimensions, such as gendered inequalities, show up when Dr. Wan notes, “hematologists live with suffering…most are women.”
Another doctor, Dr. Neng, enters the room with his patient Off who suffers from carbon monoxide poisoning. Dr. Wan requests to diagnose him, but this time uses the more traditional, non-conventional, method of Chakra healing. “I channel energy from the sun. The top of his head is the Chakra. I’m going to transfer my energy to him.” As Dr. Wan begins the ritual, the camera slowly pans left and tracks out to reveal Dr. Nan gazing directly at the camera. This gaze continues for a full minute until Dr. Nan turns back toward the Chakra healing. Off responds, “I didn’t feel anything” and proceeds to leave the room with Dr. Neng.

**Figure 2: The Medical Gaze:** This picture shows the medical gaze turned back upon the audience, drawing an association between authority and the predominance of being watched. (Used with Permission from Apichatpong Weerasethakul)

Based on our earlier articulation of the political as the imposition of disagreement that challenges the “distribution of space and time, of the visible and the invisible to create specific forms of ‘common sense’,” there are several key political dimensions to this scene. First, Dr. Wan’s role of promoting hospital publicity through weekly appearances on public television unfolds in counterpoint to Dr. Nan’s direct gaze at the audience off-screen (Figure 2). At the time of the coup, when all are being watched under the guise of martial law, the
medical institution falls within, and contributes to, this oversight. Dr. Wan’s need to temper this anxiety with alcohol speaks to the possibility of being an instrument against her will. Dr. Nan’s gaze at the audience moves vision beyond the film world, especially to challenge potential censors of the film who are officially tasked as guardians over such scenes. This conversation thus takes place in the subterranean layer of the hospital to highlight the diversity of medical encounters beyond the watchful eye of the state.

Foucault emphasized that the modernization of the medical institution ran parallel to the development of the sovereign state. The modern impulses of the French Revolution, which sought the elimination of illness in rational science, prefigured the emergence of a sanitized modern citizen-subject. But the state order is never absolute. In this scene, the use of traditional Chakra healing methods speaks to the legacy of community forms of hospitality that persist beyond officially-sanctioned practices of medicine. Medical space is a national space that is built into the modern appearance of progress, but must continue to co-exist with the subterranean existence of alternative practices. Hosts and guests may meet around the goal of reproducing well-being, but this scene highlights the multi-dimensionality of the ethical encounter: i.e., the introductions, community practices, the experience of looking and being looked at, and the televisual dimensions of civil society that require doctors to become guests in dominant media representations of national life. Practicing Chakra in the secluded space of a modern Bangkok hospital demonstrates that pockets of resistance emerge in spaces that are not assumed to be political.

The Censorship Board, along with numerous reviews of Syndromes, point to the bottle of whisky as the scene’s most problematic narrative device. Their argument suggests that medical spaces are moral spaces with particular expectations about social conduct. The film’s two parts open with drawn out interviews between Dr. Nong and his future wife, Dr. Toey, in order to draw the film into the procedures of socialization and the anticipated conformity to rules. In the later basement scene articulated above, Dr. Wan and Dr. Nan are breaking these rules as senior doctors in the sanitized national space of the hospital, and therefore extend a practical yet ethical act that explains the numerous subterranean oppositions to the military coup after September 19th 2006. The Censorship Board’s inhospitable ban backfired when it set
in motion the underground distribution and proliferation of this film, resulting in the intensified visibility of the hospitalized state.

**Hospitality in *Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives* (2010)**

While the 2006 coup coincided with *Syndromes*, the April 10th and May 19th 2010 twin military crackdown on the anti-coup protest network called the United Front for Democracy Against Dictatorship (UDD), or the “red shirts,” coincided with the release of Apichatpong’s *Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives* (2010). The film narrative spoke of violence and memory, of ruptured landscapes and oneiric imagery that gave presence to Nabua, the northeastern town where the film narrative unfolds, but also to the brutally repressed protestors cleared the streets of Bangkok in 2010. Resounding in a mixture of critical acclaim and national tensions, the film won the Palm D’Or at Cannes two days after the May 19th military crackdown at Rajprasong Road. A month and 6 days later, *Uncle Boonmee* opened on a single screen in one of Bangkok’s most exclusive shopping malls. 15 steps from the Thailand Creative and Design Center (TCDC), the Thaksin era attempt to diversify an economy of scale by motivating the emergence of a creative class, the debut of *Uncle Boonmee* seemed less marketable to the state image when Apichatpong remarked "Thailand is a violent country. It is controlled by a group of mafia. Our governments, present and past, have been such a mess." Still, Culture Minister Teera Slukpetch waged a national claim to the aesthetic work: "This kind of victory is what we really need at this time of crisis." With the bloody crackdown firmly embedded in the minds of urban residents, the ruling parties issued a repetition of sound bytes around the theme of “reconciliation,” a top-down campaign that spoke to the continued oversight of the state in the face of disruptive political tensions. Boonmee, the film’s main character, is haunted by his past complicity in murdering alleged communists and subversive invaders in the provinces. As he slides toward death, he recalls these memories as past lives that measure the violence of his deeds alongside future

---

incarnations of his soul. Boonmee’s anti-communist history of purging enemies of the state haunts his ability to clear his mind—which becomes the cinematic projector he will use in the end of the film to screen his nightmares of a “city that can make people disappear.”

Uncle Boonmee builds upon the hospital tropes of Syndromes by linking illness with hospitality. In the narrative time of a few days, the viewer is exposed to Boonmee’s hospitable interactions with visiting relatives but also the warm relationship he shares with a migrant worker, Jai. This latter relation cannot be overstated. Jai’s daily routine of administering medical treatment to Uncle Boonmee inverts the authoritative relationship between doctor and patient by shifting the locus from hospital authority to hospitality. Undermining the hierarchy of citizenship that places Min in the care of doctors and citizens in Blissfully Yours, Jai keeps Boonmee’s community alive. Another Lao migrant worker teaches Boonmee French. While Jai is at home in Boonmee’s tamarind farm, the linear time of the film deals in the few days he spends with his visiting relatives, Pa Jen and Thong, the ghost of his deceased wife, Huay, and his long lost son Boonsong who has since morphed into the ghost form of a sasquatch. Jai, foreman among the farm workers, keeps Boonmee alive in the daily task of draining his ailing kidney. It becomes clear that Boonmee was complicit in fighting prior enemies of the nation, but his charitable interaction with Laotian migrant workers looks beyond the present stigma of the foreign laborer, possibly as a means to redress bad karma. The significance of Jai’s presence resides in the relationship between hosts and guests: hospitality is foregrounded in the actions of the guest.

As a film, Uncle Boonmee reproduces the memory of a violent military past and relies upon a direct association with the present subtext of Thai politics. But in counterpoint to the moral high ground of Thailand’s legislative body, which at the time of the film remained

---

35 The theme of migration works as an afterimage to the former colonization of Thailand’s bordering countries, but also an allusion to the ambiguity of these colonial boundaries which led to conflicts over this Eastern border. This memory of anti-communist violence in Northeastern Thailand is more carefully addressed in the larger Primitives (2009) project, but also in his later film Mekong Hotel (2012).
The Politics of Health in the Films of Apichatpong Weerasethakul

37 Ibid. 195.
38 “Accommodation” is bound to be problematic in the same way “multiculturalism” rarely operates in an open deliberative public sphere where, as Seyla Benhabib (2002) has it, intercultural dialogue can play out. Rather, these films presume power inequalities. The conception of “care” rethinks the center’s ploy to either dominate or tolerate the periphery. On one hand, the Thai northeast/Isaan region is now the electoral majority and it would be in Bangkok’s interest to “care” about the political identities of the region for institutional purposes, but this is shallow. The director’s intention is to look into memory for the sake of understanding the present, the connective threads of otherwise distant temporalities which, under the concept of care, extend into an infinite chain of possible communities. As
This violent history, assembled here as the politics of *Uncle Boonmee*, are communicated in the aesthetics of images. Images invite apprehension in the same way that surgery produces knowledge of the body through observation. Past lives, and images in general, Boonmee says, are images “replayed from my dying consciousness.” As Boonmee slips toward death, he leads his caretakers into a nearby cave. It is like the cave in Book VII of *The Republic* where Plato offers his theory of forms. In Plato’s “cave allegory,” chained citizens are educated by a series of shadows as they are projected onto the cave walls by guardians from unseen locations. Since the citizens know only the cave, they believe the shadow images are real. Plato’s point is that only a few elite characters will ever desire to depart their manufactured reality, which provides a justification for the privileged oversight of the few. As Boonmee enters the cave, his caretakers shine their flashlight across the walls as if looking for images. The cave is the womb in the sense that this is where images were born. A flashlight discovers a school of fish in a watered corner as life in the womb gives way to an impending death. Boonmee begins to tell of a dream as a montage of still images show soldiers surrounding a mysterious beast in an open field. Boonmee tells of a previous night’s dream of a future city (*Figure 3*).


40 In a way, we live in a totalitarian regime in Thailand, so I wanted to refer to this moment where the maker and the character merge. And when Uncle Boonmee goes back to the womb in the cave I wanted to take the movie back to its origins, before the image moved, before it became the moving image… It’s the representation of the future but from the past perspective. I’m very interested in these kinds of time shifts.” See Virginie Sélavy, "Uncle Boonmee: Interview with Apichatpong Weerasethakul," *Electric Sheep*. November 13, 2010. Accessed June 09, 2013. http://www.electricsheep magazine.co.uk/features/2010/11/13/uncle-boonmee-interview-with-apichatpong-weerasethakul/. “
The future city was ruled by an authority able to make anybody disappear. When they found past people, they shone a light on them. That light projected images of them onto the screen, from the past, until their arrival in the future. Once those images appeared these past people disappeared. I was afraid of being captured by the authorities because I had many friends in this future. I ran. But wherever I ran, they still found me. They asked me if I knew this road or that road. I told them I didn’t know. And then I disappeared.

Figure 3: Society of Control: Throughout Uncle Boonmee, the images of control translates into the control of bodies. While doctors are charged with the well-being of bodies in society, their moral authority is often equated with a top-down regime that reaches its extreme in military rule. (Used with Permission from Apichatpong Weerasethakul)

There are many levels of representation in Boonmee’s last words as he lay dying in the cave. As in Plato’s cave, those who control the images control the appearance of reality through which they oversee, educate, and subjugate bodies. At another dimension, the past and present are brought together in Boonmee’s dream whereby even those who subjugate bodies, as did Boonmee during the anti-Communist counter
insurgency waged on Nabua between the 1960s and the 1980s, are eventually called to account for their actions. Finally, the dimension of a future city in Boonmee’s dream is in fact Thailand’s troubled present. Apichatpong has mentioned elsewhere, “we live in a totalitarian regime in Thailand, so I wanted to refer to this moment where the maker and the character merge.” Boonmee’s dream is everyone’s nightmare in a country where military crackdowns unfold with impunity. As Huay drains Boonmee’s kidney one last time, we imagine the connection of these political dimensions to his remarks earlier in the film: his illness, like the syndromes of the state, are directly related to past lives. But Boonmee’s most surprising revelation is that all the visitors we witness throughout the film “care” about his future.

Conclusion

Foucault’s critique of the body subjugated beneath surveillance and state oversight comports well with the analysis of characters who, like Uncle Boonmee, are overcome by disrupted bodily functions. The national body, the urban body, and the film body, problematized by the assembly of disharmonious and discordant parts, are violently harmonized in images of good health. In the Thai military interventions into the Bangkok street protests of 1973, 1976, 1992, 2006, 2009 and 2010, the political intersected with the medical in the sense that the city became a visual diagnosis, where a disease could be removed from Bangkok as if those lives did not count in the official body. As street protestors each positioned doctors at the forefront of their leadership (e.g., Dr. Weng Tojirakarn of the red shirts or Dr. Tul Sithisomwong of the multi-colored shirts) movies like Syndromes And A Century and Uncle Boonmee Who Can Recall His Past Lives critiqued the regimentation of medical authority by rendering visible what Foucault refers to as “the medical gaze.” The medical gaze is the discharge of “violent rectitude…in order to shatter, to lift, to release appearance.” Like the scope of soldiers who observe disease from unseen positions, the enmity calls for action. Here again, Foucault issues a warning. “The glance is silent, like a finger pointing,

41 Sélavy, “Uncle Boonmee: Interview.”
denouncing." Dr. Nan’s direct gaze into the camera in *Syndromes And A Century* (see Figure 2) thus reminds the viewer of the violent act of being watched.

The medical gaze emerged as a “way of teaching and saying [that] became a way of learning and seeing.” For Foucault, the institutions proper to governing in modern liberalism developed according to the normative prerogatives of a national public morality. These institutions included the prison, the hospital, and the psychiatric institution, among others, and operate through an optic form of disciplinary surveillance. Medical offices, developed as a parallel arm of political development, preside over a spatial topography of knowledge production. The authorities that write about diseases are like painters, mapping the significant details in and around their subject. 18th century French officials referred to the medical establishment as the “art of health” by which they meant that the production of knowledge about disease was a visual enterprise and should be properly regulated.

Both *Syndromes* and *Uncle Boonmee*, but also the three films that proceed these works, ascribe value to the body by illustrating the transformation from individual to patient, which resides in the development of oversight under the directive of physicians. Their medical gaze contributes to the authority of seeing and knowing within the discourse of curing disease, where bodies are fixed first by classification, then by dissection, and finally by isolation and cure. However, Apichatpong intervenes politically in this formula by employing an ambiguous space between caretaking and hospitality, between the controlled verticality of the Bangkok hospital and the unseen spaces of its subterranean levels. Beyond rules and rights, these films raise questions about the well-being of bodies from the subterranean refuges of military power. To end where we began, these stories help us to reimagine hospitality from hospital basement, the corridors of the medical clinic, the provincial markets, and the borderlands. And yet, the challenges that remain are rigorously

---

43 Ibid.
44 Ibid, 64
46 Ibid, 30.
underscored in the censorship of *Syndromes* and the coincident military crackdown during the release of *Uncle Boonmee*.

[T]his aesthetic not only defines the original form of all truth, it also prescribes rules of exercise...The technical armature of the medical gaze is transformed into advice about prudence, taste, skill: what is required is ‘great sagacity’, ‘great attention’, ‘great precision’, ‘great skill’, ‘great patience’.

The medical gaze looks much like the oversight of the superior philosopher-kings who oversee the well-being of the republic through their foresight and prudence. Plato cited the expertise of physicians as the justification for a well-regimented hierarchy while conversing in dialogues and heated arguments with such patience that one wonders if they’re simply meant to end with his ideal moral type. But the transfusion of medical perception into political authority is never patient with its prescriptions. Foucault so notes that the aesthetic plane within which this gaze operates entails a “violent rectitude...in order to shatter, to lift, to release appearance.” Not unlike the scope of an elite military sniper, “[t]he glance is silent, like a finger pointing, denouncing.” While Apichatpong’s work has often drawn inspiration from memories of his childhood, where his parents medical profession likely influenced his own preference for themes about health and well-being, the post-coup climate since 2006 has exacerbated the medical prescription of politics. In this sense, the camera enters the national body to diagnose its political symptoms, but this time from the fragmented perspectives of the everyday. Rarely does a body of work so accurately communicate the political syndromes of a particular time and place, simply by setting them in hospitals.

---

48 Ibid, 121.
Haiku as a Tool of Japanese Language Education  
- Practical Examples and Further Possibilities -  

IBUKI Aiba

Abstract

Haiku, a traditional Japanese form of poetry, is well known all over the world today. However, for the majority, it is approachable only in their native languages, which seldom contributes to enhancing the Japanese language proficiency of the haijin. On the other hand, in the field of Japanese language education, Haiku has been used as a tool for improving learners’ Japanese skills, encouraging their further understanding of Japanese culture, history and aesthetic sense.

This paper reports practical examples of the utilization of Haiku for Japanese language education. The first examples aim to develop specific topics of Japanese learning: the sense of Japanese mora timing for better pronunciation, proper use of onomatopoeia, and discussion of seasonal words to understand cultural differences. For the second example, a holistic approach which integrates different skills such as reading, listening, speaking and writing is also reported based on various attempts in an intermediate Japanese course of Akita International University. Learners’ positive reactions toward the Haiku class are also shown as proof of the usefulness of Haiku for Japanese language education.

Finally, further possibilities for Haiku are mentioned from the viewpoint that Japanese language education should cooperate with related fields such as Japanese literature, art and philosophy.

1. Introduction

Haiku, a traditional Japanese form of poetry is appreciated all over the world today. The number of non-Japanese enthusiasts of Haiku is estimated at 2 million, ¹ spreading over more than 50 countries, such as the USA, the UK, France, Germany, Russia, India and others.
However, for most of these foreign hajin,² Haiku is approachable only in their native languages, and it is uncommon for the majority to read and write Haiku in Japanese. Needless to say, this tendency should not be criticized by anyone, considering that “俳句 (Haiku)”, originally a traditional Japanese short poem, has now permeated the world in the form of “Haiku”, a three-line poem in many different languages.

On the other hand, in the field of Japanese language education, Japanese Haiku has been used as a tool to improve learners’ skills and deepen their understanding of Japanese culture. Early reports suggest that Haiku was used mainly to introduce and study Japanese culture. Tomoka (1994) utilized Haiku as a material for her Japanese culture class, focusing on sense of the seasons which differs between Japanese and non-Japanese. Tokui (1997) emphasized more creative aspects, having learners read and compose Haiku to enhance their understanding of Japanese culture. In turn, recent reports indicate that Haiku could also be utilized to improve specific language skills such as reading, writing, grammar and so forth. Kobayashi (2012) attempted utilizing Haiku to improve learners’ writing skills, especially the proper use of particles. Shibata and Yokota (2013) suggest that reading Japanese short poems, such as Haiku and Tanka, enables learners to foster their critical reading skills.

This paper aims to illustrate the usefulness of Haiku as a tool of Japanese language education, reporting practical examples from my Japanese classes at Akita International University. The examples are divided into two groups: 1) instructions for elementary and intermediate level learners to develop specific topics of Japanese learning, and 2) a holistic approach³ for an intermediate Japanese course, which integrates the four skills of language learning - reading, listening, speaking, and writing. As a further possibility for utilizing Haiku, this paper also suggests the importance of cooperation with specialized education, based on learners’ responses toward a Haiku class, and results of a questionnaire for Japanese language teachers.

2. Practical Example 1: Instructions to Develop Specific Topics

This chapter reports three practical examples of utilizing Haiku in Japanese language education to develop specific topics of Japanese learning, targeting learners of elementary and intermediate level.
2.1 Sense of Japanese Mora Timing

A mora, *haku*, is a rhythmic unit of Japanese language, each of which is indicated by using the *Kana*, syllabary, and each mora in Japanese has almost the same duration (Isomura, 2009). Toda (2008) explains that maintaining the timing of Japanese mora equally is especially difficult for learners whose native languages use a pronunciation system that is different from Japanese. For such learners, understanding of *yōon*, contractions, and *tokushuhaku*, special phonemes, 4) is necessary to acquire Japanese mora timing efficiently. It is often suggested that the intervention of learners’ first language is obvious in their pronunciation of the target language. As Tsurutani (2008) points out, the short timing of special phonemes is one of the most distinct characteristics of Japanese language learners and is considered a primary feature of their foreign accents. However, this fact also implies the possibility that learners are able to acquire Japanese-like pronunciation by maintaining the timing of special phonemes appropriately. Therefore, as Isomura (2009) suggests, putting words into the fixed form of Haiku, 5-7-5 moras, contributes to learners’ acquisition of Japanese mora timing, providing good exercises in counting Japanese mora properly. The exercises should be done from words which contain various contractions and special phonemes. Counting on fingers or clapping hands is helpful for those who have trouble counting each mora.

**Exercise 1: How many moras?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Mora Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>きょう/うかしょ (textbook)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ちゅ/うかっこ/う (junior high school)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>しゃ/ぽ/ん/ま (soap bubble)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>チョ/コレ/ト (chocolate)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ひや/く/に/いつ/しゅ (one hundred poems by one hundred poets)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If learners successfully count the number of Japanese mora in a word, the next step is to detect the number of mora in a sentence, or a Haiku. The key is to choose modern Haiku so that learners can avoid unnecessary confusion.
Exercise 2: Punctuate each Haiku with 5-7-5.

サンダルの / すなをおとして / なつおわる 5)
Sandaru no suna o otoshite natsu owaru
ゆうやけの / ふじさんみてる / スカイツリー
Yuyake no fujisan miteru sukaitsuri
ミュンヘンの / ゆきできってを / はりました
Myunhen no yuki de kitte o harimashita

The final step aims at composing Haiku in a group, which allows three learners to make one Haiku. Each one comes up with a word for the beginning 5 moras, middle 7 moras and final 5 moras individually, and put them together to make a Haiku.

Exercise 3: Make one Haiku with three people.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1) The beginning 5 moras</th>
<th>夏休み Natsuyasumi (summer vacation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2) The middle 7 moras</td>
<td>アイスクリーム Aisukuriimu (ice cream)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) The final 5 moras</td>
<td>自転車で Jitensya de (on a bicycle)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The focus of this exercise should be on counting Japanese moras appropriately rather than composing an excellent Haiku. Through the exercise, learners gain Japanese mora timing for better Japanese pronunciation as a result.

2.2 Onomatopoeia

Japanese speakers use onomatopoeia quite frequently, and even individuals create new ones, which are often seen in Japanese short poems and manga (2009, Ono). With the world wide popularity of Japanese manga and anime, learners’ needs to understand Japanese onomatopoeia are increasing. However, understanding the meaning of each onomatopoeia is not sufficient in order to use it appropriately in daily conversation. To attain a good command of onomatopoeia, learning them in context is most important. As Haiku expresses various images with limited words, it can be an effective tool to help learners better understand onomatopoeia and use them more appropriately.
Exercise: Which is most appropriate?

海のなか　人魚になって（　　）と

Umi no naka ningyo ni natte ( ) to

A. ぐんぐん gungun rapidly
B. ゆらゆら yurayura waveringly
C. すいすい suisui smoothly

In this exercise, learners read aloud each onomatopoeia to feel the difference in sound. Then, they discuss the image that they gained from the sound and characters. After this, the teacher gives the meaning of each onomatopoeia, and the learners decide which one to choose. They also discuss the different images made in the Haiku by replacing onomatopoeia one by one. In general, Haiku with onomatopoeia are considered unfavorable, and in this regard, classic Haiku seldom contain onomatopoeia. On the contrary, as Ono (2009) indicates, modern Haiku enjoy using them in more unconventional ways. Therefore, useful examples can be found in modern Haiku and the works composed by younger individuals such as elementary or junior high school students.

2.3 Seasonal Words

Putting a seasonal word in a Haiku is the golden rule that haijin should follow. Suganaga (2009) explains that, as Haiku has such a concise style, a seasonal word can be used quite effectively, indicating a season and its associated images that Japanese people have cultivated for a long time. However, the images associated with each season are rarely the same from country to country. For instance, the Russian image of winter is completely different from the Australian. As a matter of course, differences in seasonal words are closely related to the different views of nature and aesthetics that each culture possesses. As a result, seasonal words cause active discussion in Japanese class, fostering learners’ intercultural understanding.

Exercise: Discuss the season and images that each seasonal word indicates.

月 tuki (moon)　　花火 hanabi (fireworks)
ひまわり himawari (sunflower)
いちご ichigo (strawberry)　　せみ semi (cicada)
入学式 nyugakushiki (entrance ceremony)
For most Japanese, the moon is an image of autumn, while some foreign students say that it is not an image of any season, since it can be seen throughout the year. Fireworks is a seasonal word associated with summer in Japan, but European students claim that it is a seasonal word for winter, evoking the image of the new year. Insects and plants such as sunflowers, strawberries and cicadas, and events like entrance ceremony are associated with different seasons as well.

3. Practical Example 2: Holistic Instruction by Integrating the Four Skills

This example reports a holistic approach which integrates the four skills of reading, writing, listening and speaking in a Japanese language course. The learners are 9 international students attending Akita International University (3 Americans, 2 Taiwanese, 2 Norwegians, 1 German and 1 Australian), who have learned Japanese for one and a half to three years. The Haiku workshop was held as a part of my reading course for intermediate level learners, spending three 50 minute sessions.

3.1 Pre-reading Activities

The first step of the Haiku class is to introduce the background and the basic rules of Haiku as pre-reading activities. The rules of Haiku, the 5-7-5 fixed form, seasonal words, and Kireji, cutting words, are explained, doing the practical exercises (see Chapter 2). As the background knowledge of Haiku, a brief history and its great figures are discussed: Matsuo Basho, Yosa Buson, Kobayashi Issa and Masaoka Shiki.

3.2 During-reading Activities

The second step is to read four masterpieces of classic Haiku, which are well-known by Japanese people. One Haiku from each great figure was selected and supplemental explanation was given for some difficult words. However, at this point the instructor avoids giving further information to explain the meaning of each Haiku. Instead, the learners express the images they gained from the Haiku, by drawing pictures or writing in English or simple Japanese. The purpose of this activity is to offer a chance to expand images of Haiku through a
Haiku as a Tool of Japanese Language Education  
- Practical Examples and Further Possibilities -

careful reading of short poems, with a limitation of 17 moras. Moreover, this activity also aims to have learners realize that there is no absolute interpretation for a piece of Haiku, or how it could express various images based on individual differences. After expressing the images that the learners gained from the Haiku, they discuss in groups to compare and contrast the various outcomes in order to draw their own conclusions. It is not until the discussion is over that the instructor gives a general interpretation of each Haiku as an example.

3. Practical Example 2: Holistic Instruction by Integrating the Four Skills

This example reports a holistic approach which integrates the four skills of reading, writing, listening and speaking in a Japanese language course. The learners are 9 international students attending Akita International University (3 Americans, 2 Taiwanese, 2 Norwegians, 1 German and 1 Australian), who have learned Japanese for one and a half to three years. The Haiku workshop was held as a part of my reading course for intermediate level learners, spending three 50 minute sessions.

3.1 Pre-reading Activities

The first step of the Haiku class is to introduce the background and the basic rules of Haiku as pre-reading activities. The rules of Haiku, the 5-7-5 fixed form, seasonal words, and Kireji, cutting words, are explained, doing the practical exercises (see Chapter 2). As the background knowledge of Haiku, a brief history and its great figures are discussed: Matsuo Basho, Yosa Buson, Kobayashi Issa and Masaoka Shiki.

3.2 During-reading Activities

The second step is to read four masterpieces of classic Haiku, which are well-known by Japanese people. One Haiku from each great figure was selected and supplemental explanation was given for some difficult words. However, at this point the instructor avoids giving further information to explain the meaning of each Haiku. Instead, the learners express the images they gained from the Haiku, by drawing pictures or writing in English or simple Japanese. The purpose of this activity is to offer a chance to expand images of Haiku through a careful reading of short poems, with a limitation of 17 moras. Moreover, this activity also aims to have learners realize that there is no absolute interpretation for a piece of Haiku, or how it could express various images based on individual differences. After expressing the images that the learners gained from the Haiku, they discuss in groups to compare and contrast the various outcomes in order to draw their own conclusions. It is not until the discussion is over that the instructor gives a general interpretation of each Haiku as an example.

Haiku1. 閑けさや岩にしみいる蝉の声  
Shizukesa ya iwa ni shimiiru semi no koe  
The silence;  
the voice of the cicadas  
penetrates the rocks  
(Translation from Blyth, 1971)

This Haiku was composed by Matsuo Basho, a great patriarch of Haiku, when he visited a mountain temple during his travel to the deep north of Japan in early Edo period. As the seasonal word is semi, cicadas, the general image of this work is a traveler in the sun at daytime of high summer, listening to cicadas singing around the mountain temple. However, this drawing by a learner shows the silence in the moonlight, which evoked an interesting discussion within the class. Asking and answering the reasoning behind each drawing (ex. cicadas never sing at night), they built up the evidence for their interpretation to reach a conclusion.

Haiku2. 春の海ひねもすのたりのたりかな  
Haru no umi hinemosu notari notari kana  
In the spring sea  
waves undulating and undulating  
all day long  
(Translation from Miura, 1991)

Yosa Buson, a follower of Basho, is another great figure of the mid-Edo period. This work expresses a tranquil sea in spring. Although the composer is thought to be at the sea shore, in this drawing by a learner
he is on a boat and enjoys fishing. The discussion point was whether it was plausible to have such a boat and enjoy fishing at that time.

Haiku3. 雪とけて村いっぱいの子どもかな
Yuki tokete mura ippai no kodomo kana
The snow is melting and the village is flooded with children
(Translation from Hass, 1984)

This is a Haiku by Kobayashi Issa, who was one of the most popular haijin in the late-Edo period. From this piece, readers usually imagine a peaceful village with bouncing children who joy the welcoming spring after a long and dark winter. However, this drawing hardly conveys the feelings of the season, as the sun beats down as if it were summer. The creator of this drawing was a student from a southern country where snow never falls.

Haiku4. 再びも雪の深さを尋ねけり
Ikutabi mo yuki no fukasa o tazune keri
Again and again I asked how high the snow is
(Translation from Beichman, 1986)

Masaoka Shiki played an important role in the movement of Haiku renovation during the Meiji period. He suffered from a serious disease and became bedridden in his thirties. This Haiku expresses his longing for the outside world. This background information was unrevealed until the learners finished their discussions. As a result, most of them imagined a child who was waiting for snow to fall and the increasing excitement as it accumulated.

Drawing a picture is not the only way to express the image of Haiku. Writing in English or simple Japanese at random is also a useful way, especially for learners who are reluctant to draw pictures. Below are some examples.
Haiku1: Grass, trees, and cloud high above. Sitting alone under a tree. A humid day, end of August.
Haiku2: In the sea, relaxing, swimming, playing… very pleasant image.

The aim of the series of the during-reading activities is 1) to evoke various images from Haiku freely and specifically, and 2) to compare and contrast the differences and discuss vigorously in order to draw a conclusion, which is not necessarily correct. As Shibata and Yokota (2013) explain, this process enables learners to develop not only an ordinary reading skill, but also a critical reading skill through active discussion.

3.3 After-reading Activities

Tokui (1996) suggests that two directions are needed for a Haiku class; a direction of expanding images through reading, and a direction of expressing images by words through composing. Therefore, after-reading activities focus on Haiku composition, which enables learners to express their images in words. Needless to say, creating a Haiku in Japanese is never easy for learners. In this sense, activities should start with a simple exercise, such as making a Haiku with three people (see Ch. 2.1). Using an image map is also acceptable, as it allows learners to make a 5-7-5 fixed form of Haiku easily.

Figure1: Image map
First, a keyword is chosen to be placed in the center of the image map (ex. sushi), and learners imagine and list the words that are associated with the keyword (ex. salmon, wasabi, rotation, seaweed, family, soy sauce, delicious). Next, they select some words from the image map, and put them into the fixed style of Haiku, 5-7-5 moras. For example, “サーモンはすしの王様おいしいな (Oh salmon, the king of sushi, how delicious!)”. The point of this exercise is to make a Haiku with the 5-7-5 format, using easy words related to the key word, regardless of artistic quality. This activity should be successful when learners are able to overcome the idea that composing Haiku in Japanese is too difficult. Of course, keywords can be more challenging, but it is safer to start with an easier one and gradually make it abstract, for example, yume (dream).

After composing Haiku, it is enjoyable to hold a Kukai, a Haiku contest. In my class, the learners were given the theme “秋 aki (autumn)” to compose their own Haiku as homework, and they brought them to the classroom to present to other students. In an authentic Kukai, the composers are anonymous until the winner is decided. However, in a Japanese language class, learners are expected to speak up, and presentation is considered a useful way to enhance their speaking skills. Therefore, in my class each learner made a presentation to appeal the point of their Haiku, answering questions from the audience. After the presentation, each student chose one Haiku that they thought was the best. The three Haiku below are the works that the learners composed.

外を見るきれいになった紅葉や
_Soto o miru kireini natta koyo ya_
Looking out of the window
how beautiful
the colored leaves

友達とお酒を飲みで月を見る
_Tomodachi to osake o nonde tsuki o miru_
With my friends
drinking sake
a moon-viewing party

名はひみつ小さな楽園一人きり
_Na wa himitsu chiisana rakuen hitori kiri_
The name is secret -
in a tiny paradise
I am alone

3.4 Language Skills Used in the Haiku Class

Through the series of activities in the Haiku class, the four basic language skills, reading, writing, listening and speaking, were used thoroughly as the table below indicates. However, this is not the absolute model of a holistic approach which integrates different skills. The frequency of use of each skill should be carefully adjusted by the instructor, based on the goal of the class and the learners’ Japanese language level, motivation, interest and so forth.

Table1: Activities and Language Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Reading</th>
<th>Writing</th>
<th>Listening</th>
<th>Speaking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-reading activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning basic rules of Haiku</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing a sense of Japanese mora</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussing seasonal words</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During-reading activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading Haiku carefully</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressing Haiku images</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussing the different Haiku images</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After-reading activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composing Haiku</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presenting Haiku</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although the Haiku class was conducted as a part of an intermediate reading course, a balanced use of the four skills is seen from the table shows. If instructors desire a more reading-focused class, basic rules and history of Haiku could be given as reading material, for example.
3.5 Reactions of the Learners

Professional verification will be needed to observe the efficiency of the exercises and activities done in the Haiku class, but this is not the main purpose of this paper. However, a small survey conducted at the end of the Haiku class discovered the learners’ positive reaction toward this method of practice, and their interest in Haiku. Below are the questions asked of the learners in a written form. The answers for Q1 and Q2 were chosen from “yes”, “no” and “neither”, stating their reasons.

Q1. Are you interested in Haiku?
Q2. Do you think that Haiku is useful for your Japanese language learning?
Q3. What do you think of the Haiku class?

To the first question, 6 learners answered “yes”, 1 “no”, and 2 “neither”. Their overall response was quite favorable except the one answer of “no”, whose reason was that “basically, I do not like poetry”. The main reason for the answer “neither” was that “Haiku is not very easy to understand”. This suggests that model Haiku should be selected from modern works rather than classics, for easier comprehension.

To the second question, 6 learners answered “yes”, 3 “neither”, and nobody “no”. The reason for the negative response stemmed from learners’ beliefs that “Haiku should be treated in the field of Japanese arts, history and culture”. On the other hand, positive feedback also regarded Haiku as a tool for learning about Japanese history and culture, in addition to Japanese language learning. Considering the learners’ response to the Haiku class, it can be argued whether Haiku is a part of Japanese language education, or if it belongs to more specific fields such as literature, history and culture.

As for the learners’ comments on the Haiku class, almost every learner said that Haiku is “interesting” or “enjoyable”. Remarkably, there were some comments that “composing Haiku in Japanese language was not as difficult as I thought”. It is pleasing for the instructor if the holistic instruction allowed the learners to think that Haiku is approachable even in their target language - Japanese. Other significant comments showed a learner’s interest in Senryu, humorous
or ironical Haiku, and an aspiration toward another chance to compose Haiku as well. These responses suggest that a Haiku class should be repeated rather than offered as a single attempt, and include other related topics.

4. Further Possibilities

Further possibilities to utilize Haiku for Japanese language education can be found when we consider these ideas from the perspectives of both learners and teachers.

4.1 Haiku for Japanese Language Teachers

The results of the small survey to the learners of my Haiku class indicated their positive reactions toward Haiku. Below are the questions of a survey of 8 Japanese language teachers and their responses. The teachers are all Japanese and teaching at universities. Half of them are teaching in Akita and the others are teaching abroad. The answers for the questions were chosen from “Yes” or “no”, adding their reasons.

Q1. Have you used Haiku in your Japanese class? Yes. 4 No. 4
Q2. Are you going to use Haiku in your class? Yes. 6 No. 2
Q3. Do you think that Haiku is useful to improve learners’ Japanese skills? Yes. 7 No. 1

Overall, the results show that Japanese teachers think positively of utilizing Haiku in their classes, and a belief that Haiku is useful for Japanese language education. However, the reasons for their positive answers were mainly that they regard Haiku as a transmitter of Japanese culture rather than as a tool to improve learners’ specific Japanese skills or to integrate various language skills for a holistic approach. Negative reasons for Q2 are that “Haiku should be treated by specialists” and “I do not have enough knowledge to teach Haiku”. These are significant arguments about the fields that Japanese language education should deal with.

4.2 Cooperation with Related Fields

In the field of language education, cooperation with specialized education is an important theme to pursue more effective and
attractive teaching. Tosaku (2010) points out a two-layered problem in American universities: language instructors who teach freshmen and sophomores seldom have opportunities to cooperate with professors of specialized education who teach juniors and seniors. He insists that this makes the universities unable to offer language programs with an “articulation” (interconnectedness with other programs). Thomson (2010) claims that Japanese language education should actively utilize knowledge and opinions of specialists in Japan studies. She introduces an example of productive cooperation between a professor of Japanese literature and a Japanese language teacher: one professor conducts lectures on Japanese literature in English and the Japanese teacher takes up a literary work as material in her reading class.

To take my Haiku class as an example, using Japanese language education and Japan studies together can be done in the following manner.

**Table 2: Cooperation of Japanese Language Education and Japan Studies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-reading activities</th>
<th>Introduction of Haiku</th>
<th>◆</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercises to improve language skills</td>
<td>◇</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During-reading activities</td>
<td>Explanation of general Haiku interpretation</td>
<td>◆</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Encouraging discussions</td>
<td>◇</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After-reading activities</td>
<td>Keys for composing and reading Haiku</td>
<td>◆◇</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

◆ Instructions by a professor of Japanese literature (or a professional of Haiku)
◇ Instructions by a Japanese language instructor

Classes can be conducted in a team-teaching style and partly conducted in English, depending on the learners’ Japanese level. If it is difficult to invite a professor of Japan studies to a Japanese language class, asking for a professional’s advice beforehand can be helpful as well. In my case, a Japanese literature professor allowed me to audit his class, and I gained various ideas there for my Japanese classes. This is also a style of cooperation which is easily carried out.

**5. Conclusion**

As we have seen, cooperation between Japanese language education and Japan studies needs to be enhanced in the future. Although Japanese literature was discussed as a possible field with which to cooperate, it is not the only subject that can be used for Japanese
language education, since Japan studies includes various fields such as art and philosophy. If learners would like to create a *Haiga*, a painting with Haiku, a Japanese language teacher could cooperate with specialists in Japanese art and calligraphy. If learners are interested in Zen Buddhism in relation to Haiku, it would be better for a Japanese teacher to work with professionals in eastern philosophy. The point is that Haiku can be a key player to connect Japanese language education and Japan studies because it combines both cultural and linguistic aspects of Japanese.

As Uesako (2007) points out, it takes time to train Japanese language instructors to have specific knowledge and skills in Japan studies. Language teachers are not almighty. However, if we utilize Haiku to connect Japanese language education with other related fields, we will see fruitful results.

**Figure 2: Image of Haiku as a Connector**

Ex. Literature, Art, Philosophy

**Notes**
1) It is almost impossible to indicate the exact number of Haiku fans in the world. This is an approximate figure mentioned by Haiku International Association in 2006 (www.haiku-hia.com/pdf/takahashi_2006.pdf).
2) In this paper, *haijin* is used as a denomination for any professional or amateur poets writing Haiku.
3) Holistic approach is defined as “an approach to language teaching which seeks to focus on language in its entirety rather than breaking it down into separate components, such as reading, listening, writing, grammar, etc.” (Richards and Schmidt, 2002).
4) *Tokushuhaku*, special phonemes, have three types: *Sokuon*, the first half of a geminate consonant, *Hatsuon*, a nasal coda consonant given one mora, and *Hikion*, the second half of a long vowel (Otaka, 2009). Each of them is indicated by a *Kana*, which has equal
duration.  Yöon, contractions, also have the same duration as tokushuhaku have.

5) Three Haiku used in Exercise 2 are from a Haiku contest, Itoen shin haiku taisho (www.itoen. co. jp/new-haiku/).

6) This Haiku is from a Haiku section of a newspaper, Akita sakigake shinpo, and was composed by an elementary school student.

Bibliography

Thomson, Kinoshita, Chihiro. 2010. Nihongo kyoiku to nihon kenkyu no renkei no syorai [Future of cooperation between Japanese


Teaching to the Fourth Wall  
- Pedagogical Practices for the Digital Age -  

Patrick DOUGHERTY and Josephine BUTLER

Abstract

A Master of Education program at a public university system in the United Arab Emirates (UAE) employed a distributed delivery system utilizing videoconferencing to allow students in disparate locations to join together for a course of studies. An instructor taught each course from one of six campuses on a rotating basis. Each cohort of students was tied-in to the lecture and presentation via videoconference and was able to hear, see, and participate in all classroom activities in real-time. Titled *tele-presence supported distributed course delivery* (TSDCD), this method of instruction was intended to allow students in remote locations to participate in degree programs and utilize the expertise of a limited number of teaching staff. Nine educators have taught courses using the TSDCD system. The research question for this qualitative study addressed teaching and asked, what was the best pedagogical practice for teaching in such a system? Data was generated from a survey of teachers who participated in the program. The findings identified a set of best practices. They included making each lesson student centered, utilizing an inter-cohort and intra-cohort discussion model in class sessions, using the on-site tutor as a facilitator for inter-cohort discussions and activities, and the need to develop lesson plans that are specific in their goals and the timing of each activity. These best practices, and others identified in the findings, can inform the teaching practice of an educator working within distance education modalities.

Introduction

A graduate program in the United Arab Emirates (UAE) employed a
tele-presence supported distributed course delivery (TSDCD) system that utilized video-conferencing technology to allow students in separate cohorts to join together for a course of studies leading to a Master of Education degree. Approximately seventy-five class sessions were taught using the system. Classes were held and broadcast to cohort sites in Abu Dhabi, Dubai, Ras Al Khamiah, Ruwais, Al Ain, and Fujairah. At the time of this study, nine educators had taught a total of twelve graduate courses using the TSDCD system. Research has been conducted on student satisfaction with the TSDCD system (Dougherty, Butler, and Hyde, 2011; Dougherty, Butler, and Vrhovnik, 2013) as well as on administrative considerations in developing and operating a hybrid course delivery model such as the TSDCD system (Dougherty, Butler, and Vrhovnik, in press). However, even from the earliest stages of research the need to “. . . identify the best pedagogical design . . . .” (Dougherty, et al., 2011, p. 553) for operation in the TSDCD system was identified. This current study begins to fulfill that need by giving the educators who taught using the system a structured opportunity to reflect on their teaching and identify the best practices for teaching within the parameters of the TSDCD structure.

The classes these educators taught were linked electronically via a video conferencing system that allowed presentations, lectures, discussions, and videos to be shared electronically in real-time. The instructor was physically present at each site on a rotating basis and was supported by location-designated tutors, with one tutor for each location. The tutors remained with their designated cohort on a permanent basis. In addition to the tutor, most locations had technical support staff in attendance during class sessions. Hence, the TSDCD system was a mixed pedagogical structure that provided the following benefits to adult students: (1) access to a certified graduate program in education, (2) a method of connecting with colleagues across the Emirates, and (3) an exemplar of technology at use in education in a manner that was culturally and socially sensitive and supportive of their academic goals. In the original research on the system (Dougherty, et al., 2011; Dougherty, et al., 2013, and Dougherty, et al., in press) the researchers coined the term “hybrid delivery” but have since settled on the clearer terminology of identifying it as a tele-presence supported distributed course delivery (TSDCD) system. The old term was maintained for the research tool utilized in this study as it had currency among the study participants.
A key rationale for introducing the TSDCD delivery system was to provide academic opportunities to which the target population, Emirati educators, had limited access. Access was an issue for two main reasons, the first being regulations that discouraged on-line, or wholly distance education, and, second, social and cultural circumstances that impacted a majority of those students seeking graduate education in the UAE.

At the time of this study the UAE Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research did not recognize on-line graduate degrees as being valid for career or job advancement for teachers in government schools (MoHESR, 2013). Of the approximately seventy-five students who were in the Master of Education program, 88% were Emirati. Most Emirati professionals work for the government, and almost all of the Emirati students attending the Master of Education program worked in public, government funded schools; hence, this precluded them from taking on-line graduate degrees (Vrhovnik, 2012).

Utilizing technology for course delivery is not new. There are many institutions offering on-line degree programs. For students, it has offered the opportunity to improve their skill sets, obtain certifications and degrees, and continue to honor the social or familial commitments that might have inhibited them from pursuing educational opportunities in the past. However, some learners require more than an on-line program to fulfill their academic needs. They need the presence of an instructor and the support network of a learning community as it might be found in a traditional university class setting. This was true in the context of the UAE and Emirati culture. Students expressed the importance of having both a classroom setting, where they had classmates to interact with, and at least the occasional visit by their instructor (Dougherty et al., 2011; Dougherty et al., 2013; Vrhovnik, G., 2012). Hence, the need for a blended format of course delivery that mixed the technological with the human, and provided the benefits of both systems.

Hijazi , Crowley, Smith, Schafer (2006) defined a “blended” course as a course that united distance learning with face-to-face instruction, the idea being that students being instructed in blended systems will experience the best of both types of instructional delivery approaches. As Dziuban, Hartman and Moskal (2004) explained, blended learning
must be understood as an instructional approach that unites the socialization of the traditional classroom environment with the possibilities and active learning aspects of the online educational medium. In the context of the TSDCD system, this was the case, with students identifying the importance of having an instructor, a tutor, and a set of classmates in their overall satisfaction with the system and with their ability to succeed in this academic milieu while, at the same time, acknowledging the benefits of using the TSDCD system (Dougherty et al., 2011, Dougherty et al., 2013, and Dougherty, Butler, and Vrhovnik, in press).

Regarding the instructional paradigm for such a system, Gill, Parker, and Richardson (2005) and Andrews and Klease (2002) argued for a team approach to the administration of blended classes. These teams would include a lead teacher who was responsible for content delivery, supported by site designated tutors and constant technological support at each instructional location when videoconferencing was utilized. This was the case in the TSDCD system, as it utilized a peripatetic instructor who visited each cohort site in turn, and an on-site tutor who was assigned to the cohort for the duration of the course (Dougherty, et al. 2011).

Garnham and Kaleta (2002) pointed to studies showing that students learned more, did better on examinations, produced better-quality work, and engaged more actively with the teacher in blended courses than in traditional courses. Dziuban et al. (2004) also found that blended courses improved student learning more so than purely online courses. George-Walker and Keeffe (2010) suggested that a mix of blended learning and information and communication technologies can create conditions where students increase their engagement with the content and meet their academic and personal goals. Gillies (2008) reported that students felt that they had more opportunities to ask questions of the instructor, and that there was more group interaction within the class than there would be in a regular university lecture hall. They also felt that the instruction was more personal. It was also reported by Dougherty et al. (2011) and Dougherty et al. (2013) that students developed a sense of togetherness, camaraderie, and shared experience that came about due to their meeting as an individual cohort with fellow students tied into a wider structure of cohorts, all studying in the same program.
Bates and Picard (2005) asserted that class discussions using videoconferencing could be carried out successfully if the instructor was flexible in his or her teaching approach. This flexibility of presentation was a topic of Young (2002), who advised presenting material in a variety of formats to help increase student engagement. Al Harthi (2005), when explaining the best learning environment for students from the United Arab Emirates and the Middle East reminded us that the instructional design must be completely organized and descriptions of course structure, assessment, and target learning goals and expectations should be explained to the students as early as possible in the course. Student perception of the success of video conferencing within the context of the TSDCD system was demonstrated in studies by Dougherty et al. (2011) and Dougherty et al. (2013). Even in light of these identifications of success there were drawbacks to blended course delivery.

According to Lawson et al. (2010) and Dougherty et al. (2011) one challenge to providing a successful blended delivery program involved the possible distraction of students at the remote sites, with increased off-topic discussion and less interaction between the students and the instructor. Issues of student self-management become important when the instructor is not physically present with the students. Andrews and Klease (2002) and Dougherty et al. (2011) recommended strategic staff development to improve faculty and staff understanding of blended delivery in order to meet this challenge and provide what Andrews and Klease (2002) described as a productive and interactive learning environment for students. In the context of the TSDCD system, this would include training both the instructors and the tutors in their respective roles and how to support one another as part of a team (Dougherty, et al. 2011). This provision of training could be important, for the TSDCD system was different from what those who taught in it were used to as educators. According to one respondent from the current study the “pedagogical approach [of the TSDCD system] is different to wholly online learning, or wholly face-to-face learning.”

The TSDCD system utilized tele-presence technology to unite disparate cohorts of students. It provided a dispersed student population the opportunity to interact both together and with the material. The TSDCD system was introduced in April, 2010, and research began on it immediately and primarily for institutional
reasons, wanting to establish the efficacy of the TSDCD system in relation to its clients, the students paying fees to attend courses taught with the system. The success of the system was ascertained via student perceptions of the system and its support for their academic aspirations and goals. Data was collected by surveys and focus groups. The findings (Dougherty, et al., 2011, and Dougherty et al., 2013) were positive, and students who studied in the system identified it as meeting their academic needs and aided in their learning. In 2013, and in response to institutional interest in expanding the use of the TSDCD system to other graduate programs, research was done on the administrative elements involved in the creation and maintenance of such a system (Dougherty et al., in press). This current stage of the research agenda, and the focus of this study, sets as its task identifying the best pedagogical practice for teaching in such a system.

Method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Approx. Yr. of Teaching Experience</th>
<th>Courses taught using the TSDCD System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 1</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>• Advancing Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>• Knowledge, Learning, and Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 3</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>• Research Perspectives and Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 4</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>• Assessing Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 5</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>• New Technologies in Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 6</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>• Leading and Managing Learning Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 7</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>• Transformational Educational Management in the UAE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 8</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>• Research Methods in Educational Contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher 9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Curriculum, Assessment, and Policy Development: the UAE context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Information Technology in Educational Contexts in the UAE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Individualized Program Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Social Justice and Difference</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1: Background of Potential Respondents**

Eight of the nine educators who taught in the TSDCD system were invited to reply to an eleven item on-line survey that was developed by the researchers and for this study. The ninth educator was the lead researcher for this study who recused himself from participation. The general background of each of the eight potential respondents is displayed in Figure 1. This information was generated from discussions with the potential respondents prior to the study.
The procedure was that each participant completed an anonymous online survey that contained eleven items. Of the eleven items, one was a yes or no question and the other ten were open response. The items were

1. In your own words, please describe the hybrid delivery system used in the delivery of the Masters of Education program.
2. What were challenges facing you in teaching within the hybrid delivery format?
3. What were the positive aspects of the hybrid delivery format in your experience?
4. How did the hybrid delivery system support student learning?
5. How did the hybrid delivery system limit student learning?
6. Did you change your teaching style or strategy to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?
7. If no, how was your usual teaching style or strategy applicable to the hybrid delivery format?
8. If yes, how did your teaching style or strategy change to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?
9. What pedagogical strategies that you used worked well to support student learning in the context of the hybrid delivery format?
10. After the experience of teaching using the hybrid delivery format, what strategies would you adopt, or how would you change your strategies, to better serve student learning?
11. At this stage, please add any comments that you have regarding the hybrid delivery system, specifically regarding the experience of teaching within that format.

Six of the eight potential participants had responded to the survey. This represented 75% of the target group.

The researchers have reviewed responses to each of the survey items. From the responses they have generated a suggested pedagogical methodology for use in the TSDCD system. The subsequent results section will give details of the responses from the six teachers. In the discussion session the researchers have further distilled the responses to develop what they determined to be the best pedagogical methodology for the TSDCD system.
The procedure was that each participant completed an anonymous online survey that contained eleven items. Of the eleven items, one was a yes or no question and the other ten were open response. The items

1. In your own words, please describe the hybrid delivery system used in the delivery of the Masters of Education program.
2. What were challenges facing you in teaching within the hybrid delivery format?
3. What were the positive aspects of the hybrid delivery format in your experience?
4. How did the hybrid delivery system support student learning?
5. How did the hybrid delivery system limit student learning?
6. Did you change your teaching style or strategy to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?
7. If no, how was your usual teaching style or strategy applicable to the hybrid delivery format?
8. If yes, how did your teaching style or strategy change to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?
9. What pedagogical strategies that you used worked well to support student learning in the context of the hybrid delivery format?
10. After the experience of teaching using the hybrid delivery format, what strategies would you adopt, or how would you change your strategies, to better serve student learning?
11. At this stage, please add any comments that you have regarding the hybrid delivery system, specifically regarding the experience of teaching within that format.

Six of the eight potential participants had responded to the survey. This represented 75% of the target group. The researchers have reviewed responses to each of the survey items. From the responses they have generated a suggested pedagogical methodology for use in the TSDCD system. The subsequent results section will give details of the responses from the six teachers. In the discussion session the researchers have further distilled the responses to develop what they determined to be the best pedagogical methodology for the TSDCD system.

Before identifying the findings from the study, two visual images from the TSDCD context are provided to help demonstrate the workings of the system for the reader. In Figure 2, the reader can see a screen shot taken from a class session taught in the TSDCD system. To the left is the power point display and to the right are the six cells where each cohort could see each other and themselves. The large cell shows the instructor. All discussion, power-point displays, and video were heard and shown in real-time.

Figure 2: The screen display

Figure 3: A tele-presence enabled classroom

Figure 3 shows a typical classroom setting using one of the two tele-presence enabled classrooms in the university system where the study took place. The other cohorts met in university conference rooms that had video conference systems.
Each class session lasted five hours. Usually a mix of modalities was used for content explication and presentation, as well as a myriad of activities to promote student involvement and learning. To show the structure of a typical five hour class session, a lesson outline as distributed to students for their January 12th, 2013, class is displayed in Figure 4:

---

**Lesson Outline: Saturday, January 12th, 2013 (11:00 am – 4:00 pm)**

At the end of the lesson scholars will be able to

- Paraphrase a definition of a Knowledge Society
- Identify the difference between a Knowledge Society and an Information Society
- Classify the points in which the UAE may be considered a Knowledge Society
- Explain the rites of passage active in the local context and
  - Describe how these rites of passage support the development of a Knowledge Society
- Describe the role that Empathy plays in the development and support of a Knowledge Society.

**Outline:**

1. RSQC²[Recall, Sentence, Question, Connection, and Comment]
2. Announcement: Possible alternative to live Team Presentation
3. The Nature of Knowledge: Video Clip from Daniel Tammet & Activity
4. Video Clips and Discussion Questions: (Assigned as homework from Dec. 15 – we will review your responses)
   - Mishaal Algargawi: The Republic of I and the Federation of Us
   - Mohammed Saeed Harib
5. PPT 3: Knowledge and the Social Construction of Reality
6. Video Clips:
   - Cast Away
   - Lord of the Flies
   - Joseph Campbell
   - Close Encounters
   - The Matrix
7. The Cycle of Life
8. Rites of Passage in the Local Context Graphic Assignment
9. The Development of an Empathetic Civilization
10. CAT for the conclusion of class:
    - Student Generated Test Questions
11. Feedback Request: Gauging interest in a voluntary (not required/ extracurricular) study tour to [another university].

---

**Figure 4: A Typical Lesson Outline for a Class Taught in the TSDCD System**
Each course met for four class sessions of five hours duration. This was augmented by ten hours of tutorial sessions where the individual site tutor met with the cohort as a group or with individual students to work on assessments, help with editing, assist with practice for course presentations, etc.

One of the components of the course structure was the provision of a course website. The program director selected to use Edmodo™. The reasons for selecting Edmodo™ were: (1) it was free, (2) it was secure and inaccessible to casual third parties, and (3) the instructor could open the link for the students on command and had complete control of access. Figure 5 shows a typical Edmodo™ course site.

A benefit to having such a website was that it allowed students to see questions asked by other students and the answers delivered by the instructor, a tutor, or fellow students. This allowed students to feel, electronically as well as physically, that they were part of a learning community and that they had access to that learning community on a recurrent basis for information, reflection, and support. This was
consistent with Fullan’s (2001) dictum of the need to establish such “mechanisms for learning in the daily-ness of organizational life (p. 14).” As he explained, individuals are best able to make significant transitions in thinking and learning by having continuous interactions with others moving through the same educational environment and circumstances. Course websites provided opportunities for this interaction.

Results

What follows is an exposition and analysis of the survey responses collected from the six respondents. Each respondent has been given an identifying title, and will be referred to from this point onward as Respondents A, B, C, D, E, or F. Pronoun usage in the course of this section is random as the surveys were anonymous, and simple syntax errors in the subjects’ quoted responses were edited where appropriate.

Survey Question 1: In your own words, please describe the hybrid delivery system used in the delivery of the [university] Masters of Education program.

The purpose of the question was to qualify the instructors’ understanding of the program and to identify generalities in their descriptions. All six respondents detailed that the system was reliant on video conferencing. A response from Respondent E that discussed the importance of video conferencing to the instructional paradigm is quoted here:

The use of video conferencing is important for three reasons: firstly, it allows small cohorts of students from remoter parts of the UAE access to … post-graduate courses; secondly, it enables students from different parts of the UAE to share their experiences of education in their region and learn from students in different contexts; thirdly, it maximizes the expertise and resources of lecturers and tutors by enabling them to focus on teaching rather than travelling and repeating the same material to small groups of students around the UAE.

Additional areas of discussion included the use of tutors, the peripatetic instructor, and the use of a website as, in the words of Respondent B, “a way to engage students from all cohorts in online discussion.” Regarding the tutors, 83% of the respondents noted their
participation in the delivery paradigm. Thirty-three percent of the respondents explained that the instructor moves from site to site on a rotating basis. The responses indicated a clear and unified understanding of the structure of the TSDCD system by all the respondents. Respondent F indicated that she felt that the students “moved into this mode very easily.” This observation is supported by earlier research into student impressions of the TSDCD system, where 100% of the student respondents stated that the experience of studying within the TSDCD system supporting them in achieving their academic goals (Dougherty et al., 2011, p. 552).

**Survey Question 2: What were challenges facing you in teaching within the hybrid delivery format?**

Regarding the challenges of teaching in the TSDCD system 67% of the respondents mentioned technical issues, specifically, as Respondent B explained, “The video link can, sometimes, be inconsistent and one or two colleges may take time to have access to sound and vision of people in other cohorts and to see learning materials (e.g. Power Points).” Technological failure was a distraction, for example, and maintaining effective technological ties between sites was imperative (Dougherty, et al., 2011; Dougherty, et al. 2013). Respondent F explained, in her teaching experience within the TSDCD system, it was essential to have a technician available so that “glitches could be sorted out quickly . . . .”

Other than the technical challenges, the respondents stated that there were four additional issues in teaching within the TSDCD system: (1) that those who were in the presence of the instructor were more engaged in the class than those at a remote site and, additionally, one respondent felt that the cohort that he was physically with tended to dictate the pace of the class, (2) that many interesting off-camera discussions took place with the instructor during breaks and that those at remote sites did not gain from this interaction, (3) that the structure of delivery inhibited instructor movement during the course of the class, as he or she had to maintain a presence, as Respondent E explained, “within the view of the camera,” and (4) that there was, according to Respondent A, a “limited capacity for more forms of interaction.”
Several of the respondents offered steps taken, or planned, to attempt to ameliorate these circumstances. In the case of the issue of students at remote sites not being as involved in the lesson, Respondent E said that he planned to, “engage all students in different ways and to monitor more carefully the engagement of students who were connected to the class via video link.” It was also mentioned that it was assistive to have a tutor assigned to work with each individual cohort. This was explained in one response to the first survey question, when Respondent A stated that the use of a tutor ensured the “physical presence of an instructor at all times” in the classroom, even when the teacher for the course was at another site. The tutor’s presence could also assist in that the tutor could act as a proxy for the instructor in monitoring and encouraging student interaction. As Respondents C and E stated, the lack of cues from body language and eye contact inhibited their ability to encourage student participation. Added to this, was the cultural factor that many of the students were covered, or wearing a veil in respect to their local traditions, and this limited the instructors’ ability to pick up on physical cues to determine student understanding or comfort levels, especially when dealing with extra-site cohorts. Earlier findings also supported the benefits accrued by having a tutor physically with the cohort at all times, becoming an expert on that group of students, and encouraging their interaction and engagement in class activities when the instructor was at another site (Dougherty et al. 2011, Dougherty et al. 2013, and Dougherty et al. in press).

Having a tutor present at each site was seen as the optimal instructional dynamic, as students valued the opportunity to ask questions and seek clarification of content in the immediacy of the classroom environment rather than wait for the instructor to reply over the video conference system, via e-mail or digital response, or arriving for a site visit (Vrhovnik, 2012). This was confirmed in the TSDCD by Dougherty et al. (2011) and Dougherty et al. (2013). In the current study more than one respondent indicated the importance of having a tutor present. As Respondent A explained, the tutor was able to “guide and clarify content and expectations.”

Regarding the off-camera discussions, Respondent E thought that this was why having the professor “alternate physical locations” was important because, as he explained, “some students felt more comfortable discussing matters face-to-face rather than over video
Several of the respondents offered steps taken, or planned, to attempt to ameliorate these circumstances. In the case of the issue of students at remote sites not being as involved in the lesson, Respondent E said that he planned to, “engage all students in different ways and to monitor more carefully the engagement of students who were connected to the class via video link.” It was also mentioned that it was assistive to have a tutor assigned to work with each individual cohort. This was explained in one response to the first survey question, when Respondent A stated that the use of a tutor ensured the “physical presence of an instructor at all times” in the classroom, even when the teacher for the course was at another site. The tutor’s presence could also assist in that the tutor could act as a proxy for the instructor in monitoring and encouraging student interaction. As Respondents C and E stated, the lack of cues from body language and eye contact inhibited their ability to encourage student participation. Added to this, was the cultural factor that many of the students were covered, or wearing a veil in respect to their local traditions, and this limited the instructors’ ability to pick up on physical cues to determine student understanding or comfort levels, especially when dealing with extra-site cohorts. Earlier findings also supported the benefits accrued by having a tutor physically with the cohort at all times, becoming an expert on that group of students, and encouraging their interaction and engagement in class activities when the instructor was at another site (Dougherty et al. 2011, Dougherty et al. 2013, and Dougherty et al. in press).

In the case of the limitations of movement and the limitations of interaction, Respondent E hoped that the technology would develop in such a way so that the system would be more sensitive to movement and the camera could follow the instructor. He also felt that careful consideration should be given to how the room was set up for classes so that the most could be made of a limited range of camera angles. In the case of interactions, Respondent D felt that “materials and resources needed to be re-developed and then students needed to be proactive with their engagement throughout the duration of the unit -- similar to attendance at on campus studies.” The challenge, he felt was to “develop materials and tasks that require students to be active on the site.” As Respondent A mentioned, when responding to the third survey question, it was imperative that the instructor give attention “to [the] restructuring of the unit so that the focus was on creating interactive learning and interactive delivery... i.e. problem based learning exercises, inquiry method of delivery, group discussion, individual reflection, etc.”

Survey Question 3: What were the positive aspects of the hybrid delivery format in your experience?

Respondent E echoed the different respondents in his discussion of the positive aspects of the TSDCD system:

I found the experience very positive for both the students and me in different ways. For the students, they could benefit from the experience and input of students from different parts of the UAE which stimulated discussion and reflection on theory and practice. They also potentially grew to articulate their
points of view more clearly because they could not rely on 'sense' or 'physicality' in the same way. For me as a teacher, it made me really reflect about how best to plan sessions to ensure the engagement of all students in different ways e.g. hearing each student's point of view on a subject or short video; small group tasks which the groups then had to present back to the whole group; open group discussion.

Respondent A and D identified that this method of delivery allowed for students from different parts of the country to engage with one another. They could, as Respondent D explained, foster “networks outside their own geographic location.” Earlier research found that this point was of importance to students as well (Dougherty et al., 2013). Tied into this aspect of students being part of a wider community was the fact that the system allowed for students to gather in cohorts. Respondent D mentioned that this was “more equitable where students feel part of a group rather than [being] an isolated off-campus student.” Likewise earlier research stated that students valued this membership in an immediate group (Dougherty et al., 2011; Dougherty et al., 2013; Dougherty et al., in press).

Respondent F reflected on the technical aspect of the TSDCD system. She explained that she valued the “high level of technical support provided” as it allowed her to have “confidence that the [class] session would run smoothly.” Her confidence was bolstered by her own initiative of ensuring, “Careful preparation of materials that could easily be managed by tutors at each different site” in the event of system interruptions.

Respondent B identified the financial benefits of the system, but couched them in the context of allowing the program to maintain its viability so that it could, according to him, be “able to create a stronger and deeper learning community in the UAE and in the medium long term provide the professional development that teachers as individuals and the education institutions in the country require.” Finally, Respondent C had this to say about the TSDCD system: “It was a novel, experimental program that used technology as a tool for class based lesson delivery.”

Survey Question 4: How did the delivery system support student learning?
As with prior questions, one subject gave a response that seemed to encapsulate the feelings of the group. This was from Respondent E:

The delivery system supported student learning in a variety of ways. Firstly, it provided them with access to [university] expertise on a regular basis throughout the Masters course (either physically or through video link). Secondly, it exposed them to wider experience by having students from different parts of the education sector in different regions. Thirdly, it necessitated the active involvement of all students because of the conscious effort to involve, engage and listen to the contributions of all students. Fourthly, it encouraged students to articulate more clearly their points of view because they were speaking via video link and often needed to speak clearly to be heard.

Respondent D mentioned the provision of access to educational opportunities, and this same respondent also felt the opportunity to study with other students prevented them from feeling isolated. Adding to this point of students existing in a community, Respondent B felt that the system was, “encouraging a broader range of students to engage and so [fostering] a broader range of understanding of learners and learning contexts in the program.” Respondent B did speculate however that, “for more independent learners the system of delivery is more stimulating, as it assumes that the students have the ability and where-with-all to progress effectively through the program.” This focus on the student was mirrored in Respondent A’s comment that he felt the pedagogy was more student focused and that it was imperative to bring into the lesson an opportunity for students to share their real world experience and relate it to the topics or theories under consideration. He felt that this form of delivery was best suited for “problem based learning which allowed [for] different cultural interpretations and understandings . . . .” Respondent F felt that it was good that students had the opportunity to “discuss the topics with their own tutor, who they knew well, and rehearse their responses, before having to speak to the whole group.”

These findings are supported by other studies that explored student perceptions of the TSDCD system. Students who studied within the TSDCD system felt that the system supported their learning, with
100% of student respondents affirming that the experience had been beneficial to their learning (Dougherty, et al., 2011, p. 552). One of the key components identified as aiding in student learning was the chance to interact with other students from other locals through the use of video conferencing. As one student respondent explained (Dougherty, et al., 2013):

> We are only five here, but imagine, with this chance we can discuss with 20 or more students in three other groups. I think that interaction and collaboration are part of overall knowledge; that adds to your knowledge . . . . So, I think that this has been a great part of this program . . . .” (p. 121).

This student perception was supported by other research. In a study that explored the administrative side of developing and running the TSDCD system, a teacher in the program explained that she thought students were benefiting from getting input from a wider range of course participants through the TSDCD system (Dougherty, et al., in press).

With these positive reflections, there was a caveat, or at least a call for more research. According to Respondent C the system “seemed to support student learning at individual sites, but it isn’t clear how it supported learning across the multiple sites which engaged with this type of delivery system.”

**Survey Question 5: How did the delivery system limit student learning?**

Interestingly there was great disagreement between some of the respondents replying to this question of limitations. This was unlike the other questions and sets of responses. To indicate the level of discrepancy, we have these two examples. The first is from Respondent E:

> In my view the delivery system limited student learning very little. Potentially, students who were not physically with me felt less able to contribute or discuss points they were unsure about. Similarly, I was less able to gauge student understanding. However, I hope that this shortcoming was compensated for in part by lesson planning so that each
student was asked for a contribution. This meant that students could not just 'sit silently at the back and go unnoticed'. Additionally, alternating physical locations was really important so that I could speak to each student face-to-face, listen to any concerns and hopefully address them.

That upbeat assessment may be compared to this one from Respondent C:

Teaching & learning is highly a social and interpersonal process, and as such the hybrid delivery system doesn't allow everyone to fully participate in the process. Students appeared to feel uncomfortable engaging with the impersonal nature of the technology used in delivering the materials.

Respondent B offered an insight that might bridge the gap between these two observations when she identified the fact that some learners are used to a transmission system of learning rather than what she described as a “self-managed approach” to learning. She offered that the use of tutors in each location can help this situation as it allows the tutor to take on a role in facilitating the transition of students from a passive to an active style of learning. Respondent A echoed this concern, noting that some students were not as “visible” or as “participative” in the lessons, and they risked getting “lost within the cohort – especially while they are in video mode [not in the presence of the instructor].” Respondent F also felt that some students were quiet and others were “very quick to leap in and dominate.” She explained that she dealt with this situation using techniques that she also employed in her face-to-face classes.

The students themselves felt that one drawback for the TSDCD system, and one that could limit its educational effectiveness, was that the class was less disciplined when the lecturer was at the other location and they were participating via the video link. As one student explained, “I think the lecturer has more control over the class when he is physically there than when he is giving the lecture thorough videoconference” (Dougherty, et al., 2011, p. 553). Another issue for the students was that that they felt they were more engaged and asked more questions when the lecturer was physically present rather than when he or she was viewed via video conference.
Survey Question 6: Did you change your teaching style or strategy to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?

Five of the respondents affirmed that their teaching style or strategy changed as they taught in the TSDCD system. Only one of the respondents, Respondent D, felt that he made no changes in his teaching style or strategies when instructing in the TSDCD system. The next question was addressed to the latter individual.

Survey Question 7: If no, how was your usual teaching style or strategy applicable to the delivery format?

Respondent D stated, “No, it gave me the opportunity to engage off campus students in an interactive mode of learning where shared knowledge and critical analysis and synthesis were at the forefront of aims and objectives.” This indicated that these elements were active in his regular teaching practice. They illuminate the type of teaching that he felt was suited for the TSDCD system, a methodology that focused on sharing knowledge, rather than transmission, and making use of the students’ abilities to provide analysis and synthesis within the context of education studies. Hence, he felt that he was operating in a seminar-style environment where students were required to engage with the material at an intellectual level.

Survey Question 8: If yes, how did your teaching style or strategy change to accommodate the hybrid delivery format?

The remaining respondents felt that their teaching style or strategy changed in order to accommodate the TSDCD system. Responses focused on providing more opportunities for interaction in the course of the classes, promoting scenarios whereby students were able to meditate on their teaching practices and discuss these in relation to the theories under discussion, establishing set opportunities for reflection and facilitation between groups, and, basically, as Respondent A stated, make the class sessions “activity centered.” Respondent C felt that the limitations of direct interpersonal interaction inherent in the system required that “all of the course participants . . . be actively engaged at all times, thus requiring location based activities at regular intervals during the course of a lecture or specific interaction via video conference channels.”
Respondent B felt that her teaching style was already very discussion based, activity oriented, and geared toward student participation. However, she felt that while teaching within the TSDCD system there were times when she needed to use a “more didactic approach.” She ended her comment by stating that she was “still coming to terms with a good balance in this respect.” Respondent F explained that she had to be more attentive to time during her class sessions, making sure that “enough time was made available to each different site in questioning for feedback.”

Finally we include the following observation in its entirety, where Respondent E discussed the process of planning and preparing for lessons and the structure of a typical lesson:

I had to think more carefully about how I planned sessions to ensure the engagement and involvement of all students. This planning was in two ways. First, I made sure all my lesson planning was done in advance with lesson outlines and materials sent to students in advance. Secondly, it meant the format of each session was varied to involve students in different ways through direct teaching, questioning and response to individuals and the group, individual feedback to a reading or video stimulus, small group and whole group tasks.

Each respondent felt that he or she made use of opportunities for student interaction with their cohorts, the instructor, and the multi-cohort class. These interactions took the form of reflections, questioning and response, individual and group activities, and reactions to media presentations and readings.

Survey Question 9: What pedagogical strategies that you used worked well to support student learning in the context of the hybrid delivery format?

All of the respondents included group work in their lesson plans, and this included small group work, or intra-cohort work. This was then tied in to a class-wide discussion of outcomes. Respondent B would attempt to include group discussions in her lessons, as she explained “As much as possible I encourage inter-cohort and intra-cohort
discussion;” however, she found that certain cohorts generally contributed much more to the discussions than other cohorts.

Respondent D felt that using an approach he called, “teacher as facilitator” was the best method. This allowed him to have the group engage in “shared knowledge building” where they would also use reflection to relate this evolved knowledge to their teaching practice. Respondent A discussed his use of problem based learning activities where students worked together to develop action plans or resolutions to scenarios put to the class by the teacher. This focus on active learning was continued in a Respondent B’s explanation that she tried to first present ideas “through activities before expanding on them through teacher talk . . . ” Respondent F felt that her careful monitoring of time and her attention in making sure that each site was addressed with questions were helpful in making successful class sessions.

In the longest response to Survey Question 9, Respondent E reflected on his practice, concluding that he found “varying the modes of teaching and modes of student engagement very important to maintain the attention of all students.” He attempted to support his teaching with power points and media, so that students “had key points highlighted and reinforced to them through text, image and video.” His final comments supported the general tone of all the responses surveyed:

I found my teaching was less lecture-style as it often is in typical MA courses but was more interactive, taking more of a seminar format where I put questions to the group and asked for feedback from the group. I also incorporated many more small-group tasks where groups could break away, think about a point or example and then share their thoughts or ideas with their peers. This meant students needed to think about how they would articulate their thoughts more as they were presenting regularly to their peers during sessions on both a formal basis as an assignment and informal basis as a class task.

All of the respondents encouraged an active participation on the part of the students. Through group work, discussion, cohort based activities and class-wide (multi-cohort) sessions of feedback and
comment, the emphasis was on keeping all the participants on task and involved. The responses indicate that effort is expected on the part of the student participants toward the goal of having successful class sessions in which learning takes place.

Survey Question 10: After the experience of teaching using the hybrid delivery format, what strategies would you adopt, or how would you change your strategies, to better serve student learning?

The responses focused on strategies involving assessment, summations and class practice, discussion, activities and their specific forms, and planning. Regarding assessments, Respondent A wanted to build a formative assessment task suited for the intense delivery structure. Respondent D, spurred by student requests, wanted to develop a “matrix or outline” for assessments, but worried that that would place undue limitations on student work. One subject said that he would review the efficacy of the essay as an assessment strategy in the TSDCD system. Regarding the essay, one respondent speculated on the possibility of using peer editors from one cohort to work with peer editors from another cohort, and tied this in with encouraging the cohorts to be more involved with one another.

In relation to class practice, one respondent would offer a more comprehensive summary of key points each class. Respondent D, on this issue of class practice, suggested this approach toward improving student comprehension of the lesson objectives and key points of learning by using available technology:

Use more recorded sessions and on line workshops to emphasize the focus of units and answer FAQs in person rather than relying on students to read. This would be adding to a more personalized approach and an auditory outline.

Respondent C felt that the TSDCD delivery format did not lend itself to “adaptive strategies” but that, none-the-less she felt it required group work to “maintain intrinsic student motivation.” Respondent B felt that the key was maintaining what he termed, a “judicious mix” of activities and discussion, paying close attention to time limits in all cases, and working to encourage participation from more reserved cohorts. Respondent E felt that the experience of teaching in the TSDCD has influenced his teaching even when he was teaching
within a traditional delivery format, as he explained, “I have also had to think much more about engaging students in different ways and this is something that I now do as part of my practice in courses which do not use this format of delivery.”

On the matter of planning and preparation, Respondent E felt he had to have the lesson plan, activities, and readings, etc., ready to send out to students and tutors ahead of time, forcing him to be “much more rigorous and detailed.” This was necessary to ensure that all the students got the most out of the class sessions. This was also a concern of Respondent F, who felt that it was necessary to have a well organized structure to each lesson with each segment of the class time being specified ahead of time. On a final note, Respondent D said that the experience of teaching in the TSDCD system encouraged him to reflect on his own practice by using student feedback.

**Survey Task 11:** At this stage, please add any comments that you have regarding the hybrid delivery system, specifically regarding the experience of teaching within that format.

There were five responses to this optional task. Respondent A focused more on his enjoyment of working with the students, but did reflect on the TSDCD system, what he termed its “variety” and getting to know the tutors. He mentioned that the system was “well organized and managed” so that he could focus on his classroom practice and this gave him “a sense of confidence in teaching.” Further discussing the system itself and its technology, another respondent wished for a more “sensitive” video conferencing system. She wanted one that would automatically focus on those speaking and would allow for the teacher to be more mobile in the classroom. Respondent C felt that the delivery system was best utilized for projecting guest speakers from distant locations, but that as a lesson delivery system was limited in providing academic and “interpersonal” engagement in and among the disparate cohorts.

Respondent D related that he felt that the system was more demanding than on campus lectures, and intimated that this demand was placed on the educator in that he did not have all the students in one lecture hall but dispersed. This required the educator to relate his teaching to a wide and diverse range of student needs, and he felt that this was, in relation to the students’ learning, “better than [a] lecture theater.”
However, he felt that the “depth of knowledge gained by students” was exciting, especially as it involved students from a “large range of settings.” He enjoyed seeing the growth of students across the range of settings and this growth coming from individuals who, if they did not have access to the TSDCD system, might “otherwise not access higher ed.” This same respondent did say that he felt, in relation to using the TSDCD system, he had to update his own information technology (IT) skills. Finally, Respondent F stated that she found the teaching using the TSDCD system was “challenging” but that she believed that “it has proved successful to providing access to higher education that the students in the more remote regions would not have without this delivery system.”

### Discussion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remote cohorts less engaged (cohorts without the instructor on-site)</td>
<td>- Monitor student engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Off-camera discussions with the instructor not available to all cohorts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inhibition of movement by instructor during class</td>
<td>- Develop scenarios to use the tutor as a facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited capacity for more forms of interaction in the TSDCD</td>
<td>- Deliver materials and lesson plans prior to the lesson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Give opportunities for cohorts to work with other cohorts</td>
<td>- Make the class activity-centered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Make the class activity-centered</td>
<td>- Use a mix of activities to vary the pacing of the class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Use a mix of activities to vary the pacing of the class</td>
<td>- Make content reflective of local context and experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Absorb this habit into the flow of the class by having students “report out” on discussions that take place during breaks</td>
<td>- Maintain a peripatetic instructor model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Engage in shared knowledge building</td>
<td>- Use a website for class interactions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Absorb this habit into the flow of the class by having students “report out” on discussions that take place during breaks</td>
<td>- Use an inter-cohort and intra-cohort discussion model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Follow strict time-limits</td>
<td>- Follow strict time-limits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Engage in shared knowledge building</td>
<td>- Use problem-based learning activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Absorb this habit into the flow of the class by having students “report out” on discussions that take place during breaks</td>
<td>- Use activities to introduce key concepts prior to teacher explication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Organize the desks and materials to maximize screen presence</td>
<td>- Plan lessons to encourage student interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Make the lesson student centered</td>
<td>- Encourage the tutors to assist students in being more proactive during the lesson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Use the teacher as facilitator model</td>
<td>- Use problem-based learning activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Work with IT support to address technical solutions</td>
<td>- Plan group work opportunities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 6: Teaching in the TSDCD System: Challenges and Solutions**
As a method of distilling the responses, the researchers returned to the four challenges in teaching in the TSDCD stem that were enumerated by the teachers in response to Survey Question 1. They then reviewed the subjects’ responses to generate solutions and methodologies that the teachers found to address each of the challenges. These items are shown in Figure 6 above.

The research question directing this study sought to find the best pedagogical practice for teaching in such a system. The findings gave a clear indication of the teaching practice that best suited the TSDCD system. From the elements in Figure 6 we can discern a pattern of teaching practice that focuses on the teacher as both a facilitator and delegator. Likewise we can interpret these findings as an indication of the ideal teacher-type for such a program, as the teacher’s responsibilities extend beyond the realm of the instructor and include elements of managerial competence.

The teacher must organize the structure of each lesson and the topics and method of presentation for each class. He or she controls the lesson agenda and the structure of each class session. However, it is imperative that the instructor be ready to delegate responsibility for the facilitation of inter-cohort and on-site activities and discussions to the tutor. The instructor must be cognizant of the benefits of having a tutor in the room with the cohort and must establish both a professional rapport and a professional trust with the tutors. Tutors should be a conduit for information about whether the cohort members are grasping the information offered, and a catalyst and facilitator for student interaction within the cohort and from the cohort to the entire class.

The ideal instructor for the TSDCD system must be hyper organized. He or she must be willing and able to provide course and class materials and the lesson outline to students ahead of time so that they might be prepared for each class session. He or she must be a skilled diagnostician of student understanding and class moods. While a careful developer of lesson and course plans, he or she must also be willing to be flexible and capable of orchestrating discussions, student input, and adjusting lessons in response to student feedback. The instructor must be technologically aware and able to appreciate the benefits and limitations of the video conference system. He or she
must be able to maintain a class website and skilled in using it to foster another component of a learning community.

The instructor must be a capable manager of professionals. He or she will be responsible for not only student learning, but the direction of the tutors and IT specialists who also work within the program. A good communicator and sensitive overseer, he or she will establish tasks, communication networks, and be open to, and encourage, feedback from both the tutors and the IT specialists in support of course improvement and student success.

The teaching must be student focused, activity and project driven, and aware of the local context and the personal and professional experiences of the students. It must foster opportunities for reflection and discussion across the spectrum of sites. There must be opportunities for intra-cohort dialog and interaction. The value of the tutor as an assistant to learning must be recognized. The teacher must strive to inculcate a proactive class environment where students freely participate. Finally, the teacher must carefully monitor, with the help of the tutor, student understanding and comfort with the learning process.

**Conclusion**

This study reviewed the informed opinions of educators who have taught Master of Education courses using the TSDCD system in the UAE, in a public university system, to as many as six cohorts at one time over the course of approximately seventy-five class sessions. The study addressed the matter of teaching within the TSDCD system, and the researchers endeavored to determine the best pedagogical practice to use when teaching under such circumstances. The findings indicated a teaching practice best suited for the TSDCD system. It is a template that can be followed for the TSDCD system or can inform the teaching practice of any educator working within distance education modalities whether these be hybrid systems such as the one under consideration in this study or the massive open on-line courses (MOOCs) that are starting to populate the academic landscape. When an educator faces the challenge of projecting himself or herself into the digital ether of a pan-site classroom he or she may refer to this template for a course of action. It was generated from educators
experienced in maneuvering in this complex, technologically imbued, educational milieu.

References


A Societal Differentiation Theory from a Phenomenological Point of View: Value Dilemmas as Core Characteristic of Modern Societies

Christian ETZRODT

Abstract

The aim of this paper is to analyze differentiation theory without relying on the system concept, because this concept has a questionable methodological status. The replacement of the system concept with an interaction concept allows a completely new approach to the phenomenon of social differentiation, because interaction types are structurally related to value dilemmas. However, whereas such value dilemmas are not recognized in pre-modern societies, they become obvious in modern societies. The fact that we have lost the illusion of order in modern societies leads to the phenomenon of differentiation into advocates of different values in the domains of economics, sociology, and political science.

Usually phenomenological sociologists have the aim to analyze the taken-for-granted life-world without referring to the existence of a social structure (Abercrombie et al. 2006: 291). Mostly this approach led to a microscopic analysis of the subjective stream of consciousness or of the interaction between a small group of actors. And although I believe that such studies have an important value, I have always felt that a phenomenological approach can also be used for the analysis of macro-problems. I will try to show this by discussing differentiation theory, which is an important part of functionalist macro-theories,

---

1 The foundation of phenomenological sociology is Alfred Schutz’s mundane reduction (which a priori accepts the existence of the life-world) and not the more radical transcendental reduction of Edmund Husserl (which questions everything except the individual stream of consciousness).

2 I am not the first phenomenologist who is doing this. Jean-Paul Sartre was applying a phenomenological approach to macro-phenomena like colonialism and capitalism (Barber 2012: 638).
A Societal Differentiation Theory from a Phenomenological Point of View

from a phenomenological point of view. In order to do this, I have to break with some conventions of the more traditional phenomenologists. I am not going to analyze the life-history of one person or the life-world of a homogeneous group, but I will treat the theoretical discourses in economics, sociology, and political science as the life-world of these social scientists. I think that this is justifiable from a phenomenological point of view, because the theories of those social scientists are as much based on their experiences as the shared ideal-types of actors in everyday life. The fact that these theories are usually more elaborated than the life-worldly ideal-types does not change the point that they are still an image (the phenomenon) of reality (the noumenon). And therefore, they should be accessible to a phenomenological analysis.³

I start with a discussion of the methodological problems of traditional differentiation theories. I will shortly explain the advantage of using the interaction concept instead of the system concept as the reference point for an analysis of the phenomenon of differentiation. I will continue with an introduction of basic value dilemmas classified into three interaction types. And finally, I am going to analyze economic, social, and political theories regarding their standpoint in relation to those value dilemmas. Here I am presenting the results of my phenomenological analysis of the differentiation of the social scientists’ life-worlds, which stands in sharp contrast to a functionalist interpretation of the phenomenon of differentiation.

1. Methodological problems of traditional differentiation theories

Traditionally two dimensions of social differentiation are distinguished: the dimensions of the roles and the dimension of the social subsystems (Schimank 2007: 71). The differentiation of roles describes the process of an increasing division of labor in modern societies, whereas the thesis of the differentiation of subsystems in the sense of a functional differentiation claims that the functional unity of

³ Schutz argued that the life-world can be investigated by social scientists, “because the social scientist constructs the constructions of everyday actors, who, since they already operate with constructions of the constructions of others, already function as social scientists, though lacking the disciplined, scientific attitude” (Barber 2012: 634). And I am now treating economists, sociologists, and political scientists as everyday actors in their scientific life-worlds.
religion, family, polity, and economy vanishes during the process of modernization and that each of these subsystems develops its own organizational criteria. And as a result the media of exchange as well as the values start to differ between those subsystems. However, this does not imply that the subsystems can exist autonomously, but rather that each subsystem has to contribute to the survival of the society as a whole. In other words, the dissolution of the unity leads to more, and not to less, interdependency (Tyrell 2008: 99).

The thesis of functional differentiation in modern societies has serious shortcomings, which are basically related to the questionable methodological status of the main concept used: the system concept. The system concept is not useful as a scientific construction of the first order (scientific description of reality), because it is not clear how to prove the existence of systems and of their characteristics. Karl Popper (1979: xxviii; 1989: 39; 2002: 48, 347) demanded that theories about reality should forbid some events in order to make it possible to test prognoses deduced out of those theories against observation statements about reality. But the system concept does not forbid anything, therefore it can only be described as an untestable concept, which is useless for scientific research.

Furthermore, the system concept is also not useful as a scientific construction of the second order (scientific descriptions of life-worldly descriptions of reality), because the way sociologists use the term “system” is totally unrelated to the common-sense usage of the same term. Alfred Schutz (1943: 147f.; 1953: 34) demanded of scientific constructs of the second order that they must fulfill the postulate of adequacy. This postulate requires that “each term used in a scientific system referring to human action must be so constructed that a human act performed within the life-world by an individual actor in the way indicated by the typical construction would be reasonable and understandable for the actor himself, as well as for his fellow-men” (Schutz 1943: 85). But since the system concept of system theory is not compatible with the common-sense concept of non-sociologists, it can hardly be regarded as a good tool for investigating the life-world of real actors.

As a consequence, it becomes impossible to test the truth content of the thesis of functional differentiation, because it relies on the system concept as central term, which is neither useful as a scientific
construction of the first order nor as a scientific construction of the second order. The distinction of the subsystems of economy and polity seems to be arbitrary, because it neither reflects the reality nor the life-worldly construction of “economy” and “polity”. Are, for example, the actions of a Wall Street-lobbyist, who tries to implement a beneficial regulatory environment for banks, part of the economy or part of the polity? Another often cited example shows the arbitrariness of this theory. Many differentiation theorists used the case of the separation of household from working place during the industrial revolution as evidence for the functional differentiation of the family and the economy (Tyrell 2008: 87). However, every economics student learns in the first semester that the separation of household and working place does not lead to such a functional differentiation, because the household (and therefore the family) is an important actor as consumer in the economy. From this standpoint the thesis of the differentiation of subsystems appears to be pure speculation, which is not open to scientific analysis.

2. Interaction problems and value conflicts in modern cultures

In order to avoid the methodological problems associated with the system concept, I will start my analysis of the differentiation phenomenon using the interaction concept. Interaction types are easily empirically accessible as scientific constructions of the second order (scientific descriptions of life-worldly descriptions of reality). For example, students who share an apartment together will describe the often made experience that everybody wants a clean kitchen but that nobody wants to clean it in a way which is compatible with the prisoner's dilemma in game theory. It is possible to determine the interaction type in the way it is perceived by the actors by way of interviews. However, this does not imply that this type of interaction is also a correct description of reality. But even as a scientific construction of the first order the interaction concept is not entirely useless. For example, Harold Garfinkel (1963: 197ff.) showed in his crisis experiments that it is possible to make the taken-for-granted perception of an interaction type open to question. This method does not allow the identification of the noumenon, but it can lead to falsifications of mistaken perceptions. For example, a female student who is always cleaning the kitchen for the flat-sharing community, because she is used to do it at her home, might realize in a crisis experiment that she is exploited by the other students. The crisis
experiment would break the habitual perception and would reveal the underlying dilemma structure of the situation.

As the result of this change of focus from the system concept to the interaction concept, mine central thesis is that the modernization process led to a permanent differentiation of interaction problems (coordination, distribution, and cooperation problems). In contrast to the thesis of the functional differentiation of subsystems, my is not a theory of the first order (description of reality) but a theory of the second order (description of the life-worldly perception of reality). In this sense my approach is a phenomenological one, because I am interested in the phenomenon as it is described in the life-world of social scientists and not in reality itself. My research question is therefore not how the subsystems of the economy, polity, and society became differentiated, but the differentiation of economic, political, and sociological theories, which are focusing on distribution problems in the economy, cooperation problems in politics, and coordination problems with in social groups. I would even go so far to say (and this stands in sharp opposition to the thesis of functional differentiation) that the modernization process did not cause any significant change in reality at all. Coordination, distribution, and cooperation problems do not only exist in modern social groups, but also in traditional ones. But these interaction problems are usually not perceived in traditional social groups, because all actors follow the taken-for-granted rituals of the groups (cf. Zijderveld 1970: 36). The fundamental difference between pre-modern institutions and modern institutions is that the latter ones force the actors to choose and as a result promote continuous change. For example, the shift from monarchy with its taken-for-granted rules of inheritance towards democracy and elections introduced the element of choice into political institutions. And the replacement of medieval guilds with competitive markets liberated actors in economic institutions. Therefore the decisive characteristic of modernity is that we have lost the illusion of order, because the permanent pressure to choose in modern institutions challenges our taken-for-granted beliefs. We could not lose the order itself, because we have no reason to believe that such an order exists in reality (cf. Barber 2012: 636).

2.1. Distribution problems in economic theories

The first problem which I want to discuss is the distribution problem.
Distribution problems are characterized in economic theories by a fundamental contradiction between the values of equality and efficiency (cf. Okun 1975). For example, if a cake is distributed equally to two actors, although one of the actors only wants to eat a quarter of the cake and the second actor would like to eat three quarters, then the egalitarian solution would lead to waste (because one quarter of the cake would perish). The central problem of the egalitarian solution is that the distribution of resources has no relationship to the needs of the actors. Actors with big needs (e.g. disabled people) would receive much less than necessary, whereas actors with little needs would receive too much. On the other hand, if the price mechanism in a competitive market would replace the egalitarian solution, then this problem would disappear. Actors would demand only so much of a good as is necessary to satisfy their (expected) needs under the given budget restriction. Resources would not be wasted in this case. However, the price mechanism does not guarantee an equal distribution of resources and in most cases leads to a very unequal distribution.

In other words, there is no distribution mechanism which can fulfill both values, of equality and efficiency, at the same time. The more an institution tries to achieve equality, the less efficient it will be. And the more an institution supports efficiency, the less equality will be present in it. However, although it is impossible to create an institution that fulfills both values, it is possible to build institutions which fulfill neither equality nor efficiency.

Considering this fundamental value dilemma in distribution problems, the history of economic theories does not any longer appear to be a history of scientific progress but rather a historical battle over the right value (see Table 1 and consider the development of economic theories presented; negative connections between the schools are highlighted in broken lines). The foundation of modern economic theory (which begins with the Classical School) by Adam Smith emphasized efficiency (Landreth/Colander 2002: 73; cf. Rashid 1998: 15) and was constructed as an attack on the previously dominant economic theories of Mercantilism and the Physiocratic School (Mann 1976: 686f.; Inkster 1989: 92). The Classical School was the first theory that advocated liberalized free and competitive markets and an optimal allocation of resources (Landreth/Colander 2002: 73, 82; cf. Singh 1959: 114). However, what is not so well known is that Adam Smith
designed his economic theory in such a way that it would be compatible with his Calvinist values (Etzrodt 2008b: 65-71; 2010: 42f.; cf. Viner 1972: 82). Modern economic theory is the result of a transfer of economic principles from a Catholic context (in which efficiency was traditionally unimportant) into a Calvinist context.

Table 1: Historical development of the presentation of the distribution problem in economics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Main Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mercantilism</td>
<td>Trade as zero-sum game (neither equality nor efficiency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physiocratic</td>
<td>Static economy based on agriculture (equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classical</td>
<td>Ascetic actors in a dynamic economy (efficiency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marxism</td>
<td>Systematic market failure &amp; theft (equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keynesianism</td>
<td>Cyclical market failure &amp; welfare states (equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neo-Classical</td>
<td>Equilibrium of supply and demand &amp; marginal utility (efficiency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monetarism</td>
<td>Government failure &amp; laissez faire markets (efficiency)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the second half of the 19th century the orthodoxy of the classical school was heavily criticized by Karl Marx for its total neglect of the value of equality (although Marx was hiding his values behind his scientific analysis; cf. Löwith 1932: 66; VanDeVeer 1972/73: 370; Mandel 1972: 10; Ollman 1976: 48; Husami 1980: 45, 63; Tool 1982: 1080). He believed that a capitalist economy could not survive in the long run, because of the falling rate of profit, the increasing severity of economic crisis, capital concentration, and the impoverishment of the
large majority of the population (Gillman 1958: 1). He furthermore regarded the unequal distribution of resources and power in the society as exploitation and therefore challenged the morality of placing such high value on efficiency (cf. Elster 1986: 92). It took not long for the advocates of efficiency to respond to this dangerous criticism (cf. Blaug 1997: 286; Landreth/Colander 2002: 275), by rejecting the labor theory of value of the classical school, which was also to be found at the foundation of Karl Marx’s argument (Blaug 1997: 281f.). This shift from the labor theory of value to a marginal utility analysis and the development of the Neo-Classical School however did not change the policy implication that free markets are held to be the most efficient institutions (Blaug 1997: 277; Bruce/Grant 2007: 213).5

The next attack on the value of efficiency was launched by a group of economists centered around John Maynard Keynes, who analyzed economic phenomena with the tools of the Neo-Classical School. However, by introducing more realistic assumptions, these economists came to conclusions which contradicted the wisdom of several classical beliefs (cf. Blaug 1997: 646f.). For example, Piero Sraffa pointed out that economies of scale—unit costs of production fall with increasing scale of production—could lead to natural monopolies (Bruce/Grant 2007: 323). And Joan Robinson showed that a labor-market monopsony—e.g. a company which is “the only employer in town”—will create patterns of exploitation (Bruce/Grant 2007: 332ff.). The Keynesians thought that cyclical market failures can be best countered by active governments and well developed welfare states (Bruce/Grant 2007: 429), which changed the emphasis from efficiency to equality (Schumpeter 1994: 1171; cf. Blaug 1997: 646). The Monetarists’ reply to this conclusion was that politicians cannot be trusted and that therefore government failure would be even worse

---

4 Mark Blaug admits that conservative economists used the new marginal utility theory to attack Marxist thoughts. But he denies that this was the cause for the development of the theory. He describes it as ideologically neutral. However, Blaug does not separate the question why somebody developed a theory from the question why it became accepted by mainstream economics.

5 In order to be fair, Alfred Marshall was not neglecting the problems of inequality or laissez-faire markets (Schumpeter 1994: 765; cf. Blaug 1997: 286f.). But I think that it cannot be disputed that he valued efficiency more than equality.
than market failures, which turned back the emphasis to efficiency (Landreth/Colander 2002: 400).

Economic theorists could not find a consensus concerning the distribution problem, because the fundamental value dilemma between efficiency and equality is unsolvable. They could not agree with each other, because they had different priorities of values.

### 2.2. Coordination problems in sociological theories

A similar picture can be drawn for the description of coordination problems in sociological theories. The fundamental value dilemma in coordination problems is rooted in the contradiction of the values of autonomy (focus on the individual) and harmony (focus on the group). The increasing division of labor led to a differentiation of experience of everyday life. For example, the everyday experiences of members of an agricultural community are only slightly different over relatively long periods of time. Men and women work together on the farm and are confronted with similar problems. On the other hand, the everyday experiences of the members of a modern social group will diverge significantly from those of earlier times and from each other. The everyday experiences of couples will not have much in common anymore, if they are not in the same profession. But even among members of the same profession the specialization has increased so much that the experiences are not compatible any longer.

The first effect of the differentiation of everyday life experiences in modernity is a strengthening of the autonomy of the individual (cf. Luhmann 1965: 48, n. 1; Tyrell 2008: 62). Not only the plurality of career paths (for example, the choice between banker and social worker) but also the plurality of life styles (for example, the banker who drives on his Harley Davidson to work, or the social worker who goes in his suit to the theater) allows for the design of an individual personality by each individual. The large number of different everyday experiences is the source for the creation of unique identities. On the other hand, members of traditional social groups are rarely confronted with deviant behavior and therefore do not even get the idea that they can deviate from the taken-for-granted rituals (cf. Zijderveld 1970: 36).

The second effect of this differentiation process is a loss of harmony
in the social group. Alfred Schütz pointed out that actors have a chance to understand each other sufficiently, only if they refer to a shared stock of ideal-types (Schutz 1932: 170, 225), which are derived from everyday life experiences (Schutz 1953: 7; Lachowska 1980: 47). However, the shared stock of ideal-types of two actors varies with the degree of anonymity (cf. Grathoff 1977: 73). Two good friends who have experienced many things together share more ideal-types as compared to strangers who can only rely on the standardized stock of ideal-types. But this standardized stock of ideal-types in a social group will necessarily shrink beginning the moment that everyday life experiences start to become more and more differentiated (Luckmann 1975: 14; cf. Zijderveld 1970: 39). As a result, the probability of interaction failures and conflicts will increase, and the harmony in the social group will suffer. In other words, modernity strengthened the autonomy of the individuals, but at the same time weakened the harmony in the group. Harmony and autonomy are therefore conflicting aims in coming to terms with coordination problems.

Table 2: Historical development of the presentation of the coordination problem in sociology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>JOHN LOCKE</th>
<th>ADAM SMITH</th>
<th>THOMAS HOBBES</th>
<th>J.-M. DE MAISTRE</th>
<th>KARL MARX</th>
<th>H. SPENCER</th>
<th>EMILE DURKHEIM</th>
<th>T. PARSONS</th>
<th>MAX WEBER</th>
<th>ALFRED SCHÜTZ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>social contract</td>
<td></td>
<td>God’s invisible</td>
<td>social contract</td>
<td>God’s order</td>
<td>alienation</td>
<td>evolution</td>
<td>anomic</td>
<td>AGIL scheme</td>
<td>bureaucratization</td>
<td>understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(autonomy)</td>
<td></td>
<td>hand (aut. &amp; har.)</td>
<td>(harmony)</td>
<td>(harmony)</td>
<td>(autonomy)</td>
<td>(auton. &amp; harm.)</td>
<td>(harmony)</td>
<td>(auton. &amp; harm.)</td>
<td>(autonomy)</td>
<td>(harmony)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Also the history of sociological theories can be interpreted as a search for and battle over the right values (see Table 2). However, the front lines are not as clear as in the case of economic theory. One reason for this is a much larger fragmentation of sociological theories, which never led to a development of a mainstream sociological theory. Another reason is the denial of the contradiction between the values of harmony and autonomy in the Anglo-Saxon (Protestant) sociological tradition. After the dispute of the Catholic Thomas Hobbes and the Calvinist John Locke over the correct meaning of the social contract (Hobbes defended the idea that the king should define the right interpretation of the Bible [harmony] whereas Locke advocated religious pluralism and freedom [autonomy]), Anglo-Saxon sociologists disguised their strong support for autonomy by claiming that this value would not reduce the harmony in the social group. Adam Smith, Herbert Spencer, George Herbert Mead, and Talcott Parsons all belong in this group of social scientists, although each gave very different explanations of how this contradiction can be overcome.

Smith’s answer was God’s invisible hand (Viner 1984: 114), which creates the harmony in the group, although each autonomous individual had only his/her self-interests in mind (Smith 1976: 456; Macfie 1959: 211f.; Gray 1976: 157). Spencer saw the solution in the form of the evolution into an individualistic harmonious society. For him, competition was the driving force behind the progressive differentiation within societies, which led to the evolution of compulsory cooperation into liberal societies with spontaneous cooperation (Callinicos 1999: 109f.). Mead, on the other hand, resolved the contradiction between harmony and autonomy in the self, which he regarded as a result of an internal dialogue between two aspects of the personality: the “me”—the role expectations of the other actors (harmony; Joas 1980: 117; Reynolds 1987: 61)—and the “I”—the element of freedom that allows the actor to choose (autonomy; Mead 1934: 117). And finally Parsons gave each of the contradicting values their own place in his AGIL scheme. For example, in the AGIL model of the social system, the AG-part (“adaptation” in the economy and “goal-attainment” in the polity)

---

6 I have shown elsewhere that Mead’s solution is not convincing, because his ability to explain creativity and social change is quite limited (Etzrodt 2008a).
represent the autonomous elements in the society, whereas the IL-part ("integration" in the societal community and "latency" in the socialization process) guarantee the harmony in the society.\footnote{Of course, the inclusion of contradictory values into a classificatory system does not resolve the contradiction between these values.}

On the other hand, the front lines in the Continental European debate were more obvious. The French Catholic de Maistre rejected in the aftermath of the French Revolution all the ideas of the (Protestant/Atheist) Enlightenment that emphasized the autonomy of the individual. Instead he demanded that people should follow God’s plan for them (Zeitlin 2001: 53). Their task should be the realization of a harmonious society. This phase of Conservatism in Continental Europe provoked a sharp reaction in the young Karl Marx. Under the influence of the New Hegelians he developed his theory of alienation (cf. Lichtheim 1964: 44; Ollman 1976; Palumbo/Scott 2005: 42). His thesis was that the suppressive power of the economy would not allow human beings to become autonomous in the real sense (Marx 1973: 158; 1975: 274, 284; 1996: 639; Gurley 1984: 111). In order to overcome alienation it would be necessary to abolish the division of labor (O’Brien 1981: 18; cf. Marx 1998: 807). It is interesting to note that the young Marx did not care much about harmony.

Émile Durkheim, in his response to Karl Marx, replaced again the value of autonomy with the value of harmony. Yes, it is true that Durkheim thought that a right mixture between autonomy and harmony would be the best solution for his time (Bésnard 1993: 173; Davies/Neal 2000: 36), but in the current capitalist society he identified anomie—a lack of harmony—and not fatalism—a lack of autonomy (cf. Iga/Ohara 1967: 60)—as the main problem of modernity (Durkheim 1897: 224, 416, 450; Watts Miller 1996: 110). Where Marx saw not enough autonomy, Durkheim was afraid of too much freedom (Thom 1984: 26; Lukes 1990: 81; cf. Schaff 1977: 208f.). The second strong attack on Karl Marx came from Max Weber. Weber did not disagree with the preference for autonomy of the young Marx but rather disagreed with his analysis that the capitalist market is the most important for autonomy. Weber came to the conclusions that (1.) the bureaucratization of public and private organizations would be more dangerous by far (Weber 1924: 414; 1971: 352) and (2.) that only in a free market could the autonomy of the individual survive

In the next developments, Max Weber’s writings were again attacked in the following by Alfred Schutz, who criticized Weber for a lack of a deep analysis of the problem of intersubjective understanding (Grathoff 1978: 395; Khairy 1986: 131). Schutz’s solution to this problem was that actors can understand each other sufficiently, if they are referring to a shared stock of knowledge (Schutz 1932: 170, 225), which is stored in their life-world. Although this solution does not neglect the value of autonomy (since the ideal-types are created subjectively by each actor; Schutz/Luckmann 1979: 147, 154; Zaner 1961: 74), it clearly emphasizes the value of harmony (only if actors have similar experiences, will they create similar ideal-types; cf. Schutz 1953: 7; Zaner 1961: 84ff.). The more the harmony in a group erodes, the lower the probability that actors in anonymous interactions understand each other.

It is noteworthy at this point that most of the advocates of the value of autonomy were Protestants, whereas the value of harmony was mostly supported by Catholics and Jews.

2.3. Cooperation problems in political ideologies

Finally, cooperation problems can be best understood as a combination of coordination and distribution problems. Therefore, the value dilemmas in cooperation problems could be analyzed as different combinations of the values of equality vs. efficiency and harmony vs. autonomy. Political theories or ideologies can now be classified according to their value choices (see Table 3).

Table 3: Historical development of the presentation of the cooperation problem in politics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>regulation of coordination problems</th>
<th>regulation of distribution problems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>strong (harmony)</td>
<td>weak (equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weak (autonomy)</td>
<td>strong (harmony/equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(harmony/equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>weak (autonomy/equality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>strong (harmony/efficiency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(harmony/efficiency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>weak (autonomy/efficiency)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 The arrows describe the historical development of the political ideologies (starting with traditionalism and ending with fascism).
The original, traditional social order was based on the values of harmony and equality. In Western Europe this was the Catholic order of the Middle Ages. In this sense it is not a surprise anymore that Catholic social scientists defended these values. With the Reformation and the development of the Enlightenment this picture changed. Supporters of liberalism started to demand human rights in order to protect the individual from the state (autonomy) and economic freedom (efficiency; cf. Ball/Dagger 2006: 51). As a consequence of the nightmares of the French Revolution the ideas of the Enlightenment lost a lot of their appeal. The counter-reaction was the development of the conservative movement. The conservatives wanted to stabilize the social order (harmony; Fenske et al. 2008: 415f.), but a part of this group actually had no problem with efficiently organized markets. This approach—later called neoconservatism—became a dominant political force in the 20th century (Ball/Dagger 2006: 113; Heywood 2007: 88). The most important advocates of this group were Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher.

With the industrialization and the democratization of Western societies the social question became more and more important. This led to the establishment of the third modern political ideology: socialism (with its variations of social democracy and communism). Socialism is the exact opposite of neo-conservatism. Regulation is demanded for the economy in order to achieve equality, but autonomy in social questions is emphasized (e.g. same-sex marriages). Finally, the failure of each of these modern political ideologies to create a perfect society led in the 1930’s to a strengthening of authoritarian ideas. In Europe and Latin America these took the form of fascist movements which rejected the Anglo-Saxon model of modernity with its emphasis on democracy and capitalism (cf. Fenske et al. 2008: 520; Heywood 2007: 213f.). On the other hand, in Islamic countries the unsatisfactory effects of all Western ideologies therein let to a revival of religious fundamentalism (Ball/Dagger 2006: 286ff.; Heywood 2007: 296).

Is it possible to solve this political conflict? No, it is obviously not, because there are no perfect solutions for the coordination and the distribution problems. The fundamental value dilemmas present within these interaction problems make it impossible to find a solution.
that everyone can accept. There is no perfect social order in modernity, because individuals have different value preferences. Each approach to social order produces its own problems.

3. Conclusion

The value dilemmas present in the coordination, distribution, and cooperation problems do exist in every society. But whereas these value dilemmas are usually not perceived in traditional social groups, the illusion of order is lost in modern societies. The recognition of these dilemmas has been fueling the development of modern theories in the social sciences. In contrast to the common interpretation of the history of theories in the social sciences there is little reason to believe that we have actually accumulated knowledge, since the noumenon is not directly accessible to us. It is much more reasonable to interpret this history as a battle over the right choices of values in economics, sociology, and politics. From this point of view, “differentiation” takes on a completely different meaning in contrast to conventional differentiation theories based on the system concept. “Differentiation” is not about the separation of subsystems but about the differentiation of value standpoints in relation to specific value dilemmas within those “subsystems” or better life-worlds. A phenomenological analysis of differentiation can reveal aspects of modernity, which have been and continue to be neglected by other differentiation theories.

References

References
been and continue to be neglected by other differentiation theories. Analysis of differentiation can reveal aspects of modernity, which have those “subsystems” or better life-worlds. A phenomenological analysis of value standpoints in relation to specific value dilemmas separation of subsystems but about the differentiation is not about the differentiation theories based on the system concept. “Differentiation” takes on a completely different meaning in contrast to conventional sociology, and politics. From this point of view, “differentiation” is not directly accessible to us. It is much more reasonable to interpret that we have actually accumulated knowledge, since the history of theories in the social sciences there is little reason to believe in the social sciences. In contrast to the common interpretation of the these dilemmas has been fueling the development of modern theories the value dilemmas are usually not perceived in traditional social groups, cooperation problems do exist in every society. But whereas these value dilemmas present in the coordination, distribution, and 3. Conclusion to social order produces its own problems. because individuals have different value preferences. Each approach that everyone can accept. There is no perfect social order in modernity, illusion of order is lost in modern societies. The recognition of these dilemmas has been fueling the development of modern theories the value dilemmas are usually not perceived in traditional social groups, cooperation problems do exist in every society. But whereas these value dilemmas present in the coordination, distribution, and


**Elster, Jon (1986): An Introduction to Karl Marx.** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.


Opportunity to Learn in Latin America: A Focus on Indigenous Linguistic Populations

Paul Chamness MILLER, ENDO Hidehiro and Erin MIKULEC

Abstract

Much of the focus of education concerns in Latin America has been on mainstream education in those countries. However, indigenous people make up a significant portion of the population and are largely overlooked in discussions of educational reform. In this review of the literature, we examine the ethnic and educational reforms that have taken place in Latin America and what roles the reforms play in upholding indigenous rights. We then present the educational challenges that the indigenous people currently face in progressing in their educational achievements and provide examples of how reform has been working to promote an effective learning environment in Latin America. We conclude with a potential model for further improvement coming from the subfield of “opportunity to learn.”

Introduction

Over the past several years there has been a stronger global interest in addressing issues of language within the educational milieu (Shohamy, 2003), and Latin America is no exception. Despite colonization, which resulted in the imposition of European languages (e.g., Spanish, Portuguese, French, Dutch) on the indigenous peoples of this area of the world, Latin America’s 33 countries and 13 additional political entities are rich with a host of ethnicities, cultures and languages. Current counts include 34 indigenous language families, along with 12 or more stocks with at least 1,000 languages (Rajagopalan, 2005). Although difficult to determine exact numbers, estimates for the number of indigenous people living in Latin America range from 28 to 43 million (Hall & Patrinos, 2005). Even though the meaning of the
The term “indigenous” varies in each country, according to Layton and Patrinos (2006), “self-identification, language use and geographic location” (p. 28) are commonly used to determine whether one is an indigenous person in Latin America.

Hall and Patrinos (2005) report that the countries with the largest indigenous communities include Bolivia, Ecuador, Guatemala, Mexico and Peru. Francis (2002) adds Paraguay to this list. While the principal languages spoken in these countries, and throughout Latin America, are still the languages of the European colonists, and are in many cases listed as the only official language of the countries, the first language of many of the people is not the language of the colonies. For example, in Paraguay the majority of the people speak Guarani as their first language, although Spanish was, until the last decade, the only official language (Rajagopalan, 2005). In Bolivia and Guatemala indigenous peoples make up the majority of the population (Francis, 2002; Hall & Patrinos, 2005). Mexico is the largest Spanish-speaking country, but also has the largest number of indigenous language speakers (Francis, 2002). What research on language use in Latin America reveals is that Latin America is by far neither monolingual nor monocultural (Oliveira, 2000; Rajagopalan, 2005), despite myths and popular misconceptions. Many of the indigenous languages are spoken in isolated communities, while others are spoken by significant numbers of individuals.

As is common in many multilingual communities, one language tends to become dominant over the other(s), and those less dominant are stigmatized. This situation is often the case in Latin America, where the colonists’ language is viewed as more prestigious. Niño-Murcia (2003) illustrates this in the case of Peru, where Quechua is commonly viewed by the people as less prestigious than Spanish. Because of the prestige ascribed to the colonists’ languages, acquiring dominant language proficiency becomes an essential prerequisite in order for the indigenous people to succeed in Latin American societies (Ortiz, 2009). Nevertheless, it is not easy for the indigenous people of Latin America who have lived in poverty to improve their literacy skills in the dominant language (Davis, 2002). Moreover, their linguistic and ethnic minority status negatively affects their educational attainment, a common challenge for linguistic and cultural minorities around the world (see, for example, Miller and Endo, 2004). With the birth of many social justice movements promoting ethnic rights for the
indigenous population of Latin America in the early 1990s, the lives of the indigenous people in this part of the world have gradually improved (Shapiro, 2006). Yet, there is a large gap in terms of income, educational accomplishment, health care, among other social attainments between the non-indigenous and indigenous people in Latin America (Hall, Layton & Shapiro, 2006).

In this review of the literature, we first examine the ethnic and educational reforms that have taken place in Latin America and what roles the reforms play in upholding indigenous rights. Subsequently, we present the educational challenges that the indigenous people currently face, and we delve into examples of how reform has been working to promote an effective learning environment in Latin America and discuss a potential model for further improvement. We will discuss these complex issues both within the overall Latin American context, but will emphasize specific examples by country. As Beech (2002) points out, “generally Latin America is defined by exclusion: all of the American continent except for Canada and the USA, although in some specific analysis other countries are excluded, such as Cuba for being communist or the English-speaking countries in the Caribbean” (p. 425). This classification implies that all of the included nations share the same challenges, approaches and reforms. While some commonalities certainly do exist, such as illiteracy and issues of access to education among indigenous peoples, we must not trivialize such issues by simply grouping them together under the label of Latin America, but rather through a simultaneous understanding of the complexities within nations, regions and communities. As Beech also states, “...to what extent (especially when advocating policies) can it be said that El Salvador and Nicaragua belong to the same region as Brazil or Chile?” In order to distinguish between cultures and their unique situations, we will emphasize examples within the context of specific countries that are considered to be a part of Latin America.

The main aim of this paper is to draw attention to the sociocultural, socioeconomic and historical challenges that the indigenous people who are identified as linguistic minorities face on a daily basis and to inform other educational researchers about the importance of looking deeply into the lived experiences of the indigenous populations in Latin American countries. Such a critical examination of the people’s
experiences can provide this underprivileged group of people in Latin America with better opportunities to learn in the near future.

Reforms for Indigenous Rights

It is important to note at the onset that it is impossible to begin to describe the struggles and needs of indigenous peoples in Latin America as a singular group. Each indigenous community has a unique culture and history, and the relationship between the indigenous peoples and the national governments vary from country to country. Decades ago, Freire (1993, 2005) challenged the educational system in Latin America and the disenfranchisement of minorities; his work has had a global impact on critically examining education and its impact on society. Since Freire’s work, especially in the past 2-3 decades, there has been a significant increase in indigenous communities fighting for their own constitutional rights in Latin America (van Cott, 2000). As are most of the political issues pertaining to the rights of indigenous peoples, the issues of schooling that exist in Latin America are complex. Schmelkes (2011) discusses these issues in terms of the historical, structural and institutional causes for the current state of education in Latin America, and further argues that in terms of reform, “political decisions are based on the often unconscious conception that indigenous cultures are inferior cultures. As such, they do not deserve the same amount or quality of opportunities and services. Education is clearly a case in point” (p. 92). Haddad (2007) echoes this sentiment in his statement that educational reform efforts in Latin America are the result of political pressure to “democratize” countries after long periods of military dictatorship and that many such reforms have taken place without an equal effort to provide adequate resources to carry out such reforms. As he states, “this is a new kind of exclusion; it is no longer access that is denied but that of educational services offered are precarious. What is offered is a poor school for poor people” (p. 191). In Latin America, and in particular, in terms of indigenous populations, a primary example of this is language. Historically, until the 1990s, most schools, with the exception of a few bilingual schools that surfaced in the 1940s, taught in the national language (e.g, Spanish or Portuguese), which contributed to the achievement gap that exists between indigenous and non-indigenous peoples in Latin America (Faltis, 2001). To this day, Paraguay is the only country that grants official status to its indigenous languages equal to that of Spanish (van Cott, 2000).
Despite the official status of some indigenous languages, in the past 2 to 3 decades there has been an effort to reform education in Latin America to meet the needs of indigenous learners, including those of a linguistic nature. Unfortunately, some of these reforms have had ulterior motives “for bringing Indigenous people under fiscal, political, and legal control” (Rockwell & Gomes, 2009, p. 98), while others, such as the social movement started in many Latin American countries in the 21st century, *Educación Intercultural Bilingüe* (EIB), have perhaps had more meaningful attempts at meeting the needs of indigenous learners, through the provision of alternative schooling. The history of education in Latin America, as in most parts of the world, is founded on the idea of the necessity of a uniform culture (Rockwell & Gomes, 2009). The consistent problem with all of these reforms, regardless of their intentions, is that education is still imposed upon indigenous people in most countries from a Western perspective, with little consideration for what the indigenous people value or want. Rockwell and Gomes point out a clear problem: these societies have looked at alternative schooling as the solution, rather than “alternatives to schooling” (p. 98), perpetuating, at least in part, the imposition of Western education on indigenous peoples disguised under alternative forms.

Over the last ten years, Mexico has made some important strides with the passing of the Law for Indigenous Rights and Cultures and the Law on Linguistic Rights of Indigenous Peoples. Although Mexico has had bilingual education in indigenous communities since the 1940s, the past two decades have resulted in significant reform (Francis, 2002). Some indigenous communities have partnered with others to establish alternatives to schooling. Other communities, like the Zapatistas in Chiapas, have developed their own school system. And yet many other communities do not even want bilingual/intercultural schools; instead they prefer that their children attend mainstream schools (Rockwell & Gomes, 2009). For example, as Paradise and de Haan (2009) describe, most Mazahua communities have elementary schools, and some have secondary schools. Most Mazahua people prefer that their children attend schools where Spanish is the language of instruction, rather than bilingual schools. Most children will attend elementary school for 3-6 years, and many who are able to go on to high school either have long commutes to the closest school, or live away from home in order to attend high school,
making it difficult for many youth to achieve academically, ultimately perpetuating the achievement gap. This account indicates that although reforms have been established, they still fail to adequately meet the needs of the indigenous people to close the gap.

Like Mexico, Peru began to provide occasional bilingual education opportunities to indigenous peoples in the 1940s. In the 1970s, the government established its first bilingual education policy and also made Quechua an official language. The 1993 constitution, however, rescinded the official status of Quechua (van Cott, 2000). Prior to the 1990s, most bilingual education programs were funded privately, with occasional assistance from Peru’s ministry of education, but it was under EIB in the 1990s that Peru began to seriously modify its education to meet the needs of its multilingual society through the provision of textbooks in indigenous languages, as well as the training of indigenous teachers (Rockwell & Gomes, 2009). However, many Quechua people have adopted the belief that learning the Quechua language will not help them to advance in society, and therefore reject bilingual education programs and texts and other teaching materials that are provided in Quechua (Garcia, 2009).

There are two contrasting cases when looking at educational reform in Brazil and its neighbor, French Guiana. It was not until 1988 that indigenous peoples were even considered full citizens in Brazil, when the new constitution was ratified (Tassinari & Cohn, 2009). At this time, the constitution demands a form of “differentiated instruction” (p. 151) that takes into account the languages, cultures and identities of its indigenous people. Brazil has attempted to reform education with the indigenous people’s needs in mind. Although the schools in indigenous communities are still public schools, funded by the state, they are typically regulated by the community, rather than by the government. Individual schools have a choice to follow the standard curriculum of the country, or to utilize pedagogical practices and assignments that are more conducive to indigenous learning processes. In French Guiana, however, the French government still places teachers from France in the indigenous communities’ schools to ensure that schools in the colonies follow educational expectations of schooling in France. Rockwell & Gomes (2009) note that the French government is considering adapting the curriculum to address cultural and linguistic differences in indigenous communities of its colonies, but no implementation has yet been observed.
As with the previously mentioned Latin American countries, Argentina made its most significant changes for the education of indigenous language speakers in the 1990s, when its constitution was amended to include bilingual education, as well as other rights for indigenous peoples. It was, however, a decade later that the Argentinean government established a national bilingual education program (Szulc, 2009). One particular province of Argentina, Neuquén, illustrates the difficulty that is often experienced in implementing the policies that are mandated at the national level in indigenous communities. In this particular area, the provision for bilingual education was instituted as an option in the elementary schools. Each teacher should, ideally, spend 6 hours each week, teaching the Mapuche language and culture (Szulc, 2009). The province also provided a new post in each school for a Mapudungun language teacher, whose apparent sole qualification, other than speaking Mapudungun, was to be able to read and write in Mapudungun. This position lasted only one year (Díaz, 2001). In recent years, the government established the Department for Mapuche Language and Educational Programs (DMLEP), whose director is a Mapuche official (Szulc, 2009). The role of the DMLEP is to participate in decision making as it pertains to the education of the Mapuche people, as well as in the hiring and evaluating of teachers. Another issue that Szulc (2009) points out is that current policy only allows for the provision of Mapuche language and culture instruction in the indigenous communities, resulting in indigenous people living in urban areas (of whom there are many) to be left without such opportunities.

Another type of effort to reform education in Latin America has also taken place in various locations, such as Mexico and Nicaragua. This reform is an attempt to give local communities, and parents in particular, the power to make more decisions pertaining to schooling in their communities. Along with this power, however, parents have also been expected to contribute financially to the operation of the schools in the community (Gershberg, 1999). In a comparison of Nicaragua and Mexico, Gershberg found that in order for indigenous parents to be effectively involved in the community’s schools, the central government must 1) provide a space for parents to be involved, but avoid regulating parental involvement, 2) establish a system for equitable funding that is not solely funded by the community, and 3)
provide training to parents so that they are able to effectively be involved in schooling. If the central government is not willing to follow these steps, community involvement in the schools will not be successful (Gershberg, 1999). Although the Nicaraguan government was successful at involving parents, the inequity in funding that arose because of mandatory parental fees resulted in a number of other problems because of some communities having more financial resources than others.

These examples of the education reform that has surfaced in Latin America only describe a few of the changes that have taken place within the past 20 years, illustrating the many challenges that exist in attempting to address the educational needs of the indigenous communities throughout this part of the world. What much of these challenges point to is one important finding: Western education and reform that continues to push Western models of education is denying indigenous communities of Latin America the same opportunities to learn. It is a basic right of all people to have the same opportunity to learn, but that does not mean schooling should be the same for every community. In the next section we will discuss many of the educational issues that exist for indigenous populations, which will illustrate the point that indigenous learners are not receiving the same opportunity to learn as non-indigenous learners.

**Educational Issues for the Indigenous Population in Latin America**

Despite the educational reform movements to help the indigenous population in Latin America to sustain their ethnic rights, the educational achievement gap between the indigenous population and non-indigenous population still exists. In Bolivia, the ratio of non-indigenous people who graduated from a university in 2002 was approximately 19% as opposed to 8% for indigenous people (Pozo, Casazola & Aguilar, 2006). Additionally, Ortiz (2009) points out that there is a significantly lower educational accomplishment among the Mapuche people, an indigenous population in Chile, in contrast to that of non-indigenous people. Furthermore, Shapiro (2006) indicates that the dropout ratio for indigenous people in Guatemala during first grade was 44% in contrast to 31% for non-indigenous people. Accordingly, the indigenous people in Latin America generally undergo more difficulties in succeeding in their schooling than the
Opportunity to Learn in Latin America: A Focus on Indigenous Linguistic Populations

provide training to parents so that they are able to effectively be involved in schooling. If the central government is not willing to follow these steps, community involvement in the schools will not be successful (Gershberg, 1999). Although the Nicaraguan government was successful at involving parents, the inequity in funding that arose because of mandatory parental fees resulted in a number of other problems because of some communities having more financial resources than others.

These examples of the education reform that has surfaced in Latin America only describe a few of the changes that have taken place within the past 20 years, illustrating the many challenges that exist in attempting to address the educational needs of the indigenous communities throughout this part of the world. What much of these challenges point to is one important finding: Western education and reform that continues to push Western models of education is denying indigenous communities of Latin America the same opportunities to learn. It is a basic right of all people to have the same opportunity to learn, but that does not mean schooling should be the same for every community. In the next section we will discuss many of the educational issues that exist for indigenous populations, which will illustrate the point that indigenous learners are not receiving the same opportunity to learn as non-indigenous learners.

Educational Issues for the Indigenous Population in Latin America

Despite the educational reform movements to help the indigenous population in Latin America to sustain their ethnic rights, the educational achievement gap between the indigenous population and non-indigenous population still exists. In Bolivia, the ratio of non-indigenous people who graduated from a university in 2002 was approximately 19% as opposed to 8% for indigenous people (Pozo, Casazola & Aguilar, 2006). Additionally, Ortiz (2009) points out that there is a significantly lower educational accomplishment among the Mapuche people, an indigenous population in Chile, in contrast to that of non-indigenous people. Furthermore, Shapiro (2006) indicates that the dropout ratio for indigenous people in Guatemala during first grade was 44% in contrast to 31% for non-indigenous people. Accordingly, the indigenous people in Latin America generally undergo more difficulties in succeeding in their schooling than the non-indigenous people. Through an extensive review of the literature pertaining to the lives of the indigenous people in Latin America, we found three potential impediments: linguistic challenges, socioeconomic status, and gender stratification, which impinge on the indigenous people’s educational advancement. In this section, we delve into the three impediments with the aim of enriching our understanding of the educational challenges that the indigenous people in Latin America currently face.

Linguistic Challenges

From the time that European settlers embarked on their mission to colonize Latin American nations in the late 15th century, the Spanish language gradually evolved into a dominant language used across Latin America, except in some countries such as Brazil, where Portuguese is used as a national language (Rajagopalan, 2005). Prior to the invasion of European colonizers, there were approximately 1,750 indigenous languages throughout Latin America (Rajagopalan, 2005; Sherzer, 1991). At the present, however, more than 1,000 out of the 1,750 indigenous languages that once existed in Latin America have become extinct (Campbell, 1997; Rajagopalan, 2005). Consequently, for the most part, Spanish language proficiency emerges as one of the most important components in order for an individual to succeed in today’s Latin American education. The spread of the Spanish language in Latin America affects how the indigenous children navigate their educational experience.

Ortiz (2009) conducted an ethnographic study to examine an elementary school in Chile that integrates indigenous education into its school curriculum with the purpose of encouraging the Mapuche indigenous students to maintain their heritage. He found that despite the older Mapuche people’s strong desire to pass on their indigenous knowledge to the younger generation, some of the indigenous students in the school did not attach importance to the maintenance of their heritage customs. Rather, he claimed that the indigenous students felt that blending into mainstream society by acquiring literacy in Spanish is more important than maintaining their heritage culture at the present day. Nevertheless, the indigenous students are present in the community where Mapuche customs are practiced. They are required to acquire both indigenous knowledge and cultural knowledge valued in mainstream society. Similar to the experiences of bilingual/
bicultural students in North America, acquiring mainstream cultural values while sustaining their ethnic background is challenging (Adams, 1995; Endo & Reece-Miller, 2010; Rogers & Jaime, 2010). In view of this fact, learning the dominant language can also be a strenuous practice for the indigenous students in Latin America. Indeed, Shapiro (2006) presents that the average Spanish test score of the standardized test in 2001 for the indigenous student population in Guatemala was 18.4 points less than that of the non-indigenous student population. This gap indicates that the indigenous students experience a more difficult time improving their literacy skills in Spanish than the non-indigenous students in Guatemala. Literacy skills in a mainstream language are essential abilities for an individual to succeed in most educational environs in the world (Delpit, 2006; Miller & Endo, 2004). For example, during the military regimes of the 1960s and 1970s, indigenous people were barred from participating in elections in Ecuador and Peru as the result of having to pass a “literacy test” in order to vote (van Cott, 2007). For the indigenous students in Latin America who hover between their indigenous customs and mainstream cultural values, learning the dominant languages, such as Spanish, often becomes a cultural, social, and political challenge. Accordingly, the linguistic challenges that the indigenous students undergo emerge as an impediment to their educational and societal success.

Socioeconomic Status

A large number of indigenous people in Latin America live in poverty. Although many non-indigenous people also chronically suffer from poverty in Latin American nations, social inequalities between indigenous and non-indigenous people still remain large at present (Davis, 2002; Hall et al., 2006). Davis (2002) states that the social and cultural inequalities against the indigenous population are affected by the hegemonic power of the mainstream culture and language. These inequalities entrenched in Latin America have hindered the indigenous people from climbing up an economic mobility ladder. That is, the indigenous people in Latin America are largely trapped into the cycle of poverty.

It is a widely acknowledged perception that socio-economic status, which is measured by household earnings, parents’ occupations, residential area, among other factors, is one of the most significant
variables having an influence on one’s educational success (Krashen, 2005; White, 1982). Furthermore, parents’ socioeconomic status also has an effect on their school age children’s accessibility to the educational knowledge that guides them to pursue higher education (Anyon, 1981; Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2007). It is this social and cultural capital that determines the educational access or lack thereof that children and youth may have (Bourdieu, 1986). This hypothesis is pertinent to the Latin American educational environment.

The disparity in economic status is exemplified in the case of Peru, where Trivelli (2006) points to the fact that the average income for non-indigenous households is twice as much as that of indigenous households. This suggests the presence of a large socioeconomic gap between the indigenous and non-indigenous people. She further claims that the academic accomplishment of the non-indigenous people is significantly higher than that of the indigenous population in Chile. It would appear that there is a patent linkage between the lower income of the indigenous population in Chile and their lower educational accomplishment. Furthermore, Ramirez (2006) indicates that indigenous people in Mexico are more likely to be trapped into poverty due to their lower earnings compared to non-indigenous people, and the standardized test scores for the indigenous population is lower than those of the non-indigenous population. Accordingly, the indigenous people in Latin America who largely live in poverty are at a serious disadvantage of succeeding in school compared to the non-indigenous population (Hall et al., 2006). However, a number of indigenous political parties have begun to make headway in several Latin American countries at attempting to close this gap. Indigenous parties in Colombia, Ecuador, Bolivia and Guyana have experienced success at various levels of government and have provided various indigenous groups with a small but growing voice in their respective congress. Nonetheless, as van Cott (2007) points out, while indigenous parties do not invest heavily in advertising, they do have the media’s attention because “the indigenous have been more effective advocates for the impoverished because they are more visible and photogenic than the millions of urban and rural poor, who lack distinct, newly valued cultural identities” (p. 135). The paradox, therefore, is that it is the very thing that these parties strive to combat that aids them in their election and popular support.
Another major educational impediment for indigenous populations in Latin America is gender stratification. As García (2003) points out, generally women in indigenous communities in Latin America have fewer opportunities to attend schools to improve their literacy skills in a dominant language. Van Cott’s (2007) research also found that “rates of European-language acquisition are higher among men, who tend to have more years of schooling than women and are likely to have more interaction with the nonindigenous population through military service and employment” (p. 128). Gender stratification in Latin America plays a key role in delaying the educational progress of the indigenous women populace.

According to Shapiro (2006), in Guatemala, there was a 13% difference between the literacy rate for the indigenous male populace aged between 10-19 (80%) and that of the indigenous female populace (67%) in 2000. Shapiro also maintains that the literacy rate for non-indigenous women aged between 10-19 (89%) was far better than that of the indigenous women in 2000. These statistical data sadly infer that indigenous women have insufficient opportunities to be educated in Guatemala. Moreover, Jemenez, Landa and Yanez (2006) indicate that not only did indigenous women have fewer schooling years than indigenous men in Bolivia, but also they had the lowest college attendance rate: 6.7%, compared to the rate for non-indigenous men, 18.9%, non-indigenous women, 18.2%, and indigenous men, 9.7%. In light of these statistics, indigenous women emerge as an underrepresented group of the underrepresented population in Latin America. The educational needs of the indigenous women need to be extensively examined in order to advance their educational experiences as well as their achievement.

Discussion

As mentioned in the previous section, the achievement gap between indigenous and other learners in Latin America is wide. As one may find in the USA, much of this gap is attributed to the lack of access and resources (Aguirre-Muñoz & Boscardin, 2008; Bourdieu, 1986). But more than that, in the case of indigenous peoples of Latin America, it is also the types of access that are provided and how this access fits within indigenous cultures, languages and other
Opportunity to Learn in Latin America:  
A Focus on Indigenous Linguistic Populations

There are many differences between Western and indigenous cultures in Latin America, one of which relates to educational practices and philosophies. For example, what is commonly viewed as important curriculum from a Western perspective is a traditional definition of literacy, that is the ability to read and write; those who are unable to do so are stigmatized and seen as ignorant and unintelligent (de la Piedra, 2009). At the same time, indigenous ways of life may hold no value to the ability to read and write, where reading and writing are not common everyday practices; instead, literacy is viewed in a completely different light where emphasis is placed on the ability to communicate through nonverbal means, as well as the ability to tell stories in song and dance and the ability to fully participate in rituals. Additionally, for many indigenous people, Western literacy is viewed as a source of power, a means by which “to avoid subordination” (de la Piedra, 2009, p. 113), but has no value to their own way of life. Interestingly, despite many activists’ efforts throughout Latin America to assist in the preservation of indigenous languages, a large number of indigenous people believe that the only way they will be able to achieve social mobility is through the ability to learn the languages of the colonists (García, 2003). As a result, there is significant resistance among many indigenous communities to the bilingual education programs instituted in the schools, because they believe that schools should teach in the mainstream language (e.g., Spanish), and leave the indigenous language learning to their own communities.

Given these challenges in addressing the educational needs of the indigenous communities of Latin America, the question remains: What can be done to improve the opportunity to learn for indigenous, bilingual learners and to close the achievement gap?

In order to answer this question, educators must truly understand the struggle that exists for indigenous people to form identities and attempt to fit into the hegemonic, Western society, while at the same time maintaining their own cultural identities. In many cases, government policies that attempt to provide equitable education to indigenous peoples only continue to perpetuate the hegemony that
exists between Western and indigenous cultures (Szulc, 2009). Szulc further states that these policies are often established without including the voice of the indigenous people; if they do include this voice, the process continues to impose the dominant society’s worldview on the indigenous people. In order for educators to respond to this hegemony that continues to make its way into the classroom, it is crucial to consider creative means for bringing together indigenous and Western educational philosophies. This is further complicated by the fact that educational reform in Latin America has come on the heels of the fall of authoritarian military regimes and dictatorships. Governments must now consider to what extent they should play a role in education for all citizens as they continue to develop a national “identity” after this time in their history. It is also stated that:

On one hand, there is the notion that educational markets with private management of schools provide the best hope for educational efficiency and student performance; on the other hand, the notion that central government must intervene with a clear vision of what constitutes a good education and how to achieve it to assure that students will have the greatest opportunity to learn. (Brunner, 2005, p. 106)

Caruso (2010) further echoes this statement when he says that “the very emergence of new polities had to be managed through measures of state building. Accordingly, education had not only a ‘reproductive’ function but also a ‘productive’ one: the invention of new polities” (p. 412). What does this all mean for the indigenous peoples of these young democracies and the meeting of indigenous and Western philosophies in the face of the need to create a national identity? As de la Piedra (2003) describes, one example of an attempt to bring the two philosophies together is to redefine what learning is in order to establish hybrid forms of learning that will bridge the gap, while maintaining that which is highly valued by indigenous people. One example of this, she describes, can be found in classrooms of the Quechua community in the Andes, where learners are able to draw on Spanish alphabetic literacy, while maintaining Andean textual practices, including music, dance, rituals and storytelling.

Another example is the idea of intercultural universities and colleges. These higher education institutions are being created in Mexico to serve both indigenous and non-indigenous students with the aim of
redefining academic knowledge to include the traditions, ideas and worldviews of the indigenous community. As Dietz (2009) states, while there is some resistance to these universities in terms of ideas about degrees and curriculum, students who graduate from these universities are beginning to have a substantial impact, where “a new generation bearing both academic and community, both indigenous and western knowledge has emerged” (p. 3). Such institutions are not limited to Mexico. Cortina (2010) discusses the influence of German Technical Cooperation in Bolivia and Peru, which has focused educational efforts “on regions where there is deferred investment by the national government in public education and community development. In Latin America, this translates to countries with significant indigenous populations” (p. 56). These efforts have led to the implementation of educational models in the Andean region that “emphasize the ancestral culture and to teach about and in the indigenous language and about the culture, knowledge, histories, values, and the worldview of indigenous groups rather than using the more traditional bilingual education model” (p. 59). These models do not simply aim to teach bilingualism, but also to develop citizens that are able to interact successfully with both their indigenous culture and the dominant culture in which they live.

The revision of the curriculum to be more culturally relevant to the children is equally important. In many cases textbooks and other classroom materials are provided only in the European language, and often make references to city life, such as references to policemen and taxis, and other concepts unfamiliar to the children (de la Piedra, 2003; Tassinari & Cohn, 2009). This puts many students in rural areas at a significant disadvantage, where they may have never encountered a taxi in real life. Additionally, given the collectivist societies in which indigenous people live, texts provided only in the European language prevent the community from participating in the learning process if they do not also speak and are not able to read and write in that language.

Also, traditional approaches to classroom instruction do not fit within the collectivist worldview of indigenous people (Tassinari & Cohn, 2009). Indigenous cultures often place a high value on collaboration and cooperative learning, where one who is older and has more experience shares that knowledge with younger, less experienced members of the group. An example of this type of environment is
described by Paradise and de Haan (2009) where they reveal how children are able to work together to accomplish a task, such as installing windows inside a classroom. In a separate study, Paradise and de Haan discuss how the attitude of those teaching also plays an important role in the success of learning with indigenous children. Rather than following traditional “teacher imparts knowledge to student” framework, indigenous parents encouraged children to take initiative at the start, which resulted in the child taking on more frequently the roles of performer, in place of observer. The children in these instances would switch from the role of performer to observer and back to performer as he or she gained expertise in the task. This approach resulted in more effective and self-motivating engagement in learning, instead of following traditional school models of teaching.

While teachers must be cognizant of indigenous student learning styles, they must also take into consideration the instructional materials with which they are provided. In Peru, for example, the national curriculum, as well as workbooks and textbooks are managed by the Peruvian Ministry of Education, and include little to no material or information that is relevant to the lives of indigenous children (Pérez, 2009). Furthermore, we must also consider how teachers are trained to work with indigenous student populations. Pérez describes a teacher training program in Peru in which pre-service teachers were trained in intercultural and bilingual education as well as in the development of instructional materials. In her time working with the program, Pérez states that it “has moved from a culturally assimilationist bilingual education model towards a culturally revitalising and reaffirmative model” (p.17). This model includes not only using Quechua as a medium of instruction as well as a subject, but also challenging the definition of knowledge as a western ideal, while labeling indigenous knowledge and worldviews as “traditional.” By asserting that knowledge has a value not limited by a particular time or space, but rather as one of many perspectives and ways of interpreting the world, teachers empower their students to do the same, which can impact many facets of education (see Freire 1993, 2005). As Pérez points out, “when teachers open up to indigenous ways of thinking in school, they often do not stop with the content but start to redefine other aspects of school, like methodology, educational materials, school traditions, language use, even clothing used in schools” (p. 19).
We would also like to put forward a model for the opportunity to learn developed by Aguirre-Muñoz and Amabisca (2010) as way to possibly meet the needs of indigenous learners. Their model comes from the larger notion of opportunity to learn in response to the lack of academic achievement of the many disenfranchised children and youth in North America (see Porter, 1991). Before discussing Aguirre-Muñoz and Amabisca’s model, it is important to note that no model of instruction will be fully affective so long as society continues to marginalize the languages and cultures of indigenous people. If society begins to embrace the richness that comes from the indigenous peoples, rather than imposing Western education on them, perhaps such models will have even greater success. This model was created to address the needs of English Language Learners in the U.S., but given that this model would take into consideration most of the issues we have discussed to this point, we believe it might serve as a starting point for reforming education for indigenous communities.

The model takes into consideration 3 types of input that affect learning: teacher quality, resources available to the learner, as well as the background of the students. As we have discussed throughout this paper, the quality of teacher available to indigenous learners has been a considerable concern in many communities. Following this model, teacher quality would be a top priority, where educators are responsive to the culturally diverse students of the community that they serve. Teacher quality is also at the center of input, in that fiscal resources and student background are also considered as factors that influence the quality of teachers. Clearly, fiscal resources must also be made available to indigenous communities as they do in urban areas, instead of education stopping with Elementary school because of lack of access to further education. What is more, taking notice of the needs of the indigenous communities when selecting quality teachers is important.

These 3 types of input, based on this model, then influence the characteristics of instruction, including the quality of curriculum and teaching. In other words, following this model, curriculum would highly value topics that are relevant to each indigenous community, while at the same time promoting higher-order and critical thinking, and helping indigenous learners develop first and second language skills. This is particularly important considering that myriad indigenous communities have responded to the hegemony of the
dominant language by abandoning their own languages and cultures. In addition to a curriculum that is appropriate for indigenous learners, quality teaching must also encompass proper methods and approaches that meet the needs of the learners. While some of the approaches suggested in this model, designed for an English-as-a-second-language setting, may not necessarily be applicable in indigenous communities (e.g., sheltered instruction), scaffolded instruction, explicit/direct instruction, group/pair work, among others, would be beneficial, of course taking into consideration the cultural backgrounds and needs of the learners, linguistic resources, current understanding of knowledge and their participation role. Teachers must also become aware of the current knowledge and language development of the learner and be able to modify instructional materials and use appropriate visuals, authentic texts and indigenous language reading materials (if the language has a written form), where appropriate.

When considering the curriculum and quality of instruction, the outcomes emphasized in this model focus on the learner’s first and second language development, as well as on academic achievement and participation. In light of these outcomes, where first and second language development are valued, and where achievement and participation might be redefined to fit within the indigenous communities, education would be more meaningful.

While this model is developed around the notion of Western education, and American education in particular, significant adaptation would be required in order for this model to be successful within indigenous communities. The required adaptation all points to one vital point – education for indigenous learners cannot mirror Western education. So long as this crucial point is included in the development of an appropriate adaptation, this model would ensure that indigenous learners have the same opportunity to learn as any other member of the community, leading to their academic success.

What has surfaced as significant from this review of the education of indigenous children in Latin America is that there are a number of complex issues that have a strong impact on indigenous communities. It starts with the imposition of European cultures and languages. Because of the hegemony that these cultures and languages possess, indigenous people struggle with balancing to what extent they should
maintain their own linguistic and cultural identities, and to what extent they should succumb to this power and allow themselves to assimilate.

Although Latin America has established many policies for educational reform that on the surface appear to help indigenous people succeed in their educational careers, many of the policies only perpetuate the dichotomy that coexists between the Western and indigenous people. As we have discussed, these policies often are at national levels, and are difficult to implement. Many of the policies were not given much thought and do not include the views and needs of the indigenous people. Some of the policies are simply not implemented in ways that will benefit those for whom they are intended. Schools continue to operate under Western formats, which poses problems for most indigenous children, and the curriculum continues to fail to serve this population. Education is sporadic at best for many children, and often ends after elementary school because of the lack of access to further educational opportunities. The result is resistance and a grossly negligent educational system that puts indigenous children at greater educational risk. Additional challenges that we discussed are issues of language, also linked to policy issues, as well as poverty and gender stratification. However, as Scherff and Piazza (2009) point out, opportunity to learn “shifts the focus away from the ends or outputs of schooling (such as test scores) to the inputs of education or the resources provided for helping students reach high standards” (p. 343). That said, opportunity to learn has the potential to be an effective and meaningful approach to education in Latin America as we have seen through the teacher education for indigenous populations, the redefinition of knowledge to expand beyond that of western ideals, and the creation and development of higher educational institutions with a focus on intercultural education and cooperation.

Conclusion

Macchiavelo taught that one must cut out languages first, brothers, that’s why we are already cut, that’s why in school we start with Aymara and we finish with Spanish. Who is at fault? We ourselves are and sometimes even myself. We aren’t conscious of this. What does consciousness mean? It’s a big thought with all heart. Let’s not be like the evangelists who sell a gringo God, and afterward they dance in the streets. We must lift ourselves up; from now on, we must mobilize.
Let’s think in Ayamara and let’s speak in Ayamara. (Quispe, 2003, p. 208)

This speech was articulated by Felipe Quispe Huanca who leads the Bolivian peasant movement (Quispe, 2003). His speech signifies the sociocultural struggles that the Ayamara people experience in embracing their indigenous traditions and his zealous desire to preserve the indigenous language. In contemporary Latin American societies, preserving indigenous languages as well as cultures becomes a socioculturally, socio-politically, historically, and educationally intricate challenge for the indigenous population. The lack of opportunity to learn is a clear problem in Latin America, and in particular for indigenous children. Although we have presented some examples of progress being made, there is a significant need for greater improvement in order to close the achievement gap that exists for these people. All in all, drawing more attention to the experiences of the indigenous students in Latin America, and using those experiences to redefine education there, is the starting point in improving their opportunities to learn.

References


Opportunity to Learn in Latin America:
A Focus on Indigenous Linguistic Populations

Let's think in Ayamara and let's speak in Ayamara. (Quispe, 2003, p. 208)

This speech was articulated by Felipe Quispe Huanca who leads the Bolivian peasant movement (Quispe, 2003). His speech signifies the sociocultural struggles that the Ayamara people experience in embracing their indigenous traditions and his zealous desire to preserve the indigenous language. In contemporary Latin American societies, preserving indigenous languages as well as cultures becomes a socioculturally, socio-politically, historically, and educationally intricate challenge for the indigenous population. The lack of opportunity to learn is a clear problem in Latin America, and in particular for indigenous children. Although we have presented some examples of progress being made, there is a significant need for greater improvement in order to close the achievement gap that exists for these people. All in all, drawing more attention to the experiences of the indigenous students in Latin America, and using those experiences to redefine education there, is the starting point in improving their opportunities to learn.

References


Oliveira, G. M. (2000). Brasileiro fala português: Monolingüismo e preconceito linguístico [Brazilians speak Portuguese: Monolingualism and linguistic prejudice]. In H. M. de Melo Moura & F. L. da Silva (Eds.), *O direito à fala: A questão do preconceito linguístico* [Right to speech: The issue of


Quispe, F. H. (2003). Felipe Quispe Huanca. In E. D. Langer & E. Munoz (Eds.), *Contemporary indigenous movements in Latin America* (pp. 205-209). Wilmington, DE.


Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger - \(^1\)

TERANO Mayumi

Abstract

This article aims to explore the concepts of ‘quality’ in education and how they are reflected in practices. Three research questions guide this study: 1) What are the current understanding and debates about ‘quality’ in education? How are they measured?; 2) What are current challenges and initiatives of improving the quality of primary education in Niger? How are they designed to achieve quality in primary education?; and 3) What are the positions of donor agencies involved and how do they affect the project initiatives? The discourse of the ‘quality’ in education is investigated through a review of literature, referring to qualitative data from the case study of School for All project in Niger, developed by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA). The concepts, the project initiative and the approach of relevant donor agencies involved in the project are examined using the framework of Didactic Triangle (Clarkson, 2009), which identifies three components of education systems: ‘contents’, ‘transmitters’ and ‘receivers’. The discussion highlights the argument that current understanding of the concept places emphasis on ‘inputs-outputs’ relations, as well as the way the project in the case study seems to reflect. The discussion concludes with the concerns relating to the

---

\(^1\) The author draws part of the data in this study from this consultancy work, which was titled ‘Community Participation in School Management in Niger: The CGDES and the ‘School for All’ initiative to improve Primary Education’, which was funded by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) between 2012 and 2013. I would like to thank Dr. Kweku Ampiah and Dr. Georgios Tsopanakis for their expertise as co-investigators in the original study. The content of this paper however is under the sole responsibility of the author.
education and projects with the increased focus on measurable outcomes.

Introduction

The purpose of this study is to explore the different ways that ‘quality of education’ is understood and reflected in development practices in Niger, and highlight challenges in their policy and practices from a case study. The study draws on part of the results from a case study on School for All (SFA) Project, a project lead by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) in collaboration with the Ministry of Education (‘MEN’), Niger.

Between 1970 and 1990, much of the attention on education in developing countries was on school access and enrolments. However, the increase in enrolments left with issues such as gender inequality, drop-outs and lack of improvement in basic literacy and numeracy in many countries including Sub-Saharan African Region. These issues were reflected in the World Conference on Education for All (EFA) (Jomtien, Thailand) in 1990 and the World Education Forum (Dakar, Senegal) in 2000. In the African region, these meetings were followed by the African education conference (Johannesburg, South Africa) in 1999 and the EFA conference in Bamako, Mali (2000). The EFA initiative and the United Nations Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) advocate the access to and quality in basic education for all by 2015; identifying education quality as an important component for ensuring access (Sifuna and Sawamura, 2010). Policy makers of the member nations are currently under pressure to demonstrate their achievement in accordance with these goals.

Niger is one of poorest countries in the world, as ranked as 186th out of 187 countries on the Human Development Index in 2012 (UNDP, 2013: 143). The area is exposed to political instability, religious conflicts, frequent food shortage and malnutrition due to droughts, but the country’s annual population growth is about 3.3 percent, one of the highest in the region. A large influx of refugees from neighbouring countries such as Mali, Libya and Nigeria had put additional constraints to Nigerien economy, and the security situation worsened both at the border and in the capital, Niamey. The country’s economy relies on agriculture, mining, and oil sectors and the extractive
Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -

industries are expected to grow continuously, but the growth in population, unstable political situation and the climate caused dramatic fluctuations in annual real GDP growth (World Bank, 2013). On the other hand, Niger has demonstrated much progress in terms of access to basic education during the last half century. Recent figures shown in gross enrolment rate for primary education grew from 30% in 1998 to 71% in 2012 (UIS, 2014). The annual growth of primary enrolment since 2008 shows 5% on average, as the ratio of female (6%) exceeds male (4.1%), but the access in rural area still lags behind the capital area (MEN, 2012). A large growth of school enrolment in the capital (30% between 2008 and 2012, despite the 7% in the rural area) (Ibid.) may be the result of recent influx of immigrants in the area. There was however a controversy over the increase in enrolments in a number of countries because it coincided with a decrease in academic achievements in many regions (Kawaguchi, 2012). This had lead to the debate about whether or not the quantity and quality targets in education can be achieved simultaneously, or one can only achieved at the expense of the other.

The policy and planning of basic education is administered by the Ministry of National Education, Literacy and Promotion of National Languages (MEN), in support of several councils and directorates in charge of consultation and implementation in focused areas. The most recent long-term initiative is the Ten-Year Education Program (Programme Décennial de Développement de l'Education – PDDE). This initiative aims to ensure better access and quality of basic education to the most marginalized socio-economic groups in the country, such as rural households and women. Other areas of effort include vocational skills training as a way of strengthening human capital to improve per capita income and to reduce poverty (World Bank, 2013). The education system that prepares human resources with basic skills needs to underpin training of skilled workers.

With the above context in mind, this paper explores the meaning of ‘quality’ as a key focus in education development, and how it forms policy and practices in primary education in Niger. In particular, this study is guided by the following research questions:

1. What are the current understanding and debates about ‘quality’ in education? How are they measured?
2. What are current challenges and initiatives of improving the quality of primary education in Niger? How are they designed to achieve quality in primary education?

3. What are the positions of donor agencies involved and how do they affect the project initiatives?

These questions were investigated through a desk-based literature review and a reflection from the field research. The literature review, which particularly informs the first question will also guide the focuses on the remaining questions. In order to help clarify the discourse of ‘quality’ in literature and the case study, the discussion applies the Didactic Triangle conception framework (Clarkson, 2009), which identify elements in an education system by the ‘contents’, ‘transmitters’ and ‘receivers’. These concepts are explained further in the next section.

This paper first summarizes current debates on the ‘quality’ of education, highlighting its complexity due to varying concepts and difficulty in demonstrating and comparing the ‘quality’ in the international context. After describing the methodology, it reports on the challenges in Niger, focusing on a concept and measurement of quality in education – the ‘input-output’ approach. This is followed by a presentation of the case study of a primary education development project in Niger. The project observed is called School for All (SFA) project, which was developed in 2004 by JICA upon request from the Nigerien Government, and the data are drawn from the original case study conducted by a consultancy team for JICA, in which the author was a member. Finally, the paper re-visits the three research questions, to summarize the findings, and concludes with the implication and learning of this study.

**Conceptual Framework – the Didactic Triangle**

Clarkson (2009) suggests three components that form an education system and are inter-linked; namely ‘contents’, ‘transmitters’ and ‘receivers’, that forms a Didactic Triangle. The ‘contents’ can refer to a subject, a curriculum, policy measures or approaches to implement. The ‘transmitters’ can refer to teachers, community members, other education professionals working at all levels as well as the environment that affect the transmitting process. ‘Receivers’ can include pupils, parents and people in the society (Clarkson, 2009: 13).
The figure below shows the adaptation of the Didactic Triangle to this study.

Figure 1: Didactic Triangle for teaching and learning – 3 Components

From this conceptual framework, this study focused on understanding the concept of quality from ‘contents’ and the ‘transmitters’ perspectives and how these elements interact in the dynamics. For example, the review of literature explored what constitute ‘quality’ of teachers and how the factors might affect the teacher skills or curriculum. The analysis highlights the debates around how to measure and demonstrate quality as this is increasingly a critical component of policy decision making at all levels.

‘Quality’ in Education – Review of literature

For the literature review, the author examined the body of literature used in systematic reviews of teacher quality (Edge, et al., 2008) and documents produced by the governmental and inter-governmental organizations covering the issues of quality in education. This includes the documents on current practices in Niger and Sub-Saharan African region that were collected from the field visit or remotely from organizations involved in education initiatives.

As discussed earlier, quality in education is increasingly recognised as a necessary component to increase the access, which helps achieve the quantity target and produce desirable outputs. However, there are
varying positions on the definition and emphases among the factors, which depends on the purpose and the context of the definition (Motola, 2001). The context-specific nature of the term also presupposes that the definition depends on the values and the needs of the society and it can change over time.

The perspectives in existing literature are presented on factors that constitute quality in education. They can be largely categorised into: the concept of quality itself; ways of identifying and measuring quality; and factors and processes that affect the outcomes. The next section introduces a common definition and measure currently employed; the inputs-outputs perspectives to identify ‘quality’, and a use of standardised tests. It will be followed by current arguments over the concepts, measurements and other factors and processes that affect the outcomes.

**Concept of ‘Quality’**

The first and second factors discussed on quality, what is defined as ‘quality’ and ways to measure, are often discussed together; exploring the complex links between them and how a measuring process might affect teaching and learning. In general terms, purpose of education is to produce knowledge, skills, values and attitudes among people (World Bank, 1995). Research shows education, particularly at the primary levels, facilitates civic order, sustainable economic growth, improvement of health and poverty reduction (*Ibid.*; Sifuna and Sawamura, 2010). Universal access to education has therefore become the internationally common goal and, to achieve this, the education system needs to produce desired outputs. Lack of quality becomes problematic when, for example from ‘receivers’ perspective, parents do not see children gain literacy, numeracy, or other expected skills from schooling, then, they may discontinue children’s schooling. For ‘transmitters’, such as policy makers, the investment in education needs to be determined with reference to outcomes and returns, often measured through set standards (World Bank, 1995: 94). These perspectives leads to the commonly used definition of quality, such as ‘student outcomes’, which refers to what a specific education system could produce from what was projected and implemented. This perspective of inputs-outputs ratio in education has been the common analytical framework on quality in policy and practice (O’Sullivan, 2006).
We measure education by applying standards to performance of students, institutions and regions, in order to differentiate their positions on a distribution, and compare them with one another (Eisner, 1991: 101-102). Variables used to determine outcomes include test scores, dropout and repetitions of individual students as well as the average and variations of performance among students, schools and regions. Such variables have also been recently identified as especially challenging among many developing countries (World Bank, 1995).

Part of the inputs-outputs approach to quality is to measure outcomes based on ‘the value added of schooling’ (Bridge, Judd, and Moock, 1979; Lockheed and Hanushek, 1988). The value added consists of an increase in the abilities from learning; hence the probability of job attainment. In other words, the indicator intends to explore what and how much a student gained from schooling in a way that brings him/her closer to attain a job opportunity in the future. Cognitive abilities, such as the knowledge and skills, including basic numeracy and literacy to advanced skills, are most commonly assessed through achievement tests. The job attainment level is however complex to determine, as it is affected by the condition of the labour market and the economy. Challenges of collecting valid and comparable data also cannot be under-estimated (World Bank, 1995: 46).

**Argument on the Concept of ‘Quality’**

Although there are commonly used concepts and measures that allow cross-national comparison of quality in education, there is much contention over the definition of the term. The arguments seem to occur especially when an education system can be inappropriately judged through a standard measure, or a use of standard measure distorts teaching practices (Samoff, 2007; O’Sullivan, 2006; Sanders and Horn, 1998). For example, when the emphasis is placed on the standardised test results, teachers tend to conduct rote teaching and focus on preparing children for the tests (O’Sullivan, 2006). The literature seems to recognise two aspects of outputs of education that may be assessed; cognitive and non-cognitive achievements of pupils. The cognitive achievements can be literacy and numeracy at different levels, which may be assessed using a universal measure. The non-cognitive ones are values and attitudes that a society aspires to
inculcate in their citizens (Sifuna and Sawamura, 2010). They are often grounded on societal values and cultural traditions, which can be difficult to measure and compare among one another (Lowe and Instance, 1989; Smith, 1997).

Regardless, some scholars ascertain that the notion of quality is relative, as the aims and function of schools are determined in accordance with what the society expects school or education to accomplish (Motola, 2001; O’Sullivan, 2006; Vedder, 1994; Rissom, 1992). What can be measured and ‘how’ also affect the definition. Eisner (1991) argues that understanding the educational environment and reflecting relevant qualities to a high level require an expert, who has the knowledge about the history and background of the particular practice. To identify values of schooling, according to Eisner (1991), one needs to look at a broad area of experiences that school provides, which is linked to human growth, besides contents and teaching process. A challenge here is again the varying and contestable understanding about ‘growth’, which needs to be manifested in school curricula (Eisner, 1985). Therefore, quality of schooling from the perspective of ‘growth’ needs to be identified depending on the curriculum.

**Example of a Recent Development on Measuring Quality**

Some governments demonstrate the effort of measuring ‘value-added’ of schooling, taking into account the broad benefits of schooling. In the United Kingdom, the Atkinson Review (Office of National Statistics, 2005) has made recommendations about the way in which the output from public education services in the UK was recorded. The recommended measurement methods and indicators of outputs are: number of pupils taught in schools; quality-based output rather than volume-based; and the breadth of coverage of the collected data. Here, the outputs measure attempts to recognise ‘the wider benefits of education system’ by focusing on types and levels of qualifications gained from schooling, expected earnings per qualifications, and the prospective increase in one’s earnings over time (Scottish Government, 2007). These developments show a growing awareness about factors and variables that lead to education outcomes, reflecting variations in terms of access and performance, and outcomes linked to earnings, in short and long-terms.
Other relevant development, which is not specific to education, is also found as the approach to assess the effectiveness in the sphere of public services and development aid. An example is the ‘value for money (VFM)’ framework. The notion was developed in the United Kingdom and increasingly used in international development. The notion is defined as:

The optimum combination of whole-life cost and quality (or fitness for purpose) to meet the user’s requirement. It can be assessed using the criteria of economy, efficiency and effectiveness (Jackson, 2012: 1).

The measure often employed cost-benefit analysis, between the inputs (using valuables such as the public expenditure) and outputs (such as student academic performance and school access). The UK Government and the World Bank employ this framework to assess a global portfolio for their development aid – to examine the allocation of overall budget and resources referring to expected effectiveness. They also apply this to specific country programs in order to assess how different projects or parts of them interact and bring the overall effectiveness. JICA, on the other hand, tends to apply this framework to analysis cost effectiveness for individual projects and programs (Ibid.: 3)

As manifested in these developments, there is a growing emphasis on the inputs-outputs balance as a quality measure, and the challenges for developing valid and effective tools to assess outputs in education are expected to persist.

Other Factors and Processes Affecting Education Outcomes

The review so far covered the concerns about the concept, ‘what quality of education means’, and indicators, ‘how they are measured’. Here, the review is summarised on the element that affect the process; ‘what constitutes quality’; hence the element of ‘transmitters’ in Didactic Triangle (Clarkson, 2009) is considered. For example, teacher quality is recognised from: characteristics that people associate with good teachers (Stronge, 2002); and levels of teacher preparation and qualifications (Peterson, 2004). They are considered as part of inputs, which teachers bring to their teaching, whereas the outputs can refer to how students perform on tests (Sanders and Horn,
Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -

1998). Kaplan and Owings (2001), Anderson (2002) and Verspoor (2003) identify ‘teaching quality’, or the pedagogical process and method, as the element within the input and output processes that defines the actions inside the classroom. Availability of teaching and learning materials, adequate working conditions and the pedagogical skills also affect the quality of curriculum implementation (Bergmann, 1996). Teacher competencies, which are part of the inputs, can be measured by the academic knowledge and ability, years of training and experience, certification status and behaviours in the classroom (Darling-Hammond and Youngs, 2002). Teacher competencies can also be highly context-specific, as the qualities of a ‘good teacher’ can be shaped by cultures and conditions (Cheung, et al., 2008). In India and some African countries, for example, the criteria of a good teacher include: managing a large class size; using teacher directed methods (Barrett, 2007); teaching students with facts (Akyeampong, 2003); and being a role model and dressing ‘appropriately’ (Mooij, 2008). A discussion on another element of ‘transmitters’ is identified as the impacts of schooling and learning environment (Esiner, 2001; Ross and Mahlck, 1990), which define the nature of student learning experiences and help produces desirable student outcomes. The literature also identified an important factor that affects the outcomes of schooling, which is the socioeconomic background of students, as the ‘receivers’ in the Didactic Triangle. According to Colclough (2005), socioeconomic levels of students may differ according to the school localities, which make a significant impact on cognitive outcomes of students.

Method

A review of literature helped identify relevant discourse, and the concepts and measuring practices were summarized. Although the concept was examined on both the pedagogic and policy perspectives, the discussion was mainly on the latter, therefore the focus, process and indicators employed in implementing education policy and programs. The literature suggests, the ‘inputs-outputs’ balance is a major concern on education quality especially for development policy and practices, and the important determining factor of the ‘balance’ is the expectation from schooling, or the intervention. The literature also suggests teacher quality, learning environments, and students as determining factors of quality. These findings will be used as a reference to identify the concepts and measurement on the ‘quality’
applied in the case study of School for All (SFA) project in Niger. They will also guide the investigation for the second and third research questions:

- What are current challenges and initiatives of improving the quality of primary education in Niger? How are they designed to achieve quality in primary education?
- What are the positions of donor agencies involved and how do they affect the project initiatives?

In order to investigate the second research question, the study will first summarize the relevant challenges. The understanding of the context will help us understand the focuses and priorities of the project and to identify what is considered ‘quality’ in this context. The views and positions of donor agencies involved in this project will also be explored and how they might affect the project’s approach. The identified elements will be organized according to the three elements in the Didactic Triangle. It will, then, look at their intervention and measuring practices. Part of this will be to identify what factors the stakeholders use to examine the ‘inputs-outputs’ balance; which is concerned with the involvement of donor agencies and their impacts on the SFA project. The situation of teacher quality, learning environments, and students will be explored through qualitative data collected through observation and interviews with stakeholders. Relevant data could be teacher-student ratio, teacher certification status, conditions of the classroom, condition of school localities, student performance. Following is some description about the data collection in the original case study, which the relevant data was drawn from.

The case study was conducted by a consultancy team formed in order to investigate a level of community ownership of school management committees through the SFA project. The study explored the involvement of stakeholders at local, national and international levels to examine the degree in which each of them impacts the decision making of initiatives and future direction, with reference to the original intentions of the committees. Exploring project’s initiatives and outcomes on raising quality of education was part of the focus of this study. The team conducted a field trip and a desk-based research between 2012 and 2013. A four-day field trip was conducted in January 2013 during which school visits and a series of semi-
structured interviews were organized with stakeholders of SFA project. The stakeholders met were: the officials at Ministry of Education in Niger who oversees the project; coordinators and officials of regional education departments who guide the regional initiatives in Niamey and Tillabéri; the project experts of JICA, who initiated and developed the project; education experts in the World Bank and UNICEF who collaborated with JICA in SFA project; and one school each in Niamey and Tillabéri that were part of the SFA project to meet those who form the school management committees including school principals, teachers, village leaders. The possible schools to visit were identified and arranged by JICA. The investigators tried to observe and conduct interviews in many project sites, both urban and rural areas, but Tillabéri was the only accessible region outside the capital due to the security situation at that time. The planned second field visit in the late 2013 was also cancelled also due to heightened security risks in the country.

This paper refers to the data, from this original study, that inform inputs-outputs balance in education, as well as ones concerning teachers, learning environment and students. The information was extracted from answers to questions such as the following. The same questions were posed to stakeholders at different levels but the below presents the example interviewees.

- How do you view the roles of permanent and contract teachers, parents and community members, in children’s education under ‘C/CGDES’ [the School Management Committee Initiatives established by the Nigerien Government (To be explained in the next section)]? (to school management committee members, including school leaders, teachers and village representatives in two schools)
- What are the impacts of C/CGDES activities in the education outcomes in the region so far? (Regional Education Office in Niamey and Kollo, Tillabéri)
- What are recent initiatives on quality focused initiatives by SFA activities and how do you view the current achievements and future directions? (to the SFA Project Chief Advisor and JICA Expert)
- How would the new project structure affect the C/CGDES to improve education in the local area? (Officers and C/CGDES supervisor, Ministry of Education)
- How does UNICEF / World Bank identify ‘quality’ in education and how do they measure them? (to education experts in UNICEF and World Bank)

The major limitation of this study is the amount and quality of data from field research, that specifically focused on quality in education mainly because of the differing purpose of this original field work. For example, the information about what people consider as ‘good’ teachers, considering the social and cultural contexts, as the literature suggested, was not available from the set of data. The limitation is also caused by the limited coverage of school cases due to the security situation and time constraints. Obtaining the data on teacher status and student achievements of project site within or across regions was also difficult due to the incoherence of available data. These factors may be further explored in the future study.

Case Study – School for All Project in Niger

Through a case study in Niger, this section examines how the existing concept and policy considerations are reflected in an education project. The section first presents the background of the project, which will be followed by the description of challenges that Niger faces in achieving and demonstrating quality education. It then discuss the way SFA project are designed to tackle these challenges taking into account the position of other donor agency, the World Bank. Examining the current achievements in the project and the process, the study will reflect the complexity of employing and demonstrating quality in education.

Background and Overview of the Project

JICA’s Thematic Guidelines on Basic Education (2005) notes that low quality education is linked to low enrolment, lack of parent and children interest in schooling, school repetitions and dropouts. This leads to economic and social wastage (JICA 2005: 2). As the literature suggests, effective education system needs to be developed through the following factors: education content; stakeholders as ‘transmitters’ that includes teachers as well as the adequate environment and resources; and the students and the community as ‘receivers’. The Guideline asserts that the intervention would have to enable:
Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -

[...]

the provision of well-trained teachers equipped with relevant teaching skills, well maintained educational facilities, and relevant textbooks and teaching-learning materials, a curriculum that takes into account the child’s social and language environment, a proper monitoring and evaluation of the learning process (JICA 2005: 2).

Achieving quality in education through is the key scope of School for All (SFA) Project, which was developed in 2004 in Niger by Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA). This was developed as a technical cooperation to the Government of Niger in order to support their efforts to enhance a decentralised education system. Their decentralisation scheme started by the Nigerian Government in 2002, and it involved the establishment of school management committees (COGES – Comité de Gestion des Établissements Scolaires), which involves school principal, teachers, community and the students. The COGES initiative was supported by the World Bank, and producing results from the grant has been a difficult task for the Nigerian Government, due to varying conditions in schools and inefficiencies in policy operation at all levels. Therefore, the Nigerian Government requested the Japanese Government to assist them ‘to implement a technical cooperation project designed to develop, through capacity building of central and local administrators, an effective COGES model’ (JICA, 2010). The school committee project was later re-named to Coordination des Comités de Gestion Décralisée des Établissements Scolaires (C/CGDES) in 2012 as the Government changed the project management and administration system. The assistance of JICA is considered to be a major contributor of the improvement in school enrolment during the past several years. With the success of SFA project in Niger, the project expanded to neighbouring countries such as Senegal (in 2007), Mali (2008), and Burkina Faso (2009). Several manuals of C/CGDES model were developed and presented to other donor agencies such as the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) and European Union (EU), and they started utilizing them for their activities (JICA, 2010). The education system in Niger, however, still faces the challenge in improving student retention and basic literacy and numeracy through schooling. These problems are considered as the problem of lack of ‘quality’ of education provision. Other major donors in education sector include World Bank, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), UNICEF, GIZ [Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale...
Zusammenarbeit], a German development agency, and non-governmental organisations (NGOs). JICA is currently a main agency that provides technical assistance to the Nigerien Ministry of Education (MEN) for strengthening C/CGDES.

Challenges for Education Quality – the Inputs-Outputs Balance

As presented earlier, quality of education is often discussed through inputs-outputs balance. Scepticism about aid effectiveness has increased particularly at the time of poor economic climate; and it added to the pressures for education services, along with other public services, to produce tangible results. The current approach by the World Bank in their education initiatives in Niger focuses more on inputs rather than outputs (World Bank, 2013, Interview with the education program expert), but a concern exists that the ‘quantity’ of development aid money often overshadowed the attention to achievements (Jackson, 2012).

Table 1: Education expenditure and outcomes in Niger and Sub-Saharan Africa (2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Niger</th>
<th>Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investment in education (% per GDP)</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment in primary education (% per GDP)</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Net Enrolment Rate (%)</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children of primary school-age who are out of school</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of pupils per teacher</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth (15-24 years old) literacy rate</td>
<td>36.5*</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross intake rate to last grade of primary (%)</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Figure from 2005 Source: UIS, 2011

As manifested in these developments, there is a growing emphasis on demonstrating quality, as discussed in the literature review. A challenge in Niger for quality has been identified from the inputs-outputs balance – its high unit cost of education services (World Bank, 2010). Niger mobilised public resources for education in 2011 by 4.5% of GDP, which is slightly higher than the average in the countries of Sub-Saharan Africa region (3.4%). Among this, the expenditure in primary education is estimated to be about 57% in 2011. The expenditure once increased from 58.5% in 2002 to 62.7 in
2008 but the current figure is slightly lower; still higher than the regional average of about 47.7% (in 2008). As of the total GDP, Niger spends 2.5% on primary education, compared to about 1.73% in the regional average. The higher expenditures, however, are not reflected in the outcomes compared to other countries in the region.

International agencies set out their own measurement methods to develop and monitor their initiatives from input-output perspectives. Although the Bank’s principal focus is on the input, more than the outcomes (World Bank, 2013, Interview with an Education Expert), they observe following variables to measure outcomes, as a measure of quality in education:

- Textbooks versus student ratio;
- Reading skills of children;
- Teacher absenteeism;
- Gender balance;
- Completion rate; and
- Enrolment – completion difference

As the principal sponsor of C/CGDES, the Bank’s focus on the ‘inputs’ process incentivise C/CGDES to increase their capacity to manage and allocate funds and ensure effective cash flow in order to achieve quality targets.

As another example of donors’ involvement, UNICEF promotes quality and equality in education through child-friendly schools (CFS), which is built on the principle that ‘schools should operate in the best interest of the child’ (UNICEF, 2010). This initiative focuses on, and measures, children’s diverse needs, such as safe learning environment, health and nutrition, language need, and support for disabilities. A measure of performance variation gap, with a particular focus on girl’s education, has also been an important concern. In terms of the inputs, it focuses on the teacher performance in secondary education, which affect the quality of higher education, and hence the graduates’ qualifications. To measure quality in education, UNICEF refers to the rate of efficiencies in education provisions. The measure was developed by the World Bank Institute, and it observes efficiency coefficient, which calculates a percentage of resources used, including both direct and indirect cost, to produce one school graduate.
Challenges for Education Quality – Learning Environment, Teachers and Students

The effort of realizing universal primary education in Niger has initially focused on ensuring the availability of physical infrastructure, such as the availability of schools, classroom, running water, and furniture. In our field observation in Kollo (Tillabéri Region), for instance, the significant issues in education were observed in terms of a lack of permanent classrooms, table and chairs and textbooks. A number of aid agencies and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have been working closely with the Nigerien Government to allocate funds and technical training to provide and maintain education infrastructure.

Other significant barriers against achieving quality of education observed were with regards to teaching personnel, with insufficient qualified and permanent teachers in the system. In many regions, Nigerien education still depends on contract or unqualified teachers. Currently, permanent teachers make up about 10 to 15 percent of the teachers in Niger. The interviews with C/CGDES members in Kollo also revealed that teachers with lack of teaching skills and experiences cause students not being able to read or write upon graduation of primary education. The teachers expressed that insufficient teaching resources, including textbooks as well as guidance from headteachers and other education experts, also prevented effective teaching. A further guidance and professional training for teachers is necessary for non-certified teachers, whose ability in teaching in Arabic and French languages is insufficient. The system seem to rely on a large number of non-certified and temporary teachers but, in reality, many certified teachers have only gone through 45 days teacher certification courses provided by UNICEF (Referring to the interview results with C/CGDES members in Kollo, and the representative at the Ministry of Education, January 2013).

The additional undesirable aspect of the environment was observed in terms of incentives; as some teachers expressed ‘I think we are respected by the community by I do not think the government respects us enough’ (interview with C/CGDES members in Kollo). Effective teaching is incentivised by high expectation and respect towards teaching profession.
There was also the issue of learner incentives; in the form of challenges that prevented continuation and completion of schooling. The parents and teachers expressed frustrations about lack of accessibility to secondary schools and they discourage people from completing basic education. The C/CGDES members in Goubé School, Tillabéri Region, had explained that the nearest high school (‘college’) is about 75 km away from the school. Continuing to secondary education would necessitate students to have relatives or tutors who host them during their schooling. This increases the cost of schooling along with living expenses, which many of them are not able to afford without scholarships.

Besides the donors’ effort to ensure physical infrastructure, efforts are also made in the area of capacity building of stakeholders to improve quality in education. They are aimed at improving the management of C/CGDES, schools, teaching and community’s involvements. The following sections look further into the current efforts and debates, linking with concept of quality and practices.

**JICA SFA Project Approach**

For the SFA project, JICA identifies quality in education using the indicators such as test scores, retention, and the availability of system to monitor quality. These indicators will be used to develop statistics every 2 years.

Improvement of ‘quality’ has been one of the core focuses of School for All (SFA) project since the extension of its Phase 2 in 2010. The main driver of this is the community’s needs to improve children’s school achievements and the efforts were made to increase the study hours. A lack of instructional hours has been one of issues in the area where teacher absenteeism is severe, due to strike against poor working conditions (according to the teacher interview). The initiative was developed as a part of ‘minimum package’ for quality education. The minimum package on quality focuses on increasing study hours and three principles (Interview with the representatives of district department office, January 2013):

- Take consideration of the actual performance levels of students
- Focus on literacy and numeracy
Through C/CGDES actions, the additional 200 hours has been achieved through installation of supplemental class hours and evening study times. This has been a significant achievement considering the fact that, on average, only about 50-60% of the 960 instruction hours per year, as regulated by the Ministry, is actually covered in schools in Niger (JICA, 2012: 11). The outcomes of the initiative were followed up using tests. Detailed analysis of the test results were used to shape the project initiatives. For example, as the analysis revealed that many students had difficulties with subtraction, the project team introduced particular maths exercise drills. This initiative therefore involved many exercise materials, guidelines for the teachers to facilitate the class, and a training of the community members to help and work with the students. However, the issue of this initiative include: how to cover the continuous supply of exercise materials in the resource constraints; and how and who to continue the training of facilitators in the community (according to the SFA Project member in 2013).

Besides the efforts to increase the instruction hours, the project has also focused on improving the C/CGDES capacity to manage external funds, such as the ones allocated by Nigerien Government and the World Bank. Managing external funds involves effective allocation of funds and ensuring steady cash flow. The project, namely the ‘Quality-Focused Action Plan’ (JICA, 2013a), is driven by the assumption that, instead of just distributing funds, the capacity of the citizens and C/CGDES towards result-focused management of funds will lead to improved education quality (JICA, 2013a: 5). A series of training were developed in the view of building the awareness, skills and consensus among the community and C/CGDES members about the way to maintain the funds (e.g. who, where, and how), to use, and to monitor them. A number of pilot institutions received the training of providing and managing funds and measuring the outcomes in terms of pupil’s school achievements. This was designed to better understanding of how ‘input’ (the funding) might be linked to desired ‘output’ (the pupils’ achievements) (*Ibid.*), and the focus is to develop the autonomy and credibility of the community and C/CGDES in the cash flow, which will help building a stable external investment on their program.
According to the report (JICA, 2013b.), the achievement test result in arithmetic and French language for 2nd, 3rd and 4th graders held in November 2012 and May 2013, the project observed the favourable results for those groups that received the ‘quality’ focused training. In the table below, the improvements of pupil’s test scores are compared according to the types of training program. The ‘Training type 1’ means the programme focused only on the management of subsidies and resources. The ‘Training type 2’ covered 2 types of training; management of subsidies and resources and the effective planning and allocation of resources.

Table 2: School achievement according to types of training programme (Improvements between November 2012 and May 2013). Shown in test points.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2nd grade</th>
<th>3rd grade</th>
<th>4th grade</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training type 1*</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training type 2**</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5.46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Training of the management of subsidies and resources
** Training of the management of subsidies and resources and the effective planning and allocation of resources.

Source: JICA 2013b

Whether or not these differences are the direct outcomes of the ‘quality’-focused training programme might require further analysis.
The project however observes the potential of this uniquely designed capacity development initiative to enable ‘quality’ in education. The project expert of SFA described that, the approach of C/CGDES on quality education in Niger is holistic in nature, and the C/CGDES are not considered to be responsible for ensuring ‘quality’ education from pedagogical perspectives (Interview with the SFA experts, 2013). In other words, the focus of their efforts are on establishing and maintaining the education system, through mobilising the community participation. It is believed that the consensus among and participation of the community build a foundation of sustainable education system. This can be particularly said with regards to the Quality-Focused Action Plan and, in reality, a particular mechanism of improved in administrative capacity linking to improved outcomes in schooling seem to be yet unknown. The initiative of ‘minimum package’ for quality education, on the contrary, seems to be more directly linked to effective education, as it deals with effective teaching and learning process.

Discussion

Presentation of findings followed the three research questions, and the discussions were developed according to the three components that consist education systems and are interlinked; ‘content’, ‘transmitters’, and ‘receivers’ (Clarkson, 2009). Here are summaries and some reflections according to the research questions.

1. What are the current understanding and debates about the ‘quality’ in education? How are they measured?

The information from the literature was organized according to the three perspectives identified from the literature; the concept of quality itself; ways of identifying and measuring quality; and factors and processes that affect the outcomes. The reviewed literature confer that there are various definitions of quality in education, and that the notion is closely linked with the context and what is expected from education in the society. The notion involves cognitive and non-cognitive abilities; the cognitive reflects knowledge and skills, including literacy and numeracy, at various levels. In the competency based approach, these skills may reflect expected roles of people in the society, such as income-earning activities. Non-cognitive abilities are considered to be largely based on the social and cultural
achieving quality of education in village schools - a case study from Niger -

backgrounds of society. Closely linked to the concept were the ways of measurements. Scholars argue over what can be measurable and comparable using standard measures, and context-specific variables are particularly hard to do so. Issues about measuring ‘quality’ include: evaluation of context specific factors may requires an expert; and applying standardized measure can have negative impacts on teaching and learning. At the same time, the dominant to measuring ‘quality’ is of ‘inputs-outputs’ approach, which is often used to demonstrate the effectiveness of an education system. They are manifested in the development of evaluation frameworks such as ‘value-added’ of schooling or ‘value-for-money’ framework, that are increasingly common to assess initiatives regardless of sectors.

Factors and processes that affect quality in education were analyzed from the three factors in the Didactic Triangle of education systems. The reviewed literature mainly focused on the ‘transmitters’ factors, which included skills and competencies of teachers and school environment. Other important factors includes the process of teaching and ‘receivers’ socioeconomic backgrounds, which affect learning and hence the outcomes of education.

2. What are current challenges and initiatives of improving the quality of primary education in Niger? How are they designed to achieve quality in primary education?

Current challenges in education in Niger are affected by number of contextual factors, such as unstable economies and social conditions. There are also problems of demands being much greater than supply of education opportunities and professionals. Physical resources such as infrastructure, teaching and learning materials, availability of schools, as well as food supply, place great constraints in schooling. Inadequate training, incentives and support for teachers also hinder effective teaching, and challenging environment for schooling also disincentives students for continuous education attainment. What the system currently struggles to achieve is mainly the basic cognitive skills of children at primary level education, such as numeracy and literacy, which underpin development of human resources for economic growth. For this, the country has made the effort of removing barriers to access, especially through infrastructure as well as decentralizing the school management and involving the
Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -

communities, as seen in the initiatives of school management committees.

The views from the literature this time reflected existing challenges concerning inputs-outputs balance and the factors of transmitters and recipients of the Didactic Triangle. However, as seen in the way the funds allocation – the elements may be considered as ‘content’, seem to affect the designing of initiatives focused on quality, further literature reviews on the relationships between the contents and transmitters in the political economy of development aid may help clarify the dynamics in this analytical framework.

3. What are the positions of donor agencies involved and how do they affect the project initiatives?

The case study collected the involvement of limited international agencies involved in School for All project by JICA. The World Bank mainly has taken the role of providing funds to enable Niger’s decentralization and improved infrastructure in education system. However, their provision of funds comes with the requirement that the recipient, the Nigerien Government, demonstrate the capacity to ensure the effective flow of funds to implement the school management committees. The World Bank also employs the set of indicator to observe the project outputs to determine ‘quality’. These positions are considered to have impacted the initiative by the Nigerien Government and JICA on ‘quality’ focused imitative, which involves stakeholder training to manage funds, keeping in mind that their plans aims at producing ‘outputs’. In the Didactic Triangle, the role of World Bank has been in the ‘content’ for the education project in the form of funds, but affect significantly the other stakeholders who are ‘transmitters’. JICA is considered to play the ‘transmitters’ role by developing strategies and providing training to strengthen those who carry out the initiative, such as those who manage funds received by the Government and the donor agency and those who continue to train stakeholders in their system. It may be the reflection of JICA’s approach to international aid, which often provide technical cooperation for the purpose of human resources development to support ownership of partner country’s stakeholders (JICA, 2013c: 12-14). UNICEF seems to focus on children as ‘receivers’ in the context, but it was not clear how their position impact other actors or vice versa. Different donor agencies hold their own focuses and
approaches to development project, which result in having different roles in the system. At the same time, with the increased tendency of donor agencies collaborate in accordance with partner country’s own development plans (Ibid.), having shared achievement goals through indicators will be unavoidable. Enhanced with the tendency of ‘inputs-outputs’ focus, the outcome-driven approach to projects may impact the project planning, evaluation and reporting process. As seen in the way the outcomes of Quality-Focused Action Plan is presented, an education project may result in favorable or unfavorable outcomes but the direct impact of the initiative is often difficult to determine, due to the nature of the sector. This means that careful attention needs to be paid in the way certain outcomes are measured and how they are presented. Given the awareness that the quality in education is ‘relative’ or highly context-based, collaboration and coordination among stakeholders in education, operating with different priorities and in different contexts, to build consensus on the quality outcomes in education may hold a challenge.

**Conclusion**

This study explored the discourse of quality in education, with reference to literature and a set of field study data gathered originally for another study. Although it helped highlight a number of issues in the context of development practices, it has a number of limitations in terms of designing methodologies, hence the quality of field data. The concept of quality in education, for example, may be explored further with in-depth and focused data, such as the worldviews of the community members, reflecting the unique social-cultural context in this study. A visit to more schools in different localities, interviews with other development agencies and review of cross-regional data could further enrich the outcomes this study.

Literature highlighted that the term ‘quality’ in education is context-based, relative and difficult to measure. From the case study, what determines the project approach seems to be often outcome-driven. For example, in the ‘minimum package’ initiative for quality, the strategies are determined by investigating particular areas of weaknesses in children’s numeracy skills in order to improve the test results. This might explain that the term ‘quality’ is often applied on the ground of inputs-outputs discussion. This can also be explained from the fact that what Niger currently focuses on is a minimum level.
of functional literacy and numeracy as the expected outcome of primary education, which falls under what can be assessed and compared using a standardised measure.

As applied in the literature review, quality may be determined in terms of multiple dimensions of education practices such as:

- Cognitive abilities (starting from minimum level of literacy and numeracy to breadth of knowledge and skills at the advanced level)
- Non-cognitive abilities (values and attitudes that reflect what is expected in the society and the culture)
- Measurable and non-measurable factors
- ‘Content’, which can be the funds, ideas, curriculum
- ‘Transmitters’, as what impacts people who carries out the initiative, teachers, the environment for teaching and learning, community members
- ‘Receivers’, as what incentivises learners, what determines learner capacities, such as their socioeconomic backgrounds, health and nutrition, parents, community members
- ‘Inputs’, which ensure that injected investments and plans are actually carried out
- ‘Outputs’, which includes proxies of achievements (such as enrolment) as well as actual achievements (both cognitive and non-cognitive abilities)

Although there are various factors that determine ‘quality’ education such as above, given the recent emphasis on the outcomes, stakeholders in development projects may in principle focus on measurable outcomes. This may limit the breadth of stakeholder attentions to quality education, in the same way that teachers may conduct rote teaching to prepare students for tests. A challenge for producing measurable outcomes also includes the time constraints to produce outcomes.

As explained earlier, COGES was changed to C/CGDES recently by increasing the project status within the Government with the intention of providing more support and stability. This involves a future shift of C/CGDES management to the central government rather than leaving them autonomous at the community level. JICA SFA team plans to establish a 5-year plans or 10-year plans to help Nigerien counterpart with the skills and the awareness of stakeholders for the sustained
development of C/CGDES. The potential challenge seems to be that, as the C/CGDES becomes formally managed at the central level, a community participation may become a mandate of the C/CGDES rather than voluntary, as designed so far. This may threaten the democratic principle of the scheme, which is the foundation of community participation.

A concern related to the quality in education is, with this shift of decision making dynamics, comparable performance criteria and measures could be placed to the community and negatively impact the voluntary and autonomous decision making of the community. This also mean that, since the ‘quality’ of education are to be determined based on priorities and needs to the society, the quality-focused education initiatives may be distorted by the priorities of the other. The inputs-outputs measuring practices based on differing priorities, which may occur in the form of tests or other evaluation practices, as the literature suggests, could negatively affect learning.

The discussion about the complex nature of the term ‘quality’ raises a number of concerns. A consideration may be over what cannot be easily measured and compared, which may be linked to context-specific values. With the increased tendency that agencies and entities with differing priorities and capacities working together, maintaining what is held dear to the individuals and demonstrating the value of them as ‘quality’ may become an increasingly challenging task.

References


Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -


Achieving Quality of Education in Village Schools
- A case study from Niger -


